

***Interactive comment on “Brief communication
“The 2013 Erebus Glacier tongue calving event””
by C. L. Stevens et al.***

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 10 June 2013

The manuscript presents a description of a calving event and the following drift of the calved iceberg based mainly on a series of satellite images. An attempt is made to relate this event to previous - sparsely documented - other events, and to deduce 'useful' ocean currents from this single iceberg drift. Despite the general clarity of the manuscript, I regret to say that I have a hard time feeling enthused by this study. At present, the manuscript reads to me as an interesting, well documented news article, but is lacking key scientific investigation ingredients: hypotheses, methodology and evidences. Is this study trying to identify key processes leading to the calving event in regard? If so, it did not succeed in eliminating some candidate processes, leaving the field to any possibilities. Is this study trying to gather informations about the ocean currents in the bay bathing the glacier tongue? If so I do not think the drift from one iceberg at one point in time constitutes a great advance.

C757

(i) calving events are known to happen and do not constitute in and out of themselves publication material; (ii) no observations other than satellite photos are used, and no advanced methodology is brought forward, keeping all the authors conclusions (correct or not) at the level of suppositions; (iii) no significant gain is made in terms of knowledge, methodology or theory in the present study.

Unless the authors can provide significant improvements by clearly laying out scientific hypotheses and attempt to answers them, I am afraid I cannot recommend this work for publication.

Interactive comment on The Cryosphere Discuss., 7, 1749, 2013.