

Interactive comment on “Climatic and topographic influences on glacier distribution in the Bhutan Himalaya” by H. Nagai et al.

T. Bolch (Editor)

tobias.bolch@geo.uzh.ch

Received and published: 11 June 2014

Dear Mr. Nagai, dear authors,

Both reviewers agree that the topic is in general of interest but identified several major shortcomings. Also the short comment provided was rather critical.

The major issues can be summarized as follows:

- There are major concerns regarding the PMS concept
- There is too much overlap with an earlier study published the similar authors
- There is some concern regarding the methodology to delineate the glaciers and the debris-covered portions

- The relation to climate is too simplistic
- There is a lack of rigorous statistical analysis to support the results.
- Several important studies were not considered especially with respect to debris cover.

I am not sure if it is possible to address all the raised issues in a reasonable amount of time. Therefor I suggest that you provide a detailed reply to the major comments and indicate how you are planning to address those. I will make then a decision based on these replies if I will further process the paper and recommend a revision of the manuscript.

Do not hesitate to ask in case you have any questions.

Best regards,

Tobias Bolch, Editor TC

Interactive comment on The Cryosphere Discuss., 8, 1305, 2014.

[Full Screen / Esc](#)

[Printer-friendly Version](#)

[Interactive Discussion](#)

[Discussion Paper](#)

