

Interactive comment on “Properties of black carbon and other insoluble light-absorbing particles in seasonal snow of northwest China” by Wei Pu et al.

F. Dominé (Editor)

florent.domine@gmail.com

Received and published: 17 January 2017

Dear Authors,

Both reviewers have an overall positive evaluation of your paper, but both also note significant deficiencies in your work, which may cast doubt on the robustness of your methods and conclusion. Reviewer 1 in particular is not fully convinced by your use of the PMF method. He also notes a lack of detail or erroneous points in your description of analytical methods. Reviewer 2 questions the time-representativity of your data set. He also makes an interesting comment regarding the radiative impact of BC in snow.

I encourage you to submit a very carefully revised version, where all measurement

C1

uncertainties and data representativity are clearly detailed and their effects taken into account, in particular regarding their possible impact on the conclusions drawn from your PMF analysis. Your modifications will be evaluated critically before possible acceptance of your paper in The Cryosphere.

Best regards

Florent Domine

Interactive comment on The Cryosphere Discuss., doi:10.5194/tc-2016-233, 2016.

C2