

Interactive comment on “In situ measurement of meltwater percolation flux in seasonal alpine snowpack using self potential and capillary pressure sensors” by Wilson S. Clayton

F. Dominé (Editor)

florent.domine@gmail.com

Received and published: 4 December 2017

Dear Dr. Clayton

After carefully considering the evaluation of both reviewers, I am sorry to come to the conclusion that your manuscript cannot be accepted for publication in The Cryosphere with the amount of data provided. Both reviewers agree that the data you provide is not sufficient as it has been obtained over a very short period during just one melt season, while previous studies on similar topics studied much longer periods, and the studies often extended over several years. Your work may have been considered as a feasibility study, but reviewer 2 casts serious doubt about the validity of your methods

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



and points to references which discussed difficulties with your experimental choices. Furthermore, your discussion of previous work, and of the added value of your system, appears insufficient.

In summary, a much larger data set, a better justification of your technological choices, and an extended discussion of the interest of your system in light of previous studies would have been required. Performing the necessary improvements within the time allowed for revisions does not appear realistic.

I wish you the best of luck in your future studies, and we hope to have the opportunity to consider suitable manuscripts from you in the future.

Best regards

Florent Domine

Co-Editor-in-Chief

Interactive comment on The Cryosphere Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/tc-2017-187>, 2017.

TCD

Interactive
comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

