The Cryosphere

Open Access

Discussions

EGU

TCD

Interactive
comment

Interactive comment on "Retention time of lakes in the Larsemann Hills oasis, East Antarctica" *by* Elena Shevnina et al.

Martin Truffer (Referee)

mtruffer2@alaska.edu

Received and published: 23 November 2020

This manuscript evaluates retention times for a series of lakes in Antarctica; it provides a set of novel and interesting data that is important for understanding the biogeochemistry of these lakes. The topic is appropriate for publication in The Cryosphere.

Before I recommend publication I recommend the following changes: 1) The manuscript needs to be very carefully checked for language and grammar. I made a large number of annotations in the attached, but many issues remain. 2) Results and Discussion should not be mixed into one section. Results should clearly follow from this work and this should be kept apart from Discussion and Implications (which can be more speculative). It is not good scientific practice to mix these. 3) The Methods

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

section would benefit from a table that shows which method was used for which lake. This is outlined in the text, but it becomes difficult to track, and a table would help a lot. 4) The numbers provided in the tables in 'Results' need to be provided with some amount of error estimates. 5) The Conclusions should contain some sort of statement of what can be learned from these results in terms of how these lakes function. Do these retention times come as a surprise? Do they change the way we need to think about these lakes?

Martin Truffer

Please also note the supplement to this comment:
https://tc.copernicus.org/preprints/tc-2020-205/tc-2020-205-RC4-supplement.pdf

---

Interactive comment on The Cryosphere Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/tc-2020-205, 2020.