## **Reviewer #2**

We are very grateful to reviewer#2 for his/her detailed comments and very useful suggestions. The manuscript has been substantially modified and reformatted based on these comments/suggestions. Below, we give a point-by-point response to the comments and suggestions of the reviewer, in the order of (1) comments from Referees, (2) author's response, and (3) author's changes in manuscript. Reviewer comments are in black, and the responses are in blue.

# (1) comments from Referees

This manuscript reports on nitrate in samples collected in the frame of an intensive program of snow sampling made along a traverse from the coast to Dome A (East Antarctica). The samplings include 120 surface snow samples (upper 3 cm), 20 snowpits (down to 1.5-3.0 m depth), and a few crystal ice samples. From the coast to the inner plateau, an increasing trend of nitrate present in surface snow is observed whereas the content of deeper snow pit layers are lower at inland sites than at the coast. Extremely high concentrations are found in crystal ice (reaching almost 1 ppmw). Data are discussed with respect to occurrence of post-depositional remobilization of nitrate, wet and dry deposition, and possible role of other ions (sodium and sulfate).

### Overall evaluation:

First, the authors have to be congratulated for having successfully conducted such a very large snow-sampling program, likely sometimes done under harsh weather conditions. The data certainly contain valuable information in view to better understand incorporation, remobilisation and partial preservation of nitrate atmospheric signal in cold archives. This topic is clearly relevant for the Cryosphere journal.

### (1) author's response

We thank the reviewer very much for reviewing our manuscript and the positive comments. As the reviewer mentioned, the snowpit sampling is usually made under the very harsh weather conditions, e.g., extremely low temperature and heavy blowing snow. We appreciate the Chinese inland Antarctic expedition team members for providing help during sampling.

# (1) author's changes in manuscript

We will revise the manuscript following the reviewer's comments and suggestions, see below.

#### (2) comments from Referees

As it stands the manuscript however requires major revisions and a reevaluation prior to publication. Indeed, at several places in the manuscript data discussions are incorrect, and generally do not enough consider atmospheric information available for the Antarctic atmosphere. Given the scarcity of data presented in this work, I strongly encourage the authors to reformulate the manuscript and in the following I try to identify what would be addressed in an in depth reformulated version of this manuscript.

#### (2) author's response

We thank the reviewer for pointing out the shortcomings of the manuscript. We agree that the atmospheric information was not considered enough. We will improve the work following the reviewer's suggestions/comments.

### (2) author's changes in manuscript

The manuscript was modified according to the comments from the reviewer, see below and section 4 in the revised manuscript.

### (3) comments from Referees

Introduction.

This paragraph has to be reworded on several aspects:

Lines 54-86: You missed here several important papers that have discussed in details the origins of nitrate in Antarctica. For instance, Legrand and Kirchner (1990) extensively discussed (1) the absence of link between solar activity and nitrate in snow, (2) what are the main possible sources of nitrate for Antarctica (stratospheric reservoir and long-range transport in the upper troposphere of lightning production, etc). Also model simulations from Legrand et al. (1989) discussed the source of nitrate for Antarctic regions.

Legrand, M., and Kirchner, S.: Origins and variations of nitrate in South Polar precipitation, J. Geophys. Res., 95, 3493-3507 1990.

Legrand, M. R., F. Stordal, I. S. A. Isaksen, and B. Rognerud (1989), A model study of the stratospheric budget of odd nitrogen, including effects of solar cycle variations, Tellus B, 41(B4), 413–426, doi:10.1111/j.1600-0889.1989.tb00318.x.

### (3) author's response

We agree with the reviewer and are sorry for missing the two important references concerning Antarctic  $NO_3^-$  budget. In terms of the Antarctic  $NO_3^-$  budget, lightning and  $NO_x$  produced in the lower stratosphere were thought to play a major role (Legrand et al., 1989; Legrand and Kirchner, 1990). Also, it is suggested that there is not necessarily a connection between solar variability and  $NO_3^-$  concentrations (Legrand and Kirchner, 1990).

# (3) author's changes in manuscript

The two references were included. The major contribution by lightning and by  $NO_x$  produced in the lower stratosphere to Antarctic  $NO_3^-$  budget was clarified. In addition, the investigation made by Legrand and Kirchner (1990) suggesting no correlation between solar activity (11-year solar cycle, low solar activity time periods, and solar proton events) and the  $NO_3^-$  content of south polar snow was added to the manuscript. Please see the revision-tracked version of manuscript.

### (4) comments from Referees

Lines 80-83: You missed here to report two recent papers from Wolf et al. that strongly question the assumption that solar flares and SPE are recorded in ice. Also model simulations do not support at all such an assumption (Legrand et al., 1989; Duderstadt et al., 2014).

Wolff, E. W., M. Bigler, M. A. J. Curran, J. E. Dibb, M. M. Frey, M. Legrand, and J. R. McConnell (2012), The Carrington Event not observed in most ice core nitrate records, Geophys. Res. Lett., 39, L08503, doi:10.1029/2012GL051603.

Wolff, E. W., M. Bigler, M. A. J. Curran, J. E. Dibb, M. M. Frey, M. Legrand, and J. R. McConnell (2016), Comment on "Low time resolution analysis of polar ice cores cannot detect impulsive nitrate events" by D.F. Smart et al., J. Geophys. Res. Space Physics, 121, doi:10.1002/2015JA021570.

Legrand, M. R., F. Stordal, I. S. A. Isaksen, and B. Rognerud (1989), A model study of the stratospheric budget of odd nitrogen, including effects of solar cycle variations, Tellus B, 41(B4), 413–426, doi:10.1111/j.1600-0889.1989.tb00318.x.

Duderstadt, K. A., J. E. Dibb, C. H. Jackman, C. E. Randall, S. C. Solomon, M. J. Mills, N. A. Schwadron, and H. E. Spence (2014), Nitrate deposition to surface snow at Summit, Greenland, following the 9 November 2000 solar proton event, J. Geophys. Res. Atmos., 119, 6938–6957, doi:10.1002/2013JD021389.

### (4) author's response

Thanks for pointing this out. The observations and modeling works by (Legrand et al., 1989; Legrand and Kirchner, 1990; Wolff et al., 2008; Wolff et al., 2012; Duderstadt et al., 2014;

Duderstadt et al., 2016; Wolff et al., 2016) were included. Indeed, most of observations and recent modeling studies have established that there is not a clear connection between solar variability and  $NO_3^-$  concentrations (Legrand et al., 1989; Legrand and Kirchner, 1990; Wolff et al., 2008; Wolff et al., 2012; Duderstadt et al., 2014; Duderstadt et al., 2016; Wolff et al., 2016).

# (4) author's changes in manuscript

The works made by Wolff et al., Legrand et al., and Duderstadt et al., are included in the revised manuscript. Please see the revised version of the manuscript.

#### (5) comments from Referees

A few sentences on the physical form of nitrate (partitioning between the gas phase, and particulate phase) would be welcome (see my next comment) to better introduce the data discussion with respect to deposition, remobilization, etc.

#### (5) author's response

A good point, thanks. A summary of the observations on partitioning of  $NO_3^-$  between the gaseous phase and particulate phase will be helpful to a better understanding of the deposition and re-emission of  $NO_3^-$ . At Dome C on the East Antarctic plateau, observations on the atmospheric  $NO_3^-$  have been carried out during the years from 2006 to 2016 (Traversi et al., 2014; Legrand et al., 2016; Legrand et al., 2017b; Traversi et al., 2017), which are important works towards a quantitative understanding of  $NO_3^-$  partitioning in the atmosphere.

# (5) author's changes in manuscript

Following the reviewer's suggestion, a paragraph summarizing the partitioning between the gas phase, and particulate phase on  $NO_3^-$  was included in the revised manuscript, as follows,

In the atmosphere in Antarctica, particularly during spring and summer,  $NO_3^-$  is found to be mainly in the form of gas phase HNO<sub>3</sub>, with NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentration several times higher in gas phase than in the particulate phase (Piel et al., 2006; Legrand et al., 2017b; Traversi et al., 2017). During the post-depositional processes, the uptake of gaseous HNO<sub>3</sub> is thought to be important in NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentrations in surface snow layers (Udisti et al., 2004; Traversi et al., 2014; Traversi et al., 2017). Due to the high concentration in summer, HNO<sub>3</sub> appears to play an important role in acidifying sea-salt particles, possibly accounting for the presence of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> in the particulate phase in summer (Jourdain and Legrand, 2002; Legrand et al., 2017b; Traversi et al., 2017). It is noted that the significant increase of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> during the cold periods (e.g., Last Glacial Maximum) could be associated with its attachment to dust aerosol, instead of the gas phase HNO<sub>3</sub> (Legrand et al., 1999; Wolff et al., 2010).

Please see the revised version of the manuscript, section 1 Introduction.

### (6) comments from Referees

Data discussion (Section 3): Please reconsider your data in the light of recent papers dealing with nitric acid gas phase and nitrate in the aerosol phase and their changes over the year in Antarctica.

For instance, check the following recent paper and references therein:

Legrand, M., Preunkert, S., Wolff, E., Weller, R., Jourdain, B., and Wagenbach, D. : Year-round records of bulk and size-segregated aerosol composition in central Antarctica (Concordia site) - Part 1 : Fractionation of sea-salt particles, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 17, 14039-14054, https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-17-14039- 2017, 2017.

## (6) author's response

We thank the reviewer for the very constructive suggestion. The partitioning of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> between gas-phase and particulate phase will be of importance to NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> levels in the snowpack, especially the topmost crystal ice layers. The observed high levels of gas phase HNO<sub>3</sub> in central Antarctica during summer support the importance of the re-emission from snow through the photolysis of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> in affecting atmospheric NO<sub>x</sub>/NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> budget (e.g., Erbland et al., 2013). The atmospheric gaseous HNO<sub>3</sub> likely co-condenses with water vapor (Bock et al., 2016), especially on the extensively developed crystal ice layers on Antarctic plateaus (discussed in the main text), leading to an enrichment of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> in surface snow. In addition, a large concentration of HNO<sub>3</sub> would enhance its reaction with sea-salt, leading to elevated particulate NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentrations (Legrand et al., 2017b). The significant correlation between NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and H<sup>+</sup> ( $R^2$  =0.65, p<0.01) and lack of correlation between NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and sea salt Na<sup>+</sup> in inland Antarctic surface snow seems to suggest the importance of atmospheric gas phase HNO<sub>3</sub> in affecting surface snow NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentrations, in particular NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> levels in the crystal ice samples (correlation between NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and H<sup>+</sup>,  $R^2$  =0.99, p<0.01).

### (6) author's changes in manuscript

The physical form of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> affecting NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentrations in snow was discussed and included in the revised manuscript, as follows,

In inland Antarctica, the dominant  $NO_3^-$  species in the atmosphere is gaseous HNO<sub>3</sub> during summertime, while particulate  $NO_3^-$  is more important in winter (Legrand et al., 2017b; Traversi et al., 2017). The high levels of gas phase HNO<sub>3</sub> in summer support the importance of the re-emission from snow through the photolysis of  $NO_3^-$  in affecting the atmospheric  $NO_x/NO_3^-$  budget (Erbland et al., 2013). On the one hand, the gaseous HNO<sub>3</sub> can be efficiently co-condensed with water vapour onto the extensively developed crystal ice layers on Antarctic plateaus

(discussed above), leading to an enrichment of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> in surface snow (Bock et al., 2016). On the other hand, a large concentration of HNO<sub>3</sub> would enhance its reaction with sea-salt, leading to elevated particulate NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentrations (Legrand et al., 2017b). The significant correlation between NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and H<sup>+</sup> in inland Antarctic surface snow ( $R^2$  =0.65, p<0.01) seems to support the importance of atmospheric gas phase HNO<sub>3</sub> in affecting surface snow NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentrations, in particular NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> levels in the crystal ice samples (Fig. 1).

Please see the revised version of the manuscript, section 4.1.2 NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> in inland snowpack.

# (7) comments from Referees

### Two overall comments:

The idea that nitrate is trapped on coarse sea-salt particles is incorrect (or not enough precise): Atmospheric data show that nitrate stays on the intermediate size particles (1-2 micron range) and not on the coarse ones like sea-salt (even at the coast): Jourdain and Legrand (2002); Teilina et al. (2000), Rankin et al. (2003), and Legrand et al. (2017).

Teinila, K., Kerminen, V.-M., and Hillamo, R. (2000), A study of sizesegregated aerosol chemistry in the Antarctic atmosphere, J. G. R.? 105, 3893- 3904.

Rankin, A. M. and Wolff, E. W.: A year-long record of size- segregated aerosol composition at Halley, Antarctica, J. Geophys. Res., 108, 4775, https://doi.org/10.1029/2003JD003993, 2003.

Jourdain, B. and Legrand, M.: Year-round records of bulk and size-segregated aerosol composition and HCl and HNO3 levels in the Dumont d'Urville (coastal Antarctica) atmosphere: Implications for sea-salt aerosol fractionation in the winter and summer, J. Geophys. Res., 107, 4645, https://doi.org/10.1029/2002JD002471, 2002.

#### (7) author's response

Atmospheric  $NO_3^-$  in Antarctica is mainly in the gas phase (HNO<sub>3</sub>), while the particulate phase represents less, particularly in inland Antarctica. As for the particulate phase (also called "aerosol" in previous observations), most of the  $NO_3^-$  is found on the intermediate size particles  $(1 - 2 \mu m)$  (Jourdain and Legrand, 2002; Rankin and Wolff, 2003; Legrand et al., 2017b). As the reviewer mentioned, the  $NO_3^-$  is not trapped on the coarse sea-salt particles. But the presence of sea salt aerosol can influence atmospheric  $NO_3^-$  in two ways. Firstly, higher atmospheric sea salt aerosol concentrations are expected to promote the conversion of gaseous HNO<sub>3</sub> to particulate phase, allowing for the efficient deposition of  $NO_3^-$  via the aerosol mechanisms. On the other hand, the saline ice in the atmosphere favors the direct uptake of gaseous HNO<sub>3</sub> from the atmosphere (Hara et al., 2005), and elevated  $NO_3^-$  concentrations are usually accompanied by  $Na^+$  spikes in

snowpack (e.g., at Halley station, a coastal location; Wolff et al., 2008).

## (7) author's changes in manuscript

Following the reviewer's comments, the relationship between  $NO_3^-$  and sea salt in the snowpack was re-discussed, as follows,

In comparison with  $nssSO_4^{2-}$  aerosols, the sea-salt aerosols (Na<sup>+</sup>) are coarser and can be removed preferentially from the atmosphere due to a larger dry deposition velocity. High atmospheric sea salt aerosol concentrations are expected to promote the conversion of gaseous HNO<sub>3</sub> to particulate phase, considering that most of the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> in the atmosphere is in the gas phase  $(HNO_3)$ . In this case, particulate  $NO_3^-$  can be efficiently lost via aerosol mechanisms. In addition, the saline ice also favors the direct uptake of gaseous HNO<sub>3</sub> to the ice surface. Changes in partitioning between gas phase (HNO<sub>3</sub>) and particulate phase will affect NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> levels due to the different wet and dry deposition rates of the two species (Aw and Kleeman, 2003). Thus, sea salt aerosols play an important role in the scavenging of gaseous HNO<sub>3</sub> from the atmosphere (Hara et al., 2005), and elevated  $NO_3^-$  concentrations are usually accompanied by  $Na^+$  spikes in snowpack (e.g., at Halley station, a coastal site; Wolff et al., 2008). Here, no significant correlation was found between  $Na^+$  and  $NO_3^-$  in coastal snow (Fig. 7b). The concentration profiles of  $NO_3^-$  and Na<sup>+</sup> in coastal surface snow are shown in Fig. 8, and NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> roughly corresponds to Na<sup>+</sup> in some areas, e.g., 50-150 km and 300-450 km distance inland, although in general they are not very coherent. It is noted that amongst the 4 snow samples with Na<sup>+</sup> > 1.5  $\mu$ eq L<sup>-1</sup> (open circles in Fig. 8), only one sample co-exhibits a  $NO_3^-$  spike. This is different from observations at Halley station, where  $Na^+$  peaks usually led to elevated  $NO_3^-$  levels in surface snow in summer (Wolff et al., 2008). Of the 4 largest Na<sup>+</sup> spikes, one is a fresh snowfall sample (dashed ellipse in Fig. 8), and this sample shows the highest Na<sup>+</sup> concentration (2.8  $\mu$ eq L<sup>-1</sup>) and low NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> (0.75  $\mu$ eq L<sup>-1</sup>). It is noted that NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentration in this fresh snowfall is close to the model predictions (0.7±0.07  $\mu$ eq L<sup>-1</sup>; section 4.1.1), validating that the simple linear deposition model (i.e., the Eq. 6) can well depict the deposition and preservation of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> in coastal snowpack. At inland sites, no correlation was found between  $NO_3^-$  and  $Na^+$  (Fig. 7e), likely explained by the alteration of  $NO_3^$ concentration by post-depositional processing (discussed above).

Please see the revised version of the manuscript, section 4.2 Effects of coexisting ions on NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>.

### (8) comments from Referees

The relationship between NssSO4 and nitrate: The interpretation of the correlation between nitrate and sulphuric acid referring to Brown et al. (2006) is misleading. Indeed this study discussed of the reaction of N2O5 on acidic sulphate promoting the formation of HNO3 in a polluted atmosphere at night. Whatever the Antarctic site, the acidic sulphate is maximum in summer whereas, if present, N2O5 can only exit in the Antarctic atmosphere in winter (due to photolysis of the NO3 radical in summer, N2O5 does not exist in summer). So the correlation seen in snow

cannot be explained like that.

# (8) author's response

We agree with the referee that the conversion of N<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> to HNO<sub>3</sub> during austral summer could be rather negligible due to the photolysis of NO<sub>3</sub> radical in summertime (NO<sub>3</sub> + NO<sub>2</sub> + M  $\rightarrow$  N<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>+ M). This point was clarified in the revised manuscript. Following previous investigations, the high concentrations of nssSO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup> aerosols could provide nucleation centers forming the multi-ion complexes with HNO<sub>3</sub> in the atmosphere, possibly leading to elevated NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentrations in the snow (Laluraj et al., 2010). On the other hand, the presence of fine nssSO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup> aerosol may also enhance the direct uptake of gas phase HNO<sub>3</sub> onto the surface, resulting in NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> deposition via aerosol mechanisms. It is acknowledged that these are the plausible explanation of the association between the two anions, and it cannot be ruled out that other processes and/or chemistry would influence the relationship of the parameters. Further works are needed to characterize the formation of SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup> and NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and their potential association in Antarctic atmosphere.

#### (8) author's changes in manuscript

Following the comments from reviewer#2 and Prof. Savarino, the correlation between  $SO_4^{2^-}$  and  $NO_3^-$  was re-discussed in the revised manuscript, as follows,

In surface snow, the non-sea salt fraction of  $SO_4^{2-}$  accounts for 75 - 99 % of its total budget, with a mean of 95 %. The percentages are relatively higher in inland regions than at coastal sites. On the coast, a positive relationship was found between  $nssSO_4^{2-}$  and  $NO_3^{-}$  ( $R^2 = 0.32$ , p < 0.01; Fig. 7a). Previous observations suggest that  $NO_3^-$  and  $nssSO_4^{-2}$  peaks in the atmosphere and snow are usually present in summer (Jourdain and Legrand, 2002; Wolff et al., 2008; Sigl et al., 2016; Legrand et al., 2017a; Legrand et al., 2017b). However, the similar seasonal pattern of the two species is associated with distinct sources, i.e.,  $SO_4^{2-}$  is mainly derived from marine biogenic emissions while  $NO_3^-$  is influenced by photolysis and tropospheric transport (Savarino et al., 2007; Lee et al., 2014; Zatko et al., 2016). In the atmosphere, most of  $SO_4^{2-}$  is on the submicron particles, while most of  $NO_3^-$  is gaseous HNO<sub>3</sub> and the particulate  $NO_3^-$  is mainly on the intermediate size particles (Jourdain and Legrand, 2002; Rankin and Wolff, 2003; Legrand et al., 2017a; Legrand et al., 2017b). Thus, the correlation between  $NO_3^{-1}$  and  $SO_4^{-2-1}$  is unlikely explained by the sources or their occurrence state in the atmosphere (i.e., gaseous and particulate phases). Laluraj et al. (2010) proposed that the correlation between  $nssSO_4^{2-}$  vs.  $NO_3^{-}$  in ice ( $R^2 = 0.31$ , p < 0.01) could be associated with the fine  $nssSO_4^{2-}$  aerosols, which could provide nucleation centers forming the multi-ion complexes with HNO3 in the atmosphere. This assertion, however, should be examined further, considering that the complex chemistry of  $SO_4^{2-}$  and  $NO_3^{-}$  in the atmosphere is far from understood (e.g., (Wolff, 1995; Brown et al., 2006). Thus far, the mechanism of nssSO<sub>4</sub><sup>-2</sup> influencing  $NO_3^{-1}$  in the snowpack, however, is still debated, and it cannot be ruled out that nssSO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup> further affects mobilization of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> during and/or after crystallization (Legrand and Kirchner, 1990; Wolff, 1995; Röhlisberger et al., 2000). It is noted that no relationship was found between  $nssSO_4^{2-}$  and  $NO_3^{-}$  in inland snow (Fig. 7d), possibly due to the strong alteration of  $NO_3^{-}$ 

during post-depositional processes, as discussed in section 4.1.2.

Please see the revised version of the manuscript, section 4.2 Effects of coexisting ions on NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>.

## (9) comments from Referees

Other comments:

Information on the chemistry of ice crystal are rather rare, so may important to develop this aspect in the revised manuscript (showing the full chemical composition and its comparison with snow).

Did you have measured MSA?

I think you can say that nssCl is HCl and it can be interesting to compare with gas phase HNO3.

End of the review.

# (9) author's response

Thanks to the reviewer for this suggestion. As the reviewer mentioned, the information on the crystal ice samples on Antarctic plateaus remain limited. So, showing the full chemical composition of the crystal ice can provide important information on snow chemistry in Antarctica. In addition, a comparison of chemical ion concentrations between surface snow and crystal ice was made in the revised manuscript.

Unfortunately, we did not measure the concentrations of MSA now. But we will measure the MSA concentrations in the samples of surface snow/snowpits. Possibly it will be another paper focusing on the biogenic sulfur ( $nssSO_4^{2-}$  and MSA).

Yes, the nssCl<sup>-</sup> can be taken as HCl. This point was re-discussed in the manuscript.

## (9) author's changes in manuscript

Following the reviewer's comment, a figure was included in the supporting information, as follows,



Figure S2 Major chemical ions in surface snow and crystal ice samples on the traverse from coast to the ice sheet summit (Dome A) in East Antarctica. Contribution percentages of each ion to total ion concentrations are shown in (a) and (b), respectively. Concentrations of ions in surface snow and crystal ice are shown in (c), with error bars of one standard deviation  $(1\sigma)$ . The concentration of H<sup>+</sup> is calculated from the difference between sum anions and sum cations. Note that a base-10 log scale is used for ion concentrations in (c).

In addition, the major chemical ion concentrations and a comparison between surface snow and crystal ice was included in the updated version of the manuscript (3.1  $NO_3^-$  concentration in surface snow), as follows,

In the crystal ice, the means (ranges) of Cl<sup>-</sup>, NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>, SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup>, Na<sup>+</sup>, NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>, K<sup>+</sup>, Mg<sup>2+</sup>, Ca<sup>2+</sup> and H<sup>+</sup> concentrations are 0.98 (0.62 – 1.27), 10.40 (8.35 – 16.06), 1.29 (0.87 – 2.13), 0.27 (0.21 – 0.33), 0.24 (0.03 – 0.56), 0.05 (0.03 – 0.08), 0.18 (0.15 – 0.22), 0.18 (0.05 – 0.57) and 11.75 (9.56 – 18.12) µeq L<sup>-1</sup>, respectively. H<sup>+</sup> and NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> are the most abundant species, accounting for 46.4 and 41.0 % of the total ions, followed by SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup> (5.1 %) and Cl<sup>-</sup> (3.9 %). The other 5 cations, Na<sup>+</sup>, NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>, K<sup>+</sup>, Mg<sup>2+</sup> and Ca<sup>2+</sup>, only represent 3.6 % of the total ion budget. A significant linear relationship was found between NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and the total ionic strength ( $R^2 = 0.99$ , p < 0.01), possibly suggesting that NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> is the species controlling ion abundance by influencing acidity of the crystal ice (i.e., H<sup>+</sup> levels). In comparison with surface snow, concentrations of H<sup>+</sup> and NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> are significantly higher in crystal ice (Independent Samples T Test, p<0.01), while concentrations of Cl<sup>-</sup>, SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup>, Na<sup>+</sup>, NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>, K<sup>+</sup>, Mg<sup>2+</sup> and Ca<sup>2+</sup> are comparable in the two types of snow samples (Fig. S2 in supporting

information). To date, the information on the chemistry of ice crystal is rather limited but data from the so-called skin layer at Dome C, where  $NO_3^-$  concentrations in the top 0.4 cm snow layer are in the range of 9 – 22 µeq L<sup>-1</sup> in summertime (Erbland et al., 2013), generally comparable to our observations.

In addition, the association between  $NO_3^-$  and the major chemical ions in crystal ice was re-discussed (4.2 Effects of coexisting ions on  $NO_3^-$ ), as follows,

With regard to the crystal ice, no significant correlation was found between NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and the coexisting ions (e.g., Cl<sup>-</sup>, Na<sup>+</sup> and SO<sub>4</sub><sup>-2-</sup>), possibly suggesting that these ions are generally less influential on  $NO_3^-$  in this uppermost thin layer, compared to the strong air-snow transfer process of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> (Erbland et al., 2013). It is noted that NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> accounts for most of the calculated  $H^+$ concentrations (81 - 97 %, mean = 89 %), and a strong linear relationship was found between them  $(R^2 = 0.96)$ , suggesting that NO<sub>3</sub> is mainly deposited as acid, HNO<sub>3</sub>, rather than in particulate form as salts (e.g., NaNO<sub>3</sub> and Ca(NO<sub>3</sub>)<sub>2</sub>). This deduction is in line with the observations at Dome C, where atmospheric  $NO_3^-$  was found to be mainly in gaseous phase (HNO<sub>3</sub>) in summer (Legrand et al., 2017b). On average, the deposition of HNO<sub>3</sub> contribute >91% of  $NO_3^-$  in the crystal ice (the lower limit, 91 %, calculated simply by assuming all of the alkaline species (Na<sup>+</sup>, NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>, K<sup>+</sup>, Mg<sup>2+</sup> and Ca<sup>2+</sup>) neutralized by HNO<sub>3</sub> in the atmosphere), suggesting a dominant role of HNO<sub>3</sub> deposition in snow NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> levels. The elevated high atmospheric NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentrations observed at Dome A (>100 ng m<sup>-3</sup>; 77.12°E, 80.42°S; Table S1 in supporting information) possibly indicate oxidation of gaseous  $NO_x$  to  $HNO_3$ , suggesting that  $NO_3^-$  recycling driven by photolysis plays an important role in its abundance in snowpack on East Antarctic plateaus.

The relationship between nssCl<sup>-</sup> (i.e., the HCl) and NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> in snow was re-discussed in the revised manuscript, please see the revised manuscript, **4.2 Effects of coexisting ions on NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>** 

End of responses to Referee #2.

## References

Alley, R., Finkel, R., Nishizumi, K., Anandakrishnan, A., Shuman, C., Mershon, G., Zielinski, G., and Mayewski, P.A.: Changes in continental and sea-salt atmospheric loadings in central Greenland during the most recent deglaciation: Model-based estimates, J. Glaciol., 41, 503-514, 1995.

Barrie, L.A.: Scavenging ratios, wet deposition, and in-cloud oxidation: An application to the oxides of sulphur and nitrogen, J. Geophys. Res., 90, 5789–5799, 1985.

Berhanu, T.A., Meusinger, C., Erbland, J., Jost, R., Bhattacharya, S., Johnson, M.S., and Savarino, J.: Laboratory study of nitrate photolysis in Antarctic snow. II. Isotopic effects and wavelength dependence, J. Chem. Phy., 140, 244306, doi:10.1063/1.4882899, 2014.

Berhanu, T.A., Savarino, J., Erbland, J., Vicars, W.C., Preunkert, S., Martins, J.F., and Johnson, M.S.: Isotopic effects of nitrate photochemistry in snow: a field study at Dome C, Antarctica, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 15, 11243-11256, doi:10.5194/acp-15-11243-2015, 2015.

Bertler, N., Mayewski, P.A., Aristarain, A., Barrett, P., Becagli, S., Bernardo, R., Bo, S., Xiao, C., Curran, M., and Qin, D.: Snow chemistry across Antarctica, Ann. Glaciol., 41, 167-179, 2005.

Bock, J., Savarino, J., and Picard, G.: Air–snow exchange of nitrate: a modelling approach to investigate physicochemical processes in surface snow at Dome C, Antarctica, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 16, 12531-12550, doi:10.5194/acp-16-12531-2016, 2016.

Brown, S., Ryerson, T., Wollny, A., Brock, C., Peltier, R., Sullivan, A., Weber, R., Dube, W., Trainer, M., and Meagher, J.: Variability in nocturnal nitrogen oxide processing and its role in regional air quality, Science, 311, 67-70, doi:10.1126/science.1120120, 2006.

Cragin, J., and McGilvary, R., 1995. Can inorganic chemical species volatilize from snow?, in: Tonnessen, K.A., Williams, M.W., Tranter, M. (Eds.), Biogeochemistry of Seasonally Snow-Covered Catchments. IAHS Press, Wallingford, UK, pp. 11-16.

Duderstadt, K.A., Dibb, J.E., Jackman, C.H., Randall, C.E., Solomon, S.C., Mills, M.J., Schwadron, N.A., and Spence, H.E.: Nitrate deposition to surface snow at Summit, Greenland, following the 9 November 2000 solar proton event, J. Geophys. Res., 119, 6938-6957, 2014.

Duderstadt, K.A., Dibb, J.E., Schwadron, N.A., Spence, H.E., Solomon, S.C., Yudin, V.A., Jackman, C.H., and Randall, C.E.: Nitrate ion spikes in ice cores not suitable as proxies for solar

proton events, J. Geophys. Res., 121, 2994-3016, doi:10.1002/2015JD023805, 2016.

Erbland, J., Savarino, J., Morin, S., France, J.L., Frey, M.M., and King, M.D.: Air-snow transfer of nitrate on the East Antarctic plateau -Part 2: An isotopic model for the interpretation of deep ice-core records, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 15, 12079–12113, doi:10.5194/acp-15-12079-2015, 2015.

Erbland, J., Vicars, W., Savarino, J., Morin, S., Frey, M., Frosini, D., Vince, E., and Martins, J.: Air-snow transfer of nitrate on the East Antarctic Plateau - Part 1: Isotopic evidence for a photolytically driven dynamic equilibrium in summer, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 13, 6403-6419, doi:10.5194/acp-13-6403-2013, 2013.

France, J., King, M., Frey, M., Erbland, J., Picard, G., Preunkert, S., MacArthur, A., and Savarino, J.: Snow optical properties at Dome C (Concordia), Antarctica; implications for snow emissions and snow chemistry of reactive nitrogen, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 11, 9787-9801, doi:10.5194/acp-11-9787-2011, 2011.

Frey, M.M., Savarino, J., Morin, S., Erbland, J., and Martins, J.: Photolysis imprint in the nitrate stable isotope signal in snow and atmosphere of East Antarctica and implications for reactive nitrogen cycling, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 9, 8681-8696, 2009.

Ginot, P., Kull, C., Schwikowski, M., Schotterer, U., and Gäggeler, H.W.: Effects of postdepositional processes on snow composition of a subtropical glacier (Cerro Tapado, Chilean Andes), J. Geophys. Res., 106, 32375-32386, 2001.

Hara, K., Nakazawa, F., Fujita, S., Fukui, K., Enomoto, H., and Sugiyama, S.: Horizontal distributions of aerosol constituents and their mixing states in Antarctica during the JASE traverse, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 14, 10211-10230, doi:10.5194/acp-14-10211-2014, 2014.

Hara, K., Osada, K., Kido, M., Matsunaga, K., Iwasaka, Y., Hashida, G., and Yamanouchi, T.: Variations of constituents of individual sea-salt particles at Syowa station, Antarctica, Tellus B, 57, 230-246, 2005.

Holland, P.R., Bruneau, N., Enright, C., Losch, M., Kurtz, N.T., and Kwok, R.: Modeled Trends in Antarctic Sea Ice Thickness, J. Climate, 27, 3784-3801, doi:10.1175/JCLI-D-13-00301.1, 2014.

Jourdain, B., and Legrand, M.: Year - round records of bulk and size - segregated aerosol composition and HCl and HNO3 levels in the Dumont d'Urville (coastal Antarctica) atmosphere: Implications for sea - salt aerosol fractionation in the winter and summer, J. Geophys. Res., 107, ACH 20-21 - ACH 20-13, doi:10.1029/2002JD002471, 2002.

Kasper-Giebl, A., Kalina, M.F., and Puxbaum, H.: Scavenging ratios for sulfate, ammonium and nitrate determined at Mt. Sonnblick (3106m a.s.l.), Atmos. Environ., 33, 895-906, 1999.

Laluraj, C., Thamban, M., Naik, S., Redkar, B., Chaturvedi, A., and Ravindra, R.: Nitrate records of a shallow ice core from East Antarctica: Atmospheric processes, preservation and climatic implications, The Holocene, 21, 351-356, doi:10.1177/0959683610374886, 2010.

Lee, H.-M., Henze, D.K., Alexander, B., and Murray, L.T.: Investigating the sensitivity of surface-level nitrate seasonality in Antarctica to primary sources using a global model, Atmos. Environ., 89, 757-767, doi:10.1016/j.atmosenv.2014.03.003, 2014.

Legrand, M.: Chemistry of Antarctic snow and ice, Le Journal De Physique Colloques, 48, C1-77-C71-86, 1987.

Legrand, M., and Kirchner, S.: Origins and variations of nitrate in South Polar precipitation, J. Geophys. Res., 95, 3493-3507 1990.

Legrand, M., Preunkert, S., Weller, R., Zipf, L., Elsässer, C., Merchel, S., Rugel, G., and Wagenbach, D.: Year-round record of bulk and size-segregated aerosol composition in central Antarctica (Concordia site) – Part 2: Biogenic sulfur (sulfate and methanesulfonate) aerosol, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 17, 14055-14073, doi:10.5194/acp-17-14055-2017, 2017a.

Legrand, M., Preunkert, S., Wolff, E., Weller, R., Jourdain, B., and Wagenbach, D.: Year-round records of bulk and size-segregated aerosol composition in central Antarctica (Concordia site) – Part 1: Fractionation of sea-salt particles, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 17, 14039-14054, doi:10.5194/acp-17-14039-2017, 2017b.

Legrand, M., Wolff, E., and Wagenbach, D.: Antarctic aerosol and snowfall chemistry: implications for deep Antarctic ice-core chemistry, Ann. Glaciol., 29, 66-72, 1999.

Legrand, M., Yang, X., Preunkert, S., and Theys, N.: Year-round records of sea salt, gaseous, and particulate inorganic bromine in the atmospheric boundary layer at coastal (Dumont d'Urville) and central (Concordia) East Antarctic sites, J. Geophys. Res., 121, 2015JD024066, doi:10.1002/2015JD024066, 2016.

Legrand, M.R., and Delmas, R.J.: Soluble impurities in four Antarctic ice cores over the last 30,000 years, Ann. Glaciol., 10, 116-120, 1988.

Legrand, M.R., Stordal, F., Isaksen, I.S.A., and Rognerud, B.: A model study of the stratospheric budget of odd nitrogen, including effects of solar cycle variations, Tellus Series B-chemical & Physical Meteorology, 41B, 413–426, doi:10.1111/j.1600-0889.1989.tb00318.x, 1989.

Ma, Y., Bian, L., Xiao, C., Allison, I., and Zhou, X.: Near surface climate of the traverse route from Zhongshan Station to Dome A, East Antarctica, Antarct. Sci., 22, 443-459, doi:10.1017/S0954102010000209, 2010.

Marion, G., Farren, R., and Komrowski, A.: Alternative pathways for seawater freezing, Cold Reg. Sci. Technol., 29, 259-266, 1999.

Mulvaney, R., Wagenbach, D., and Wolff, E.W.: Postdepositional change in snowpack nitrate from observation of year-round near-surface snow in coastal Antarctica, J. Geophys. Res., 103, 11021-11031, 1998.

Parish, T.R., and Bromwich, D.H.: Reexamination of the near-surface airflow over the Antarctic continent and implications on atmospheric circulations at high southern latitudes, Mon. Weather. Rev., 135, 1961-1973, doi:10.1175/MWR3374.1, 2007.

Pasteris, D., McConnell, J.R., Edwards, R., Isaksson, E., and Albert, M.R.: Acidity decline in Antarctic ice cores during the Little Ice Age linked to changes in atmospheric nitrate and sea salt concentrations, J. Geophys. Res., 119, 5640-5652, doi:10.1002/2013JD020377, 2014.

Piel, C., Weller, R., Huke, M., and Wagenbach, D.: Atmospheric methane sulfonate and non-sea-salt sulfate records at the European Project for Ice Coring in Antarctica (EPICA) deep-drilling site in Dronning Maud Land, Antarctica, J. Geophys. Res., 111, -, 2006.

Röhlisberger, R., Hutterli, M.A., Sommer, S., Wolff, E.W., and Mulvaney, R.: Factors controlling nitrate in ice cores: Evidence from the Dome C deep ice core, J. Geophys. Res., 105, 20565-20572, 2000.

Rankin, A.M., and Wolff, E.W.: A year-long record of size-segregated aerosol composition at Halley, Antarctica, J. Geophys. Res., 108, -, 2003.

Rankin, A.M., Wolff, E.W., and Martin, S.: Frost flowers: Implications for tropospheric chemistry and ice core interpretation, J. Geophys. Res., 107, AAC 4-1–AAC 4-15, 2002.

Riikonen, S., Parkkinen, P., Halonen, L., and Gerber, R.B.: Ionization of acids on the quasi-liquid layer of ice, J. Phys. Chem. A, 118, 5029-5037, doi:10.1021/jp505627n, 2014.

Sato, K., Takenaka, N., Bandow, H., and Maeda, Y.: Evaporation loss of dissolved volatile substances from ice surfaces, J. Phys. Chem., 112, 7600-7607, doi:10.1021/jp075551r, 2008.

Savarino, J., Kaiser, J., Morin, S., Sigman, D.M., and Thiemens, M.H.: Nitrogen and oxygen isotopic constraints on the origin of atmospheric nitrate in coastal Antarctica, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 7, 1925-1945, 2007.

Shi, G., Buffen, A.M., Hastings, M.G., Li, C., Ma, H., Li, Y., Sun, B., An, C., and Jiang, S.: Investigation of post-depositional processing of nitrate in East Antarctic snow: isotopic constraints on photolytic loss, re-oxidation, and source inputs, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 15, 9435–9453, doi:10.5194/acp-15-9435-2015, 2015.

Shi, G., Li, Y., Jiang, S., An, C., Ma, H., Sun, B., and Wang, Y.: Large-scale spatial variability of major ions in the atmospheric wet deposition along the China Antarctica transect (31° N~ 69° S), Tellus B, 64, 17134, doi:10.3402/tellusb.v64i0.17134, 2012.

Shrestha, A., Wake, C., Dibb, J., and Whitlow, S.: Aerosol and Precipitation Chemistry at a Remote Himalayan Site in Nepal, Aerosol Science & Technology, 36, 441-456, 2002.

Sigl, M., Fudge, T.J., Winstrup, M., Coledai, J., Ferris, D., Mcconnell, J.R., Taylor, K.C., Welten, K.C., Woodruff, T.E., and Adolphi, F.: The WAIS Divide deep ice core WD2014 chronology - Part 2: Annual-layer counting (0-31 ka BP), Clim. Past, 11, 3425-3474, 2016.

Traversi, R., Becagli, S., Brogioni, M., Caiazzo, L., Ciardini, V., Giardi, F., Legrand, M., Macelloni, G., Petkov, B., Preunkert, S., Scarchilli, C., Severi, M., Vitale, V., and Udisti, R.: Multi-year record of atmospheric and snow surface nitrate in the central Antarctic plateau, Chemosphere, 172, 341-354, doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2016.12.143, 2017.

Traversi, R., Udisti, R., Frosini, D., Becagli, S., Ciardini, V., Funke, B., Lanconelli, C., Petkov, B., Scarchilli, C., and Severi, M.: Insights on nitrate sources at Dome C (East Antarctic Plateau) from multi-year aerosol and snow records, Tellus B, 66, 22550, doi:10.3402/tellusb.v66.22550, 2014.

Traversi, R., Usoskin, I., Solanki, S., Becagli, S., Frezzotti, M., Severi, M., Stenni, B., and Udisti, R.: Nitrate in Polar Ice: A New Tracer of Solar Variability, Sol. Phys., 280, 237-254, 2012.

Udisti, R., Becagli, S., Benassai, S., Castellano, E., Fattori, I., Innocenti, M., Migliori, A., and Traversi, R.: Atmospheresnow interaction by a comparison between aerosol and uppermost snow-layers composition at Dome C, East Antarctica, Ann. Glaciol., 39, 53-61, 2004.

Wagenbach, D., Ducroz, F., Mulvaney, R., Keck, L., Minikin, A., Legrand, M., Hall, J.S., and Wolff, E.W.: Sea-salt aerosol in coastal Antarctic regions, J. Geophys. Res., 103, 10961-10974, 1998a.

Wagenbach, D., Legrand, M., Fischer, H., Pichlmayer, F., and Wolff, E.W.: Atmospheric near-surface nitrate at coastal Antarctic sites, J. Geophys. Res., 103, 11007-11020, 1998b.

Weller, R., Traufetter, F., Fischer, H., Oerter, H., Piel, C., and Miller, H.: Postdepositional losses of methane sulfonate, nitrate, and chloride at the European Project for Ice Coring in Antarctica deep-drilling site in Dronning Maud Land, Antarctica, J. Geophys. Res., 109, 1-9, doi:10.1029/2003JD004189, 2004.

Weller, R., and Wagenbach, D., 2007. Year-round chemical aerosol records in continental Antarctica obtained by automatic samplings.

Wolff, E.W., 1995. Nitrate in polar ice, in: Delmas, R.J. (Ed.), in Ice core studies of global biogeochemical cycles. Springer, New York, pp. 195-224.

Wolff, E.W., Barbante, S., Becagle, S., Bigler, M., Boutron, C.F., Castellano, E., de Angelis, M., and Federer, U.: Changes in environment over the last 800,000 years from chemical analysis of the EPICA Dome C ice core, Quaternary Sci. Rev., 29, 285-295, 2010.

Wolff, E.W., Bigler, M., Curran, M., Dibb, J., Frey, M., Legrand, M., and McConnell, J.: The Carrington event not observed in most ice core nitrate records, Geophys. Res. Lett., 39, L08503, doi:10.1029/2012GL051603, 2012.

Wolff, E.W., Bigler, M., Curran, M.A.J., Dibb, J.E., Frey, M.M., Legrand, M., and Mcconnell, J.R.: Comment on "Low time resolution analysis of polar ice cores cannot detect impulsive nitrate events" by D.F. Smart et al, J. Geophys. Res., 121, 1920-1924, 2016.

Wolff, E.W., Jones, A.E., Bauguitte, S.-B., and Salmon, R.A.: The interpretation of spikes and trends in concentration of nitrate in polar ice cores, based on evidence from snow and atmospheric measurements, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 8, 5627-5634, 2008.

Zatko, M., Grenfell, T., Alexander, B., Doherty, S., Thomas, J., and Yang, X.: The influence of snow grain size and impurities on the vertical profiles of actinic flux and associated  $NO_x$  emissions on the Antarctic and Greenland ice sheets, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 13, 3547-3567, doi:10.5194/acp-13-3547-2013, 2013.

Zatko, M.C., Geng, L., Alexander, B., Sofen, E.D., and Klein, K.: The impact of snow nitrate photolysis on boundary layer chemistry and the recycling and redistribution of reactive nitrogen across Antarctica and Greenland in a global chemical transport model, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 16, 2819-2842, doi:10.5194/acp-16-2819-2016, 2016.

Zeller, E.J., Dreschhoff, G.A., and Laird, C.M.: Nitrate flux on the Ross Ice Shelf, Antarctica and its relation to solar cosmic rays, Geophys. Res. Lett., 13, 1264-1267, 1986.

## End of the responses.