

Interactive comment on “Assessment of Glacier Area Change in the Tekes River Basin, Central Tien Shan, Kazakhstan Between 1976 and 2013 Using Landsat and KH-9 Imagery” by Z. Usmanova et al.

T. Bolch (Editor)

tobias.bolch@geo.uzh.ch

Received and published: 2 August 2016

Dear authors,

I have carefully read the reviewers comments and your manuscript. Both reviewers highlight that the study could potentially of interest as no study of the glacier changes exists for the investigated region but both reviewers also identify several major shortcomings and recommend to reject the manuscript for The Cryosphere.

The major identified shortcomings are the lack of innovation and the small spatial coverage of the study region. Both issues were also critically mentioned by my access

C1

review. Further identified major issues are the suitability of the selected scenes and the insufficient consideration of the glacier response time.

I am in general in line with the reviewers and feel sorry to reject the manuscript at this stage. This is also to give you enough time to consider the comments. You may nevertheless provide a reply to the reviewers comments.

I encourage you to revise your study and manuscript and I am willing to act as an editor again in case you decide to resubmit a carefully revised manuscript to The Cryosphere. Most important to be accepted for The Cryosphere are to extend the spatial coverage (e.g. whole Tekes River basin or whole Kazakh Tien Shan glaciers) and include more periods (e.g. including data from ~2000 and/or KH4A data). The climatological analysis should either be deemphasised or the glacier response time need to be better considered. While I do not agree with all comments of the reviewers (e.g. there are only minor language issues and “buffer method” might not be the best, but is a widely accepted method for an estimate of the uncertainty), both reviewers provide suggestions for improvements and detailed comments which should be quite useful for the revision of the manuscript.

Let me know in case you have any questions.

Best regards,

Tobias Bolch – Editor TC

Interactive comment on The Cryosphere Discuss., doi:10.5194/tc-2016-82, 2016.