

57 er-like crystals (Ebner et al., 2015b). Whisker-like crystals are very small (~10-30 μm)
 58 elongated monocrystals. A flow rate dependence of the deposition rate of water vapor
 59 deposition at the ice interface was observed, asymptotically approaching an average es-
 60 timated maximum volumetric deposition rate on the whole sample of $1.05 \cdot 10^{-4} \text{ kg m}^{-3}$
 61 s^{-1} (Ebner et al., 2015b). Contrarily, if the temperature gradient acts in the same direc-
 62 tion of the airflow, the airflow through the snow brings cold and relatively dry air into a
 63 warmer area, causing that the pore space air becomes undersaturated, and surrounding
 64 ice sublimates. Here, we investigate specifically this last effect.

65 Sublimation of snow is a fundamental process that affects its crystal structure
 66 (Sturm and Benson, 1997), and thus is important for ice core interpretation (Stichler et
 67 al., 2001; Ekaykin et al., 2009), as well as calculation of surface energy balance (Box
 68 and Steffen, 2001) and mass balance (Déry and Yau, 2002). Kaempfer and Plapp (2009)
 69 suggest that condensation of water vapor will have a noticeable effect on the micro-
 70 structure of snow using a 3D phase-field model, which is also confirmed by a two di-
 71 mensional finite-element model using airflow velocities, vapor transport and sublima-
 72 tion rates of Albert (2002). Neumann et al. (2009) determined that there is no energy
 73 barrier to be overcome during sublimation, and suggest that snow sublimation is limited
 74 by vapor diffusion into pore space, rather than by sublimation at the crystal surface.

75 In the present work, we studied the surface dynamics of snow metamorphism under
 76 an induced temperature gradient and saturated airflow in a controlled laboratory exper-
 77 iments. Cold saturated air at around (-14 °C) was blown into the snow samples and
 78 warmed up to around -12.5 °C while flowing across the sample. Sublimation of ice was
 79 analyzed by in-situ time-lapse experiment with microcomputer tomography (micro-CT)
 80 (Pinzer and Schneebeli, 2009; Chen and Baker, 2010; Pinzer et al., 2012; Wang and
 81 Baker, 2014; Ebner et al., 2014) to obtain the discrete-scale geometry of snow. By using
 82 discrete-scale geometry, all structures are resolved with a finite resolution correspond-
 83 ing to the voxel size. ?

84 **2. Time-Lapse tomography experiments**

85 Temperature gradient experiments with fully saturated airflow across snow samples
 86 (Ebner et al., 2014) were performed in a cooled micro-CT (Scanco Medical μ-CT80) in
 87 a cold laboratory temperature of $T_{\text{lab}} = -15^\circ\text{C}$. Cold saturated air was blown into the
 88 snow samples and warmed up while flowing across the sample. Aluminum foam includ-
 89 ing a heating wire was used to warm the side of the snow opposite to the entering air-

90 flow. We analyzed the following flow rates: a volume flow of 0 (no advection), 0.3, 1.0,
91 and 3.0 liter/min. Higher flow rates were experimentally not possible as shear stresses
92 by airflow destroyed the snow structure (Ebner et al., 2015a). Nature identical snow
93 produced in a cold laboratory (Schleef et al., 2014) was used for the snow sample prepara-
94 tion (water temperature: 30 °C; air temperature: -20 °C). The snow was sieved with a
95 mesh size of 1.4 mm into a box, and was sintered for 27 days at -5 °C to increase its
96 strength. The sample holder (diameter: 53 mm; height: 30 mm) was filled by cutting out
97 a cylinder from the sintered snow and pushing into the sample holder without mechani-
98 cal disturbance of the core. The snow samples were measured with a voxel size of 18
99 μm^3 over 108 h with time-lapse micro-CT measurements taken every 3 h, producing a
100 sequence of 37 images. The size of the cubic voxel size was 18 μm . The innermost 36.9
101 mm of the total 53 mm diameter were scanned, and subsamples with a dimension of 7.2
102 mm \times 7.2 mm \times 7.2 mm were extracted for further processing. The imaged volume was
103 in the centre of the sample (Fig. 1 c)). A linear encoder with a resolution of less than 1
104 voxel ($< 2 \mu\text{m}$) was used to verify that the scans were taken at the same position. The
105 reconstructed micro-CT images were filtered by using a $3 \times 3 \times 3$ median filter followed
106 by a Gaussian filter ($\sigma = 1.4$, support = 3). The clustering-based Otsu method (Otsu,
107 1979) was used to automatically segment the grey-level images into ice and void phase.
108 Morphological properties of the two-phase system were determined based on the geom-

(2)
this is a length
18 μm
or
 $18 \times 18 \times 18 \mu\text{m}^3$
= 5832 μm^3
this is a volume



redundant information
 $18 \times 18 \times 18 \mu\text{m}^3$

add information about the position correction procedure mentioned in response #6

109 etry obtained by the micro-CT. The segmented data were used to calculate a triangulat-
110 ed ice matrix surface and tetrahedrons inscribed into the ice structure. Morphological
111 parameters such as porosity (ϵ) and specific surface area (SSA) were then calculated. An
112 opening-based morphological operation was applied to extract the mean pore size of
113 each micro-CT scan (d_{mean}) (Hausener et al., 2012). As additional physical and struc-
114 tural parameter, the effective thermal conductivity k_{cond} was estimated by direct pore-
115 level simulations (DPLS) to determine the influence of changing microstructure. DPLS
116 determined the effective thermal conductivity by solving the governing steady-state heat
117 conduction equations within the solid phase and the stagnant fluid phase (Kaempfer et
118 al., 2005; Petrasch et al., 2008; Calonne et al., 2011; Löwe et al., 2013). (and of which sizes)

Specify if $7.2 \times 7.2 \times 7.2 \text{ mm}^3$ samples or subsamples have been used for the computations described between 109 and 119.

120 3. Results

121 Time-lapse tomographic scans were performed with temperature gradients between
122 43-53 K m^{-1} (Table 1). Small fluctuations of the measured inlet and outlet temperature

during the 108h experiment

X

123 were due to temperature regulation both inside the cold chamber and inside the micro-
 124 CT (Ebner et al., 2014). A shift of $\Delta t < 10$ min between inlet and outlet temperature in-
 125 dicated that a fast equilibrium between the temperature of the snow and the airflow was
 126 reached (Albert and Hardy, 1995; Ebner et al., 2015b). The morphological evolution
 127 was similar between all four experiments and only a slight rounding and coarsening was
 128 visually observed, shown in (Fig. 2). The initial ice grains did not change with time and
 129 the locations of sublimation and deposition for “ota3” and “ota4” is shown in Fig. 3.
 130 Sublimation of 7.7 % and 7.6 % of the ice matrix and deposition of 6.0 % and 9.6 % on
 131 the ice matrix were observed. The data were extracted by superposition of vertical
 132 cross-sections at 0 and 108 hours with an uncertainty of 6%. The mass sublimated pref-
 133 erentially at locations of the ice matrix with low radii and was relocated leading to a
 134 smoothing of the ice surface and to an increase in the size of pores (Fig. 4 a)). The pore
 135 size (uncertainty ~ 6 %) increased by 3.4 %, 3.6 %, 5.4 % and 6.5 % for ‘ota1’, ‘ota2’,
 136 ‘ota3’, and ‘ota4’, respectively.

137 Loss of ice due to sublimation could not be detected by the micro-CT scans due to
 138 limited accuracy and no flow rate dependence was observed during any of the four ex-
 139 periments. The temporal evolution of the porosity, shown in Fig. 4 b), did not change
 140 with time and the influence of sublimation of water vapor was not observed. Only ‘ota2’
 141 showed a slight drop in the temporal evolution of the porosity until 18 h into the exper-
 142 iment but kept constant afterwards. This slight drop (≈ 0.5 %) was probably caused by
 143 settling of the snow. Coarsening was observed for each experiment but the influence of
 144 changing airflow was not visible, confirmed by the temporal SSA evolution, shown in
 145 Fig. 4 c).

146 The repositioning of water molecules led to a smoothing of the ice grains, but did
 147 not affect the thermal conductivity of snow. This quantity (standard deviation ~ 0.025 W
 148 m^{-1}) slightly increased after applying airflow to the temperature gradient, shown in Fig.
 149 4 d), but no flow rate dependence was observed. Every third scan was used to extract
 150 the thermal conductivity and a change of -2.6 %, 3.6 %, 2.2 %, and 2.7 % for ‘ota1’,
 151 ‘ota2’, ‘ota3’, and ‘ota4’ was detected.

152

153 **5. Discussion**

154 The rate of deposition onto the ice surface depends on the flow rate where warm
 155 saturated air cooled down while flowing through the sample, as shown in previous ex-

156 periments (Ebner et al., 2015b). Its deposition rate asymptotically reached a maximum
 157 of $1.05 \cdot 10^{-4} \text{ kg m}^{-3} \text{ s}^{-1}$. In this study, changing the temperature gradient leads to a
 158 warming up of a cold saturated flow, and resulted in a sublimation rate too small for the
 159 analyzed period of the experiment to measure a flow rate dependence by the micro-CT
 160 and an influence on the temporal density gradient. A smoothing of ice grains and an in-
 161 crease of the pore space was measured but the airflow velocity did not affect the reloca-
 162 tion process of water molecules.

Abuse
 X redundant-information?

163 A structural change of the ice grains and repositions of water molecules was ob-
 164 served but the total net flux of the snow was not affected. The superposition of a vertical
 165 cross-section in Fig. 3 shows a big effect on reposition of water molecules on the ice
 166 structure. However, the temporal porosity (Fig. 4 b) was not affected and the total water
 167 vapor net flux was negligible for the analyzed volume. Continued sublimation and dep-
 168 osition of water molecules due to the temperature gradient led to a saturation of the pore
 169 space. The vapour pressure of the air in the pore was in equilibrium with the water pres-
 170 sure of the ice, given by the local temperature. The entering air warmed up, allowing
 171 vapour sublimating from the snow sample to be incorporated into the airflow. As time
 172 passed, the snow grains in the sample became more rounded as convexities sublimated.
 173 As a result of the reduced curvature, the rate of sublimation decreased and less vapour
 174 was deposited in concavities and therefore the surface asperities persisted longer. Final-
 175 ly, the "Kelvin-effect" had a longer impact on the structural change of the ice grains and
 176 the reposition of water molecules. In addition, the uptake of water molecules and their
 177 transport due to warming during advection was counteracted by diffusion of water mol-
 178 ecules due to the temperature gradient. As thermally induced diffusion was opposite to
 179 the airflow gradient, a backflow of water vapor occurred and the two opposite fluxes
 180 counteracted each other. The Peclet numbers ($Pe = u_D \cdot d_{\text{mean}} / D$, where D is the diffusion
 181 coefficient of water vapor in air), describing the ratio of mass transfer between diffusion
 182 and advection, measured during each experiment, showed that diffusion was still domi-
 183 nant (Table 1). Therefore, water molecules were diffused along the opposite direction to
 184 the temperature gradient and advected along the flow direction leading to a back and
 185 forth transport of water molecules.

pore size (porosity is constant.)

X

186 As a Peclet higher than 1 is not possible in snow (Ebner et al., 2015a), advection of
 187 cold saturated air into a slightly warmer snowpack has a significant influence not on the
 188 total net mass change but on the structural change of the ice grains due to redistribution

Based on the preceding explanations, it seems that these observations can occur either when sublimation is diffusion limited or when it is "reaction"-limited (see comment # 2)

personally not convinced by argumentation

189 of water vapour on the ice matrix. Also the increasing pore size has an influence on the
190 flow field leading to a deceleration of the flow and therefore the interaction of an air-
191 parcel with the ice matrix in the pores increases due to higher residence time. In addi-
192 tion, the diffusive transport rises whereas the advective transport decreases changing the
193 mass transport in the pores. Our results support the hypothesis of Neumann et al. (2009)
194 that sublimation is limited by vapor diffusion into the pore space rather than sublimation
195 at crystal faces. This is supported by the temporal evolution of the porosity (Fig. 4 b))
196 and the SSA (Fig. 4 c)), as no velocity dependence was observed and the structural
197 changes were too small to be detected by the micro-CT.

198 The influence of diffusion of water vapor in the direction of the temperature gradi-
199 ent and the influence of the residence time of an air-parcel in the pores were also con-
200 firmed by a low mass change at the ice-air interface. Overlapping two consecutive 3D
201 images, the order of magnitude of freshly sublimated ice was detected. The absolute
202 mass change at the ice-air interface ($\text{kg m}^{-3} \text{s}^{-1}$) estimated by the experimental results is
203 defined as

204
$$S_{m,\text{exp}} = \left| \rho_i \frac{\Delta(1-\varepsilon)}{\Delta t} \right| \quad (1)$$

205 where $\Delta(1-\varepsilon)$ is the change in the porosity between two images separated by the time
206 step Δt , and ρ_i is the density of ice. Albert and McGilvary (1992) and Neumann et al.
207 (2009) presented a model to calculate sublimation rates directly in an aggregate snow
208 sample

209
$$S_m = |h_m SA_v (\rho_{\text{sat}} - \rho_v)| \quad (2)$$

210 where SA_v is the specific surface area per volume of snow, and h_m is the mass-transfer
211 coefficient (m s^{-1}) given by Neumann et al., (2009)

212
$$h_m = (0.566 \cdot \text{Re} + 0.075) \cdot 10^{-3} \quad (3)$$

213 assuming that the sublimation occurs within the first few mm of the sample. Re ($\text{Re} =$
214 $u_D \cdot d_{\text{mean}} / \nu$ where ν is the kinematic viscosity of the air) is the corresponding Reynolds-
215 number of the flow. The absolute sublimation rate is driven by the difference between
216 the local vapor density (ρ_v) and the saturation vapor density (ρ_{sat}) (Neumann et al., 2009;
217 Thorpe and Mason, 1966). Table 2 shows the estimated absolute sublimation rate by the
218 experiment (Eq. (1)) and the model (Eq. (2)). The very small change in porosity due to
219 densification during the first 18 h for 'ota2' was not taken into account. The estimated
220 sublimation rates by the experiment were two orders of magnitude lower than the mod-

221 eled values and also two orders of magnitude lower than during a negative temperature
 222 gradient along an airflow experiment (Ebner et al., 2015b). As the air in the pore space
 223 is always saturated (Neumann et al., 2009), the back diffusion of water vapor in the op-
 224 posite direction of the temperature gradient led to a lower mass transfer rate of sublima-
 225 tion. The flow rate dependence for the model described is shown by the mass-transfer
 226 coefficient (Eq. 3), increasing with higher airflow. However, the values calculated from
 227 the experiment showed a different trend. Increasing the flow rate led to a lower mass
 228 transfer rate due to a lower residence time of the air in the pores. Transfer of heat to-
 229 ward and water vapor away from the sublimating interface may also limit the sublima-
 230 tion rate. In general, the results of the model by Neumann et al. (2009) have to be inter-
 231 preted with care, as his model was set up to saturate dry air under isothermal conditions.
 232 Ice crystals sublimated as dry air enters the snow sample; water vapor was advected
 233 throughout the pore space by airflow until saturation vapor pressure was reached, pre-
 234 venting further sublimation. The model by Neumann et al. (2009) does not consider the
 235 influence of a temperature gradient and the additional vapor pressure gradient. Howev-
 236 er, our results concluded that a positive temperature gradient along the airflow has a
 237 significant impact on the sublimation rate decreasing the rate by two orders of magni-
 238 tude.

(X)

239 In the experiments by Neumann et al. (2009), sublimation of snow using dry air un-
 240 der isothermal condition showed a temperature drop for approximately the first 15 min
 241 after sublimation started and stayed constant because the latent heat absorption of sub-
 242 limation for a given flow rate and heat exchange with the sample chamber equalized
 243 each other. Such a temperature drop was not observed in our experiments. In the exper-
 244 iments by Neumann et al. (2009) the amount of energy used for sublimation was be-
 245 tween -10 and -40 J min⁻¹ for saturation of dry air. Using the expected mass change at
 246 the ice-air interface $S_{m,exp}$ (Eq. (1)) and the latent heat of sublimation ($L_{sub} \approx 2834.1 \cdot$
 247 10^3 J kg^{-1}) the energy needed for sublimation ranged between -2 and -12 J min⁻¹ for our
 248 experiments. Our estimated values are a factor up to five lower than the estimated num-
 249 bers of Neumann et al. (2009), because the entering air was already saturated (with ref-
 250 erence to the cold temperature) at the inlet. The needed energy for sublimation could be
 251 balanced between the sensible heat carried into and out of the sample, and the exchange
 252 of the snow sample with the air stream and the surrounding prevented a temperature
 253 drop.

254 Thermal conductivity changed insignificantly in these experiments, especially for
 255 'ota 1'. This indicates that air warming by a positive temperature gradient along the air-
 256 flow and an open system reduces or suppresses the increase in thermal conductivity
 257 usually observed by temperature gradient metamorphism (Loewe et al., 2013; Calonne
 258 et al., 2014). Compared to closed temperature gradient experiment, the applied tempera-
 259 ture gradient and the open system induced an air movement and therefore reduced the
 260 impact on the thermal conductivity, at least on the short term.

Handwritten notes:
 - *Unscates are quite different between experiments, also.*
 - *air movement should be negligible for data*
 - *It is useful to recall that thermal conductivity has been numerically estimated from the geometrical information of the sample only.*
 - *(no air movement taken into consideration)*

262 **6. Summary and conclusion**

263 We performed four experiments of temperature-gradient metamorphism of snow
 264 under saturated advective airflow during 108 h. Cold saturated air was blown into the
 265 snow samples and warmed up while flowing across the sample. The temperature gradi-
 266 ent varied between 43 and 53 K m⁻¹ and the snow microstructure was observed by X-ray
 267 micro-tomography every 3 h. The micro-CT scans were segmented, and porosity, spe-
 268 cific surface area, and the mean pore-size were calculated. Effective thermal conductivi-
 269 ty was calculated in direct pore-level simulations (DPLS).

270 Compared to deposition (shown in Ebner et al., 2015b), sublimation showed a small
 271 effect on the structural change of the ice matrix. A change in the pore size was most
 272 likely due to sublimation of ice crystals with small radii but a significant loss of water
 273 molecules of the snow sample and mass transfer away from the ice interface due to sub-
 274 limation and advective transport could not be detected by the micro-CT scans and no
 275 flow rate dependence was observed. The interaction of mass transport of advection and
 276 diffusion of water vapor in the opposite direction of the temperature gradient and the
 277 influence of the residence time of an air-parcel in the pores led to a negligible total mass
 278 change of the ice. However, a strong reposition of water molecules on the ice grains was
 279 observed.

280 The energy needed for sublimation was too low to see a significant temperature drop
 281 because the needed energy was balanced between the sensible heat carried into and out
 282 of the sample, and the exchange of the snow sample with the air stream and the sur-
 283 rounding.

284 This is the third paper of a series analyzing an advective airflow in a snowpack in
 285 depth of more than 1 cm. Previous work showed that: (1) under isothermal conditions,

286 the Kelvin-effect leads to a saturation of the pore space in the snow but did not affect
 287 the structural change (Ebner et al., 2015a); (2) applying a negative temperature gradient
 288 along the flow direction leads to a change in the microstructure and creation of whisker-
 289 like structures due to deposition of water molecules on the ice matrix (Ebner et al.,
 290 2015b); and (3) a positive temperature gradient along to the flow had a negligible total
 291 mass change of the ice but a strong reposition effect of water molecules on the ice
 292 grains, shown in this paper. Conditions (1) and (3) showed that they have a negligible
 293 effect on the porosity evolution of the ice matrix. *except when settling is concerned* Porosity changes can be neglected to
 294 improve models for snow compaction and evolution at the surface. In contrast, condi-
 295 tions (2) showed a significant impact on the structural evolution and seems to be essen-
 296 tial for such snowpack models and other numerical simulations. *mechanical processes like compaction strongly impact porosity.* Nevertheless, the strong
 297 reposition of water molecules on the ice grains observed for all conditions (1) – (3) can
 298 have a significant impact on atmospheric chemistry and isotopic changes in snow.

299

300 **Acknowledgements**

301 The Swiss National Science Foundation granted financial support under project Nr.
 302 200020-146540. The authors thank the reviewers E. A. Podolskiy and F. Flin for the
 303 constructive reviews and M. Jaggi, S. Grimm, H. Löwe for technical and modelling
 304 support.

305

306 **References**

307 Albert, M. R.: Effects of snow and firn ventilation on sublimation rates, *Annals of Glac-*
 308 *iology*, 35, 52-56, 2002.

309 Albert, M. R. and Hardy, J. P.: Ventilation experiments in a seasonal snow cover, in *Bi-*
 310 *ogeochemistry of Seasonally Snow-Covered Catchments*, IAHS Publ. 228, edited
 311 by K. A. Tonnessen, M. W. Williams, and M. Tranter, 41 –49, IAHS Press, Wall-
 312 ington, UK, 1995.

313 Albert, M. R. and McGilvary, W. R.: Thermal effects due to air flow and vapor
 314 transport in dry snow, *Journal of Glaciology*, 38, 273-281, 1992.

315 Box, J. E. and Steffen, K.: Sublimation on the Greenland ice sheet from automated
 316 weather station observations, *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 107, 33965-33981,
 317 2001.