



Brief Communication: The reliability of gas extraction techniques for analysing CH₄ and N₂O compositions in gas trapped in permafrost ice-wedges

Ji-Woong Yang^{1*}, Jinho Ahn¹, Go Iwahana², Sangyoung Han¹, Kyungmin Kim^{1**} and
 Alexander Fedorov^{3,4}

6 ¹School of Earth and Environmental Sciences, Seoul National University, Seoul, South Korea

- 7 ²International Arctic Research Center, University of Alaska, Fairbanks, USA
- 8 ³Melinkov Permafrost Institute, Russian Academy of Science, Yakutsk, Russia
- ⁹ ⁴North-Eastern Federal University, Yakutsk, Russia
- 10 *Now at: Laboratoire des Sciences du Climat et de l'Environnement, LSCE/IPSL, CEA-
- 11 CNRS-UVSQ, Université Paris-Saclay, Gif-sur-Yvette, France
- 12 **Now at: Division of Earth and Planetary Materials Science, Department of Earth Science,
- 13 Graduate School of Science, Tohoku University, Sendai, Japan
- 14
- 15 **Correspondence**: Jinho Ahn (jinhoahn@snu.ac.kr)

16

- 17 Abstract. Methane (CH_4) and nitrous oxide (N_2O) compositions in ground ice may provide information on their production mechanisms in permafrost. However, existing gas extraction 18 methods has not been well tested. We test conventional wet and dry gas extraction methods 19 20 using ice-wedges from Alaska and Siberia. We find that both methods extract gas from the easily extractable parts of the ice (e.g., gas bubbles), and yield similar results for CH₄ and N₂O 21 22 mixing ratios. We also find insignificant effects of microbial activity during wet extraction. 23 However, both techniques are unable to fully extract gas from the ice, presumably because gas molecules adsorbed onto or enclosed in soil aggregates are not easily extractable. Estimation 24 25 of gas production in subfreezing environment of permafrost should consider the incomplete 26 gas extraction. 27
- 28 1. Introduction

29

Permafrost soils preserve large amounts of soil carbon and nitrogen in a frozen state





30 (e.g., Hugelius et al., 2014; Salmon et al., 2018), removing this frozen carbon (C) and nitrogen 31 (N) from active global cycles. Therefore, future projections of permafrost stability are of great 32 interest, particularly because thawing permafrost may lead to decomposition and/or remineralization of the buried soil C and N and their abrupt emission into the atmosphere in 33 34 the form of greenhouse gases (GHGs) – carbon dioxide (CO₂), methane (CH₄), and nitrous 35 oxide (N₂O), which in turn trigger positive feedbacks (e.g., Salmon et al., 2018). In addition, the projected polar amplification (e.g., Masson-Delmotte et al., 2013) may strengthen these 36 37 positive feedbacks. However, the processes responsible for in-situ C and N remineralization 38 and GHG production in ground ice are poorly understood, despite the fact that ground ice 39 accounts for a substantial portion of the upper permafrost: up to approximately 40-90% by volume of ice-rich permafrost, or Yedoma (e.g., Kanevskiy et al., 2013; Jorgenson et al., 2015). 40 41 The gases trapped in ground ice allow unique insights into the origin of ground ice and 42 evidence for in-situ microbial aerobic respiration (e.g., Lacelle et al., 2011). Among others, the GHGs in ground ice may provide detailed information on in-situ biogeochemical processes 43 responsible for GHG production (e.g., Boereboom et al., 2013; Kim et al., 2019). However, 44 analytical methods remain poorly scrutinized. Boereboom et al. (2013) utilized the 45 conventional melting-refreezing method (wet extraction) used in polar ice core analyses. In this 46 47 technique, the ice samples were melted under a vacuum to liberate the enclosed gases, then refrozen to expel the dissolved gases present in the meltwater. Other studies conducted by 48 Russian scientists used an on-site melting method in which a large (1-3 kg) block of ground 49 50 ice sample was melted in a saturated sodium chloride (NaCl) solution, in order to minimize 51 microbial activity and gas dissolution (Cherbunina et al., 2018 and references therein). A recent 52 study instead used a dry extraction technique to prevent the microbial activity during wet extraction (Kim et al., 2019), which employed a needle-crusher in a vacuum to crush 53 approximately 10 g of ice sample without melting (Shin, 2014). 54





55 In this study, for the first time we test the reliability of both wet and dry extraction 56 methods for CH₄ and N₂O mixing ratios and contents (volume or moles of gas in a unit mass 57 at standard temperature and pressure conditions (STP)) using permafrost ground ice samples. Ice-wedge samples from Alaskan and Siberian permafrost were used because the ice-wedge is 58 59 one of the most abundant morphological features of massive ground ice, consisting of 60 approximately 5 to 50% by volume of the upper permafrost (Kanevskiy et al., 2013; Jorgenson et al., 2015). More specifically, this study aims to address the following scientific questions: 1) 61 Do wet and dry extraction methods yield different results? 2) Are the melting-refreezing results 62 63 affected by microbial activity during gas extraction? 3) How effectively does the wet/dry extraction extract gases from ice wedges? To address the first question, CH₄ and N₂O results 64 from dry and wet extractions were compared. For the second question, we applied the wet 65 66 extraction method to both biocide-treated and control samples. Finally, for the third question 67 we carried out tests with and without extended number of hitting ice with a needle system in a crushing chamber, as well as additional dry extraction from ice samples that had been degassed 68 69 by our wet extraction method.

70

71 2. Materials and Methods

72 2.1.Ice samples and sample preparation

The ice-wedge samples used in this study were collected from Churapcha, Cyuie (central Yakutia), and Zyryanka (north-eastern Yakutia) in Siberia, as well as from northern Alaska. The Churapcha site (61.97°N, 132.61°E) is located approximately 180 km east of Yakutsk. The Cyuie site (61.73°N, 130.42°E) is located approximately 30 km southeast of Yakutsk. The Cyuie samples were collected from two outcrops (CYB and CYC) (Kim et al., 2019). At each site, 30 cm long ice-wedge cores were drilled perpendicular to the outcrop surface.





80 Zyryanka is located in the southern boreal region of the Kolyma River, at the junction 81 of the Chersky and Yukaghir Ranges, in a region affected by thermokarst development 82 (Fedorov et al., 1991). Site A (Zy-A) is located on a tributary of the Kolyma River, approximately 22 km north of Zyryanka. Site B (Zy-B) is approximately 14 km west of the 83 84 start of the Kolyma tributary, which begins ~11 km north of Zyryanka. Site F (Zy-F) is located 85 approximately 4 km west of the tributary that leads to site B. The ground ice samples were collected from riverbank walls exposed by lateral erosion using a chainsaw. Most of the 86 outcrops that were sampled for ground ice were on the first terrace of the river. 87

88 For the Alaskan sampling locations, Bluff03 (69.40°N, 150.95°W) and Bluff06 (69.14°N, 150.61°W) are located in the Alaska North Slope region, approximately 120 and 150 89 km from the Arctic Ocean, or 100 and 70 km northwest of the Toolik Field Station (68.63°N, 90 149.59°W), respectively. Samples from Bluff03 were collected from the bluff walls that had 91 developed by gully formations on a gentle slope of the Yedoma using a chainsaw. Samples of 92 Bluff06 were collected from outcrops within eroded frozen peatland in a thaw lake basin. All 93 the ice-wedge samples used in this study were stored in a chest freezer at < -18°C before 94 analysis. 95

The ice-wedge ice is most different from polar ice cores, in that their gas mixing ratios are not homogeneous (e.g., Kim et al., 2019), which may hinder exact comparison with results from adjacent ice samples. We therefore randomly mixed sub-samples to reduce the effect of the heterogeneous gas composition distribution (random cube method hereafter). Approximately 100–200 g of an ice-wedge sample was cut into 25 to 50 cubes of 3–4 g each, and for each experiment, ~10 to 12 cubes were randomly chosen so that the total weight of the sub-sample was ~40 g.

103

104 **2.2.Gas extraction procedures**





105 Dry extraction (needle crusher)

106 For dry extraction, we used a needle-crusher system at the Seoul National University 107 (SNU, Seoul, South Korea) (Shin, 2014). In brief, 8~13 g of ice sample was crushed in a cold vacuum chamber (extraction chamber). The ice samples were usually hit five times by the 108 109 needle set. The temperature within the extraction chamber was maintained at -37°C by using a 110 cold ethanol-circulating chiller. The extracted gas was dried by passing it through a water vapor trap at -85°C and cryogenically trapping it in a stainless-steel tube (sample tube) at 111 approximately -257 °C using a helium closed-cycle refrigerator (He-CCR). Since the extraction 112 113 chamber cannot accommodate ~ 40 g of ice at once, the ~ 40 g of random cube sub-samples 114 were extracted using three sequential extractions and the gas liberated from each extraction 115 was trapped in a sample tube.

116 Following extraction, the sample tubes were detached from the He-CCR, warmed to room temperature (~20°C), and attached to a gas chromatograph (GC) equipped with an 117 electron capture detector (ECD) and a flame ionization detector (FID) to determine the mixing 118 119 ratios of CH₄ and N₂O. Details of the GC system are given in Ryu et al. (2018). The daily calibration curves were established using working standards of 15.6 ± 0.2 ppm CH₄, 10000 \pm 120 30 ppm CH₄, 2960 \pm 89 ppb N₂O, 29600 \pm 888 ppb N₂O, and a modern air sample from a 121 122 surface firn at Styx Glacier, Antarctica, which was calibrated as 1758.6 ± 0.6 ppb CH₄ and 123 324.7 ± 0.3 ppb N₂O by the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA).

124

125 Wet extraction (melt-refreeze)

For the control and HgCl₂-treated wet extraction experiments, a melting-refreezing wet extraction system at SNU was employed (Yang et al., 2017; Ryu et al., 2018). The gas extraction procedure is identical to the procedure described in Yang et al. (2017) and Ryu et al. (2018), except for the sample gas trapping procedure (see below). Ice-wedge sub-samples of





~40 g (composed of 10-12 ice cubes for each) were placed in a glass container welded to a 130 131 stainless-steel flange (sample flask), and the laboratory air inside the sample flasks was 132 evacuated for 40 min. The sample flasks were then submerged in a warm (\sim 50°C) tap water bath to melt the ice samples. After melting was complete, the meltwater was refrozen by 133 chilling the sample flasks with cold ethanol (below -70°C). The sample gas in the headspace 134 135 of each sample flask was then expanded to the volume-calibrated vacuum line to estimate the volume of extracted gas, and trapped in a stainless-steel sample tube by the He-CCR device. 136 In this study, we attached the He-CCR device to our wet extraction line and the gas samples in 137 138 the flasks were cryogenically trapped. The reasons for using He-CCR instead of direct expansion to a GC are twofold: 1) to better compare the dry and wet extraction methods by 139 applying the same trapping procedure, and 2) to maximize the amount of sample gas for GC 140 141 analysis, because the gas expansion from a large flask allows only a small fraction of gas to be 142 measured by the GC.

For biocide-treated tests, 1.84 mmol of mercuric chloride (HgCl₂) was applied per unit 143 144 kilogram of soil, following established procedures for soil sterilization (Fletcher and Kaufman, 1980). Taking the dry soil mass of the analysed samples (0.33 g) into account, we added 24 μ L 145 of saturated HgCl₂ solution (at 20°C) to the sample flasks. The flasks with HgCl₂ solution were 146 147 then frozen in a deep freezer at $< -45^{\circ}$ C to prevent the dissolution of ambient air into the solution during ice sample loading. After the wet extraction procedure was complete, the 148 extracted gas was trapped in a sample tube and the CH4 and N2O mixing ratios were determined 149 150 using the same GC-ECD-FID system as the dry-extracted gas. The resulting CH₄ and N₂O 151 mixing ratios have not been corrected for partial dissolution in ice melt in the flasks, because 152 CH_4 and N_2O trapped in refrozen ice are negligible compared to the ranges of the systematic 153 blanks (see Appendix).





155 2.3.Gas content

156 The analytical methods described previously are for determining the mixing ratios of 157 CH₄ and N₂O in the extracted gas. To convert these mixing ratios into moles of CH₄ and N₂O 158 per unit mass of ice-wedge sample (CH4 and N2O content, respectively, hereafter) requires data 159 regarding the amount of gas extracted. The gas content is a measure of gas volume enclosed in a unit mass of ice sample at STP (in mL kgice⁻¹). Thus, the CH₄ and N₂O contents can be 160 calculated using the gas content, the total mass of the random cube ice, and the gas mixing 161 ratio. The gas content in the control and HgCl2-treated wet extraction experiments was 162 163 calculated from the temperature and pressure of the extracted gas and the internal volume of 164 the vacuum line. The details of the extraction system and correction methods used for estimating gas content are described in Yang (2019). Similarly, the gas content of the dry 165 166 extraction samples was also inferred from the volume and pressure of gas inside the vacuum line once the sample tube was attached to the line for GC analysis. The uncertainties of the 167 calculated CH₄ and N₂O contents were calculated by using error propagation of the blanks and 168 169 gas content uncertainties (see Appendix for uncertainty estimation of the blank corrections and 170 gas contents).

171

172 2.4.Dry soil content

Dry soil content was measured using the leftover meltwater from the control-wet extraction tests. After the control-wet extractions were complete, the sample flasks were shaken well and the meltwater samples were each poured into a 50 mL conical tube. The meltwater and soils were separated by a centrifugal separator at 3000 rpm for 10 min. The separated wet soils were wind-dried in evaporating dishes at approximately 100°C for 24 hours. The weight of each individual evaporating dish was pre-measured before use. The dry soil content was calculated by subtracting the weight of the evaporating dish from the total weight of the dried





- 180 soil sample plus the evaporating dish.
- 181

182 3. Results and Discussion

183 **3.1.Comparison between wet and dry extraction methods**

The results from the wet and dry extractions were compared using 23 ice-wedge 184 samples (21 for N₂O) from Alaska and Siberia. In both the CH₄ and N₂O mixing ratio analyses, 185 we found that the wet and dry extraction results did not differ significantly (p > 0.1), regardless 186 of sampling site or soil content (Figure 1, a to d). We noted that the heterogeneous distribution 187 of gas mixing ratios may not have been completely smoothed out by our sub-sample selection, 188 although we randomly chose 8-12 ice cubes for each measurement. Some previous studies 189 190 have avoided using the wet extraction method because of potential reactivation of microbial CH₄ and/or N₂O production in ice melt (e.g., Cherbunina et al., 2018; Kim et al., 2019). 191 Assuming that activation of microbial metabolism is unlikely during dry extraction at a 192 193 temperature of -37° C in the extraction chamber for < 1 h, our findings may imply that wet extraction does not stimulate microbial reactivation to a measurable extent. 194







195

Figure 1. Comparison of CH_4 and N_2O mixing ratios and contents obtained by different extraction methods. Shown are scatter plots between wet- and dry (hit5) extraction results of CH_4 (a and b) and N_2O (c and d), and between control- and biocide-treated wet extraction results for CH_4 (e) and N_2O (f). Left panels (a, c, and e) and (f) present in mixing ratios of gas in bubbles, while right (b) and (d) panels in moles of gas in a unit mass of ice (gas content). The sampling locations are indicated by different symbols. The color of each data point indicates the dry soil weight in the subsamples used in control wet extraction. The 1-sigma uncertainties of the mixing ratios (a, c, e, and f) are denoted as blue error bars (see Appendix). The error bars are not visible where the error bars in (e) and (f) are identical to the original plots. The p-value of two-sided Students' t-test of each comparison is denoted at the top of each plot.





197 **3.2. Testing microbial alteration during wet extraction**

198 To test the microbial production of CH4 and N2O during wet extraction more accurately, 199 we conducted wet extraction experiments on samples treated with HgCl₂, a commonly used 200 effective biocide (e.g., Torres et al., 2005), and compared the results with those of untreated 201 (control) wet extractions. We prepared 12 additional ice-wedge samples using the random cube 202 method for these tests (see Materials and Methods section). We found no significant differences between the control and HgCl2-treated wet extraction results for both CH4 and N2O mixing 203 204 ratios (Figures 1e and 1f), indicating that the bias due to microbial activity during 205 approximately an hour of the melting-refreezing procedure is not significant. This is further 206 supported by tests on an additional 12 ice-wedge samples (using the random cube protocol) treated with 2-bromo-ethane-sulfonate (BES), a specific methanogenesis inhibitor (e.g., Nollet 207 208 et al., 1997) (Figure A3). Similar to the HgCl₂-treated experiments, 25 µL of a saturated BES 209 solution was added to each sample flask. These additional tests were carried out only for CH₄. 210 The two-sided t-test for the CH₄ data indicates an insignificant difference between the two 211 results (p > 0.9). Data from individual sampling sites also do not show significant differences (p > 0.9) for the Alaskan samples and p > 0.5 for the central Yakutian samples). 212

According to microbial sequencing studies that have shown the presence of viable microbes in permafrost and ground ice (e.g., Katayama et al., 2007), it is likely that culturable microbes exist in the ice-wedge samples used in this study. However, considering that at least 14 days and up to 3 months of culturing was required to identify microbe colonies extracted from ground ice (Katayama et al., 2007; Lacelle et al., 2011), our melt-refreeze time of an hour was insufficient for microbial activity to resume and produce CH₄ and N₂O.

219

220 3.3.Dry extraction efficiency and gas mixing ratios

221 One limitation of our needle crushing dry-extraction technique is the inability to





222 completely extract gas from ice samples, because small ice particles and/or flakes placed in the 223 space between the needles are not fully crushed. The gas extraction efficiency of the SNU 224 needle crusher system has been reported as ~80–90% for polar ice core ice samples (Shin, 225 2014). However, the gas extraction efficiency has not been tested for ice-wedge samples. 226 Depending on the extraction efficiency, the needle crushing method could underestimate the 227 gas contents if the gas is not completely extracted. Another possible bias in the gas mixing ratios arises if the CH4 and N2O compositions are different between the crushed and uncrushed 228 229 portions of the ice-wedge samples.

230 To estimate the biases arising from incomplete gas extraction, we designed a series of 231 tests to identify the differences of the CH₄ and N₂O mixing ratios and contents between the crushed and uncrushed sample portions. Each ice-wedge sample that was randomly collected 232 233 was first crushed by the regular dry extraction procedure (by hitting it five times with the needle 234 system, 'hit5'), and the gas liberated from the sample was trapped in a sample tube. Then we performed an additional 100 hits on the leftover ice ('hit100'), monitored the amount of 235 236 additional gas liberated, and trapped the additional gas in a separate sample tube. Comparisons between the hit5 and hit100 results are summarized in Table 1. 237

Here we regard the ratio of gas content of hit100 to that of hit5 (hit100/hit5 ratio 238 239 hereafter) as a measure of the gas extraction efficiency of the needle crusher system. The results 240 demonstrate an average hit100/hit5 ratio of gas content of 0.40 ± 0.07 for the Zyryanka samples, 0.24 ± 0.07 for the Bluff samples, and 0.14 ± 0.11 for the Cyuie samples (Table 1). Despite the 241 242 fact that the number of samples was limited, the ice-wedge samples from the different sites 243 show distinct hit100/hit5 ratios of the amount of extracted gas. However, we observed that the 244 leftover ice from the Bluff and Zyryanka samples were not well-crushed, even after 100 hits with the needle crusher. This was especially true if the ice sub-samples contained soil 245 aggregates: the frozen soil aggregates were barely crushed. In contrast, the Cyuie samples were 246





247 relatively well-crushed, and the leftover samples were apparently finer-sized ice flakes. We 248 also observed that the hit100/hit5 ratios of gas content are highly variable within samples from 249 a particular site, implying that the extraction efficiency of the needle crusher not only depends on site characteristics, but also on the individual ice sample hardness. When compared with the 250 251 dry soil content measured from the sub-samples used for wet extraction, no relationship was 252 observed between the dry soil content and the extraction efficiency. In addition, in the case of 253 samples uncrushed by the hit100 test, it is difficult to estimate the extraction efficiency using 254 the hit100/hit5 ratio of gas content, as the hit100 tests liberated only a marginal portion of gas 255 from these samples. This is because the large-sized uncrushed soil aggregates or particles may 256 have prohibited the needle crusher from crushing the small-sized ice flakes or grains. The needles move up and down together, as they are fixed to a pneumatic linear motion feedthrough 257 258 device, thus if there is a sizable soil clod that cannot be crushed, it blocks the needle crusher 259 from moving further down. Therefore, we do not recommend using a needle crusher system to measure gas contents in ice-wedge samples. 260

261 The hardness of the ice samples may also affect the gas mixing ratio analysis in the hit5 and hit100 procedures. The hit100/hit5 ratio of CH4 mixing ratio of Bluff and Zyryanka 262 263 samples are less than 1 in four out of six samples, yielding an average of 0.9 ± 0.5 . However, 264 all five samples from the Cyuie ice-wedges have ratios greater than 1, with an average of 4.7 265 \pm 2.6 (Table 1). The higher hit100/hit5 ratio of CH₄ mixing ratios of Cyuie samples indicates that the gases extracted via the hit100 procedure have higher CH₄ mixing ratios than the gases 266 267 extracted via the hit5 procedure. Considering these results with those discussed previously, we 268 speculate that there are three ways gas can be trapped in ice-wedge ice: enclosed in bubbles, 269 adsorbed on soil particles, and entrapped in soil aggregates. The better-crushed leftover ice flakes in the Cyuie samples may have allowed most of the gas in bubbles and part of the CH4 270 271 molecules adsorbed on soil particles and/or trapped in microsites within soil aggregates to be





272 liberated. Thus, the hit5 CH₄ mixing ratios of the Cyuie samples may more reflect the gas 273 mixing ratios in bubbles, while the hit100 results reflect more of the contribution from gas 274 adsorbed on soil and trapped within soil aggregates than the hit5 results because soil-rich ice has greater hardness than the soil-poor ice. If this is the case for the Cyuie samples, we can 275 276 infer that CH₄ is more concentrated in soil particles and in microsites within soil aggregates, 277 compared to in bubbles in the ice. This is partly supported by evidence that ice-wedge layers exhibit relatively trace amounts of CH₄ compared to the surrounding permafrost soil layers 278 279 (Rivkina et al., 2007); however, this needs to be further evaluated by detailed microbial and 280 chemical analyses. In the meanwhile, in the Bluff and Zyryanka samples, the hit5 results reflect 281 the mixing ratios of the gases from the crushed portions, regardless of their origin: bubbles, particle adsorption, or microsites in aggregates. Given that some of the Bluff and Zyryanka ice-282 283 wedge samples were not fully crushed by the hit100 tests, it may require additional hits or 284 another extraction technique. Unlike CH₄, the N₂O mixing ratios from the hit100 extractions 285 are higher than the hit5 in ten out of eleven samples, regardless of the sampling site. The 286 hit100/hit5 ratios of N₂O mixing ratios of the Bluff and Zyryanka samples $(1.9 \pm 0.8 \text{ on average})$ are not significantly different (p = 0.32) from those of the Cyuie samples (2.9 ± 1.8 on average). 287 This can probably be explained by the fact that the N₂O mixing ratio is not necessarily higher 288 289 in soil-rich ice because N₂O is an intermediate product in relatively oxic conditions, while CH₄ 290 is produced strictly in anoxic conditions.

One may expect that a different crushing technique might be more suitable for icewedge samples. However, none of the existing dry extraction techniques - centrifugal ice microtome (Bereiter et al., 2013), mechanical grater (Etheridge et al., 1988), or ball-mill crusher (Schaefer et al., 2011) is more advantageous for ice-wedge analysis compared to the needle crusher system used in this study. The hard portion of ice wedges (e.g., frozen soil aggregates, large soil particles) could easily damage the metal blades of the centrifugal ice





- 297 microtome and mechanical grater devices, or block the space within the ball-mill chamber,
- limiting the movement of the milling balls.
- 299 It is worth noting that friction between stainless steels could produce CH₄ with carbon from the damaged stainless-steel surface and hydrogen gas (Higaki et al., 2006). If needle 300 301 crushing causes contamination in this way, the dry extraction results should be affected by the 302 number of hits. To check the impact of the needle crushing procedure on ice-wedge CH4 and N₂O measurements, we carried out blank tests by changing the numbers of hits from 5 to 100. 303 304 The results of these tests show no systematic offset among the experiments with different 305 numbers of hits (Figure A2), which implies that the crushing procedure does not affect the dry 306 extraction results for CH4 and N2O. Even though a small of contamination does exist, its effects have already been subtracted via blank correction and taken into account in the overall error 307 estimation (see Appendix). Therefore, we consider that our findings are not artefacts of metal 308 friction during crushing. 309

To summarize, from the hit5 and hit100 comparison tests, we found that 1) the needle crusher method is not able to fully crush the ice-wedge ice samples and thus is unsuitable for measuring gas contents in a unit mass of ice, and that 2) weak crushing (e.g., a small number of hits by the needle crusher system) may better reflect gas mixing ratios of the soft parts of the samples (such as air bubbles) than strong crushing (e.g., a greater number of hits).





is the ratio in extracted gas content or gas mixing ratio of 'hit100' to 'hit5' cases. Also shown are gas content results from both experiments, where the hit100 Fable 1. Results of dry extraction tests with 5- and additional 100 times hitting ice-wedge samples, denoted as 'hit5' and 'hit100', respectively. 'hit100/hit5'

values are given both in the unit of ml kg⁻¹ at STP conditions and µmol/kg (in parenthesis). It should be noted that the 'hit100' gas content results indicate the

additional amount of gas extracted after 'hit5' crushing and evacuation.

315 316 317 317 318







319 **3.4.Residual gas mixing ratios and contents after wet extraction**

320 To examine how well the gas is extracted by wet extraction, we applied the dry 321 extraction method to refrozen ice-wedge samples after wet extraction. We first prepared 322 degassed ice-wedge samples that had undergone repetitive wet extractions (wet-degassed ice 323 hereafter). Once the wet extraction experiments were completed, we repeated two cycles of 324 melting-refreezing and evacuation procedures to degas the ice melt. After degassing by a total of three cycles of wet extraction and evacuation, the outermost surfaces (~2 mm) of the wet-325 degassed ice were trimmed away in the walk-in freezer at SNU on the morning of experiments. 326 327 The wet-degassed ice was then inserted into the needle crusher and the crusher chamber was 328 evacuated. A specific amount of standard air was injected. Then, the wet-degassed ice samples were hit 20 or 60 times by the needle crusher. The amount of gas and gas mixing ratio of the 329 330 additionally extracted gas from the wet-degassed ice are shown in Figure 2 and Table A1.

The tests using the wet-degassed ice show an additional gas extraction of ~ 12 to 20 ml kg_{ice}⁻¹, which is ~ 43 to 88% of the amount of gas extracted during the initial wet extraction. The additionally extracted gas from the dry extraction is referred to as residual gas hereafter. This is remarkably in contrast to the less than 1% residual fraction of the SNU wet extraction system for ice from polar ice sheets. If such a considerable amount of gas is left intact by repeated wet extractions, the composition of the additional gas is important to understand how much the conventional wet extraction results are biased.

Figure 2 and Table A1 show the mixing ratios and contents of CH_4 and N_2O in the residual gas. The mixing ratios of the residual gas were estimated using mass balance calculations with observed mixing ratios and the amounts of the injected standard and extracted residual gas. The CH_4 mixing ratios of the residual gas range from 10.37 to 23.78 ppm, which is similar to the range of the wet extracted gas. This evidence indicates that CH_4 in ice-wedges cannot be fully extracted by a melting-refreezing procedure. We suspect two possible reasons





for this: (1) During wet extraction, the ice-wedge samples melted and the soil particles settled 344 345 at the bottom of the sample flask without any physical impact to the soil particles, causing the 346 adsorbed CH₄ molecules on the soil particles to remain adsorbed. (2) During refreezing, the 347 soils accumulated at the bottom of the flasks are crumpled around the centre of the refrozen 348 ice, because the sample flasks are chilled from outside, which facilitated gas entrapment within 349 the frozen soil aggregate. In contrast, the N₂O mixing ratios of the residual gas exhibit very low values compared to those from the initial wet extraction (Figure 2 and Table A1). These 350 351 results imply that most of the N₂O in ice wedges is extracted by three melting-refreezing cycles, 352 such that only a small amount of N₂O is left adsorbed or entrapped in ice-wedge soils.

353 In this section, we found that a certain amount of gas remained in ice wedges, even after 354 three cycles of wet extraction, which is extractable instead by needle crushing. This implies 355 that, unlike polar ice cores, wet extraction of ice-wedges does not guarantee near-complete gas 356 extraction, and therefore, precise measurements of the gas content of ice wedges are difficult to obtain. The difficulty in measuring gas content imposes a large uncertainty in estimating 357 358 CH_4 and N_2O contents. Furthermore, we found that the residual gas has a similar order CH_4 mixing ratio as the gas extracted by initial melting-refreezing, indicating that a comparable 359 amount of CH₄ still remains unextracted in ice-wedges. Hence, a novel extraction method is 360 required to produce reliable gas content and gas mixing ratios in ice wedges. In contrast, our 361 results show that the N₂O content of the residual gas is at trace levels, which may suggest that 362 most of the N₂O in ice-wedges is extractable during initial melting-refreezing. Therefore, wet 363 364 extraction could be applicable for estimating the N₂O content of ice wedges. However, given 365 that the above evidence resulted from three consecutive cycles of melting-refreezing and 366 evacuation, it is unclear how many melting-refreezing cycles are required to extract most of the N₂O from ice wedges. Our findings imply that previous estimates of CH₄ budget in ground 367 ice based on wet extraction principle (e.g., Boereboom et al., 2013; Cherbunina et al., 2018) 368





- 369 might have been underestimated, and that the CH₄ production within subfreezing permafrost
- 370 environment could be larger than previously estimated. Future study should be devoted to a
- are novel extraction method which is able to extract gas molecules from ice effectively.



Figure 2. Comparison of wet-extracted gas and residual gas for CH₄ and N₂O mixing ratios (a and b) and contents (c and d). The residual gas was extracted from the dry extraction method using the wet-degassed ice samples. The light green bars show the results of initial wet extraction, and the blue and red bars indicate the dry extraction of wet-degassed ice with 20- and 60-times hitting, respectively.

372

373 4. Conclusions

In this study we carried out comparisons between wet and dry extractions, between untreated and biocide-treated wet extractions, and gas extraction from the easily to extract and difficult to extract parts of ice-wedge ice to better understand the characteristics of each extraction method, in order to adequately analyse CH₄ and N₂O mixing ratios and gas contents from permafrost ice wedges. Based on these comparisons, our major findings are summarized as follows:





| 380 | 1) | Existing wet and dry extraction methods allow gas extraction from the soft parts of |
|-----|----|---|
| 381 | | ice (e.g., ice bubbles) and show insignificant differences in CH_4 and $\mathrm{N}_2\mathrm{O}$ mixing |
| 382 | | ratios. |
| 383 | 2) | Wet extraction results are unlikely to be affected by microbial production of CH_4 |
| 384 | | and N ₂ O during the melting-refreeze procedure. |
| 385 | 3) | Both dry and wet extraction methods are not able to fully extract gas from ice wedge |
| 386 | | samples, presumably due to gas adsorbed on soil particles or enclosed within soil |
| 387 | | aggregates, which may have different gas mixing ratios compared to the gas in |
| 388 | | bubbles. Further research is required to develop a proper method to quantify and |
| 389 | | extract adsorbed and enclosed gases. In the meantime, we propose that both existing |
| 390 | | techniques may be suitable for gas mixing ratio measurements for bubbles in |
| 391 | | relatively soft ice wedges. Exceptionally, the N_2O content in ice wedges may be |
| 392 | | measured by using repeated wet extractions, but this is not the case for determining |
| 393 | | the N ₂ O mixing ratio. |
| 394 | 4) | Our results indicate that previous estimates of ground ice CH_4 and $\mathrm{N}_2\mathrm{O}$ budget |
| 395 | | might be underestimated, implying that the greenhouse gas production in |
| 396 | | subfreezing environment of permafrost is larger than our current understanding. |

397 5) Our finding indicates that the saturated NaCl solution is unnecessary to prevent
398 microbial activity during melting, as employed by, e.g., Cherbunina et al. (2018).
399 However, it remains as an open question how effectively the adsorbed gas
400 molecules can be extracted by the method.

401





403 Appendix. Systematic blank correction and uncertainty estimation

Since the SNU dry extraction systems, including the sample tubes, were originally designed for CO₂ measurements from polar ice cores, these systems have not been tested for CH₄ and N₂O analysis. We therefore carried out a series of tests to estimate the systematic blank, which is defined here as blanks.

408 The systematic blanks were tested with bubble-free ice (BFI) and standard air in a cylinder calibrated by NOAA. The BFIs were prepared as described in Yang et al. (2017). A 409 major difference is that the BFI block was cut into small BFI pieces of 3-4 g, to mimic the 410 411 random cube sampling protocol (see Materials and Methods section in the main text). The systematic blanks for the dry extraction method were tested as follows. A total of ~45 g of BFI 412 413 cubes was placed into the crushing chamber, sealed with a copper gasket, and evacuated until 414 the gas pressure inside the chamber dropped lower than ~60 mTorr, because of the vapor 415 pressure formed by sublimation of the BFI. After evacuation was completed, standard gas was injected into the crushing chamber. The amount of standard injected was controlled by a 416 417 volume calibrated vacuum line in the dry extraction system. Then the BFI samples were hit with the needle system 5 to 100 times, and the gases in the chamber were passed through a 418 water trap and cryogenically pumped into the sample tubes, using the He-CCR. The number of 419 420 hits did not significantly affect the systematic blank (Figure A2) and the regression curve for blank correction was fitted to the entire set of data points (red dashed curve in Figure A1). 421

For the wet extraction, a total of ~45 g of BFI cubes was placed into each sample flask. The flasks were connected to the wet extraction line and sealed with a copper gasket, then evacuated. Once a vacuum was established, a known amount of standard gas was injected into each flask and the flasks were submerged into a warm water bath for ~40 min to melt completely. The flasks were then submerged into the cold ethanol bath, which was chilled to -80°C, to refreeze. For the HgCl₂ and Sodium 2-bromo-ethane-sulfonate (BES) treated





experiments, we first prepared the saturated solutions of HgCl₂ and BES at room temperature (20°C) and added 24 μ L of HgCl₂ or 20 μ L of BES solution into the empty flasks in a fume hood. Then we placed the flasks in a deep freezer, maintained at -45°C for 20 min, to freeze the solutions before the BFI pieces were placed.

The results of the blank experiments are shown in Figure A1. The systematic blanks appear to be inversely correlated with the gas pressure in the sample tube. The systematic blank test results were fitted using exponential regression curves (dashed lines in Figure A1), and these regression curves were then used for systematic blank correction in our ice-wedge sample analyses.

- To calculate uncertainties of the blank corrections, the blank test data were fitted with exponential regression curves (Figure A1). The root-mean-square-deviations (RMSD) of the data from the regression curves are taken as the uncertainties of blank corrections (Figure 1). Since the ice-wedge data used in this study showed the pressure in GC sample loop of about 8 ~ 50 torr, the RMSD were estimated from the blank test data within this pressure range. The uncertainty of the gas content measurement is calculated by error propagation from those of pressure, line volume, and mass of ice samples.
- 444







445

Figure A1. Systematic blank of the needle crushing (dry extraction) and melting-refreezing (wet extraction) methods for (a) CH_4 and (b) N_2O measurements in control and biocide ($HgCl_2$) treated experiments. Also plotted are the CH_4 blanks of BES-treated wet extractions. The dashed lines represent exponential regression curve fittings. Note that all data are plotted against the amount of gas trapped in the sample tube, presented here as the pressure in the GC sample loop when the sample gas is expanded. The grey shaded areas indicate the range of ice-wedge samples used in this study (see main text). The big-delta (Δ) notion in the y-axes indicate the offset from the values of the standard used.



Figure A2. Influence of different number of hitting on the systematic blank of the needle crushing (dry extraction) system for (a) CH_4 and (b) N_2O measurements. Note that all data are plotted against the amount of gas trapped in the sample tube, presented here as the pressure in the GC sample loop when the sample gas is expanded (see main text). The big-delta (Δ) notion in the y-axes indicate the offset from the values of the standard used.

446

447







Figure A3. Comparison between control- and BES-treated wet extraction results for CH₄. The sampling area is indicated by different symbols. The color of each data point indicates the dry soil weight in the subsamples used in control wet extraction. The grey dashed lines are 1:1 reference line.

449



| Table A1. Corresidual gas w | mparison of r as extracted t | esults fro | m extracted le crusher (se | gas from the | e convention 4 for details | al wet extra of the meht | totion metho ods) | d and the re | sidual gas ir | n ice after 3. | -times wet e | xtraction. Th | Je |
|----------------------------------|---------------------------------|------------|-------------------------------|------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------|------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|----|
| · | | : | | ń | Vet extraction | _ | | | | Residual gas | | | |
| Site location | Sample | soil | gas content | CH ₄ mixing ratio | N ₂ O mixing ratio | CH ₄ content | N ₂ O content | gas content | CH ₄ mixing ratio | N ₂ O mixing ratio | CH ₄ content | N ₂ O content | |
| | | wt. % | ml/kg | mqq | uudd | nmol/kg | nmol/kg | ml/kg | mqq | mqq | nmol/kg | nmol/kg | |
| Churapcha, central Yakutia | C-10 | 0.524 | 37.9 | 4.9 | 61.13 | 8.3 | 103 | 16.6 | 23.8 | 0.437 | 17.6 | 0.324 | |
| Churapcha, central Yakutia | C-30 | 1.03 | 41.7 | 4.1 | 22.28 | 7.7 | 41.5 | 18.4 | 23 | 0.50 | 19 | 0.41 | |
| Cyuie, central Yakutia | CYC-03-C | 1.09 | 27.2 | 30.5 | 0.52 | 37.1 | 0.63 | 17.9 | 12.5 | 0.48 | 10.0 | 0.39 | |
| Churapcha, central Yakutia | C-04 | 1.38 | 46.0 | 6.9 | 43.46 | 14 | 89.2 | 14.7 | 17 | 0.17 | 11 | 0.11 | |
| Cyuie, central Yakutia | CYC-02-B | 1.12 | 32.5 | 30.3 | 8.34 | 44.0 | 12.1 | 11.0 | 23 | 0.11 | 11 | 0.053 | |
| Churapcha, central Yakutia | C-12 | 0.370 | 38.0 | 2.8 | 60.47 | 4.8 | 103 | 15.9 | 10 | 0.34 | 7.3 | 0.24 | |





The Cryosphere Discussions

EGU

451 452





| 455 | Data | availal | oility |
|-----|------|---------|--------|
| 455 | Data | avanai | Jiiity |

456 The data will be uploaded on the public data repository of Pangaea after publication.

457

458 Author contributions

- 459 JWY and JA conceived the research and designed the experiments. GI, JA, KK, and AF drilled the
- 460 ice-wedge ice samples from Alaska and Siberia. JWY, JA, SH, and KK conducted the laboratory
- 461 experiments. JWY and JA led the manuscript preparation with inputs from all other co-authors.

462

463 Competing interests

- 464 The authors declare no conflict interest.
- 465

466 Acknowledgements

- 467 The authors greatly acknowledge those who contributed to collect ice-wedge ice samples. We
- thank Gwangjin Lim and Jaeyoung Park for their help in sample preparations and gas extraction
- 469 experiments, and Min Sub Sim for kind advice on inhibition experiment for methanogen.

470

471 Financial support

- 472 This project was supported by the Basic Science Research Program through the National Research
- 473 Foundation of Korea (NRF) (NRF-2018R1A2B3003256) and the NASA ABoVE (Arctic Boreal
- and Vulnerability Experiment; grant no. NNX17AC57A).





475 **References**

- Bereiter, B., Stocker, T. F., and Fischer, H.: A centrifugal ice microtome for measurements of
 atmospheric CO₂ on air trapped in polar ice cores, Atmos. Meas. Tech., 6, 251-262,
 <u>http://doi.org/10.5194/amt-6-251-2013</u>, 2013.
- Boereboom, T., Samyn, D., Meyer, H., and Tison, J. -L.: Stable isotope and gas properties of two
 climatically contrasting (Pleistocene and Holocene) ice wedges from Cape Mamontov
 Klyk, Laptev Sea, northern Siberia, The Cryosphere, 7, 31-46, <u>http://doi.org/10.5194/tc-7-</u>
 31-2013, 2013.
- Cherbunina, M. Y., Shmelev, D. G., Brouchkov, A. V., Kazancev, V. S., and Argunov, R. N.:
 Patterns of spatial methane distribution in the upper layers of the permafrost in central
 Yakutia, Mosc. Univ. Geol. Bull., 73, 100-108, 2018.
- Fedorov, A. N., Botulu, T. A., Vasiliev, I. S., Varlamov, S. P., Gribanova, S. P., Dorofeev, I. V.:
 Permafrost-landscape map of the Yakut ASSR, Gosgeodezia, Moscow, Russia, Map, 1991
 (In Russian).
- Higaki, S., Oya, Y., and Makide, Y.: Emission of methane from stainless steel surface investigated
 by using tritium as a radioactive tracer, Chem. Lett., 35, 292-293,
 https://doi.org/10.1246/cl.2006.292, 2006.
- Hugelius, G., Strauss, J., Zubrzycki, S., Harden, J. W., Schuur, E. A. G., Ping, C. -L., Schirrmeister,
 L., Grosse, G., Michaelson, G. J., Koven, C. D., O'Donnell, J. A., Elberling, B., Mishra,
 U., Camill, P., Yu, Z., Palmtag, J., and Kuhry, P.: Estimated stocks of circumpolar
 permafrost carbon with quantified uncertainty ranges and identified data gaps,
 Biogeosciences, 11, 6573-6593, https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-11-6573-2014, 2014.
- Jorgenson, M. T., Kanevskiy, M., Shur Y, Moskalenko, N., Brown, D. R. N., Wickland, K., Striegl,
 R., and Koch, J.: Role of ground ice dynamics and ecological feedbacks in recent ice wedge
 degradation and stabilization, J. Geophys. Res., 120, 2280-2297,
 https://doi.org/10.1002/2015JF003602, 2015.
- Kanevskiy, M., Shur, Y., Jorgenson, M. T., Ping, C. -L., Michaelson, G. J., Fortier, D., Stephani, 501 502 E., Dillon, M., and Tumskoy, V.: Ground ice in the upper permafrost of the Beaufort Sea 503 coast of Alaska, Cold Reg. Sci. Technol., 85, 56-70, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.coldregions.2012.08.002, 2013. 504





| 505 | Katayama, T., Tanaka, M., Moriizumi, J., Nakamura, T., Brouchkov, A., Douglas, T. A., Fukuda, |
|-----|---|
| 506 | M., Tomita, F., and Asano, K.: Phylogenetic analysis of bacteria preserved in a permafrost |
| 507 | ice wedge for 25,000 years, Appl. Environ. Microbiol., 73, 2360-2363, |
| 508 | https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.01715-06, 2007. |
| 509 | Kim, K., Yang, JW., Yoon, H., Byun, E., Fedorov, A., Ryu, Y., and Ahn, J.: Greenhouse gas |
| 510 | formation in ice wedges at Cyuie, central Yakutia, Permafrost Periglac. Process., 30, 48- |
| 511 | 57, <u>http://doi.org/10.1002/ppp.1994</u> , 2019. |
| 512 | Lacelle, D., Radtke, K., Clark, I. D., Fisher, D., Lauriol, B., Utting, N., and Whyte, L. G.: |
| 513 | Geomicrobiology and occluded O2-CO2-Ar gas analyses provide evidence of microbial |
| 514 | respiration in ancient terrestrial ground ice, Earth Planet. Sci. Lett., 306, 46-54, |
| 515 | https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2011.03.023, 2011. |
| 516 | Masson-Delmotte, V., Schulz, M., Abe-Ouchi, A., Beer, J., Ganopolski, A., Rouco, J. F. G., Jansen, |
| 517 | E., Lambeck, K., Luterbacher, J., Naish, T., Osborn, T., Otto-Bliesner, B., Quinn, T., |
| 518 | Ramesh, R., Rojas, M., Shao, X., and Timmerman, A.: Information from paleoclimatic |
| 519 | archives, Climate change 2013: The Physical science basis, Contribution of working group |
| 520 | I to the fifth assessment report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, 383- |
| 521 | 464, https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9781107415324.013, 2013. |
| 522 | Nollet, L., Demeyer, D., and Verstraete, W.: Effect of 2-bromoethanesulfonic acid and |
| 523 | Peptostreptococcus products ATCC 35244 addition on stimulation of reductive |
| 524 | acetogenesis in the ruminal ecosystem by selective inhibition of methanogenesis, Appl. |
| 525 | Environ. Microbiol., 63, 194-200, 1997. |
| 526 | Rivkina, E., Shcherbakova, V., Laurinavichius, K., Petrovskaya, L., Krivushin, K., Kraev, G., |
| 527 | Pecheritsina, S., and Gilichinsky, D.: Biogeochemistry of methane and methanogenic |
| 528 | archaea in permafrost, FEMS Microbiol. Ecol., 61, 1-15, https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1574- |
| 529 | <u>6941.2007.00315.x</u> , 2007. |
| 530 | Ryu, Y., Ahn, J., and Yang, JW.: High-precision measurement of N ₂ O concentration in ice cores, |
| 531 | Environ. Sci. Technol., 52, 731-738, https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.7b05250, 2018. |
| 532 | Salmon, V. G., Schadel, C., Bracho, R., Pegoraro, E., Celis, G., Mauritz, M., Mack, M. C., and |
| 533 | Schuur, E. A. G.: Adding depth to our understanding of nitrogen dynamics in permafrost |
| 534 | soils, J. Geophys. Res., 123, 2497-2512, https://doi.org/10.1029/2018JG004518, 2018. |
| 535 | Schaefer, H., Lourantou, A., Chappellaz, J., Luthi, D., Bereiter, B., and Barnola, JM.: On the |





| 536 | stability of parti | ally clat | hrated ice | for analysis | s of cond | centration | and $\delta^{13}C$ | of palaeo- |
|-----|---------------------------|-------------------|---------------|------------------------|-------------------|-------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| 537 | atmospheric | CO ₂ , | Earth | Planet. | Sci. | Lett., | 307, | 334-340, |
| 538 | https://doi.org/10 | .1016/j.e | ps1.2011.0 | <u>5.007</u> , 2011. | | | | |
| 539 | Shin, J.: Atmospheric CO | D_2 variat | ions on mil | lennial time | scales du | ring the ea | rly Holoc | ene, Master |
| 540 | thesis, School of | Earth a | nd Enviro | nmental Scie | ences, Se | oul Nation | nal Univer | rsity, South |
| 541 | Korea, 58 pp., 20 | 14. | | | | | | |
| 542 | Torres, M. E., Mix, A. C. | , and Ru | gh, W. D.: | Precise $\delta^{13}C$ | analysis | of dissolve | d inorgani | ic carbon in |
| 543 | natural waters | using a | utomated | headspace | sampling | g and co | ntinuous- | flow mass |
| 544 | spectrometry, Lin | nnol. Oc | eanogr.: M | ethods, 3, 34 | 9-360, 20 | 005. | | |
| 545 | Yang, JW., Ahn, J., Bro | ook, E. J | ., and Ryu, | Y.: Atmosph | eric metl | nane contro | ol mechani | isms during |
| 546 | the early Holocer | ne, Clim | . Past, 13, | 1227-1242, 1 | <u>nttps://do</u> | i.org/10.51 | 94/cp-13- | <u>1227-2017</u> , |
| 547 | 2017. | | | | | | | |
| 548 | Yang, JW.: Paleoclimat | te recons | tructions fr | om greenhou | ise gas ai | nd borehole | e temperat | ure of polar |
| 549 | ice cores, and stud | dy on the | e origin of g | reenhouse g | as in perr | nafrost ice | wedges, P | h.D. thesis, |
| 550 | School of Earth a | and Envi | ronmental | Sciences, Se | oul Nati | onal Unive | ersity, Seo | ul, 188 pp., |
| 551 | 2019. | | | | | | | |
| 552 | | | | | | | | |