The Cryosphere Discuss., 7, C800–C801, 2013
www.the-cryosphere-discuss.net/7/C800/2013/

The Cryosphere
Discussions
Open Access

Interactive comment on "Snow density retrieval using SAR data: algorithm validation and applications in part of North Western Himalaya" *by* P. K. Thakur et al.

r. kelly (Editor)

rejkelly@uwaterloo.ca

Received and published: 17 June 2013

This is an interesting paper that offers insight into estimating snow density in the Himalaya using synthetic aperture radar observations. However, many of the research findings have previously appeared in publication in the Geocarto International (GI) journal article:

Praveen K. Thakur , S.P. Aggarwal , P.K. Garg , R.D. Garg , Sneh Mani , Ankur Pandit & Sanjeev Kumar (2012): Snow physical parameters estimation using space- based Synthetic Aperture Radar, Geocarto International, 27:3, 263-288

While the submitted work to TC/TCD is a little narrower in scope, the results are con-

tained within the above paper. Several of the figures are duplicates of the GI paper or have been very slightly adjusted. This includes at least one substantive and key results figure in the TC paper (Fig 6) that is a copy of Figure 21 in the GI paper. In addition, significant portions of the text including the introduction, the section on backscatter from snow, and the sections detailing the study area, methods, and conclusions have all been copied verbatim. For example: Line 18 on p1928 to line 9 on p1929 is an exact copy of the introduction in the Geocarto paper. And, section 1.1 in TCD is a word for word copy from Section 1.2 in GI paper.

Unfortunately, therefore, with respect to the TC/TCD evaluation criteria above, the paper cannot be viewed favorably with respect to the TC/TCD criteria of Originality, Scientific Quality and Significance, since the work has previously been published. The paper should, therefore, be withdrawn from the journal.

The authors should be encouraged to consider extension of the research and, in the light of a previous review, resubmit new work that constitutes new knowledge to this important field.

Interactive comment on The Cryosphere Discuss., 7, 1927, 2013.