

Dr. Frank Pattyn, Editor, The Cryosphere

Dear Frank:

The version of tc-2017-6 submitted here addresses concerns you expressed to me on 18 May 2017. Following your instructions, I have removed all derivations and related material that do not directly address Van der Veen (2016). The abstract and text are both shortened and more focused. In particular I paid attention to your point that his approach and mine are similar but not identical, so each has to be assessed on its own terms. An attempt to somehow blend the two approaches leads to confusion. I agree. Thank you for your own insights.

Much appreciated,

Terry Hughes

Fort Pierre, South Dakota, USA, 20 June 2017