

## General comment:

The paper “The snowdrift effect on snow deposition: insights from a comparison of a snow pit profile and meteorological observations” describes the analysis of 3 years of accumulated snow record from eco-sounding data and by chemical/isotopic dating, obtained from The “Eagle” AWS site (76° 25' S, 77° 01' E; 2852 m a.s.l.), placed ~ 500 km far from Dome A drilling core site. The comparison between the two datasets highlights a difference between the two dating results of up to 12 months. The authors suppose that the discrepancy is linked to the snowdrift processes which are not well detected and/or taken into account in snow pit/ice core dating. Finally the authors observe that the same type of error can influence the information provided by the Dome A ice core project, claiming the similarity of the two studied sites.

Even if the paper addresses a relevant scientific question about the interaction between Atmosphere and Cryosphere, the results are not sufficient to support the presented thesis, and not negligible lacks in the paper flow corrupt interpretations and conclusions. In conclusion the entire work should be heavily reviewed in both data analysis and paper structure before be reconsidered for publication on “The Cryosphere”.

## Major Comments:

- Authors completely overlook the large errors present in snow accumulation dating using chemical/isotopic analysis. I wonder if authors are able to date snow accumulation at Eagle site ( $60 \text{ kg m}^{-2} \text{ yr}^{-1}$ , Ding et al., 2011) with an error equal or less than one year. The stake farm measurements demonstrate that accumulation hiatuses and/or erosion can occur at sites with accumulation rates below  $120 \text{ kg m}^{-2} \text{ yr}^{-1}$  (Frezzotti et al., 2005, 2007; Ding et al., 2011). The differences between the cores and stakes can lead to the statistical misidentification of annual layers determined from seasonal signals at sites with SMB rates below  $200 \text{ kg m}^{-2} \text{ yr}^{-1}$ , due to the inability to detect higher and lower values. With an average roughness height of 20-40 cm, achieving  $\pm 10\%$  accuracy in the reconstruction of the SMB from single cores requires high accumulations ( $>700 \text{ kg m}^{-2} \text{ yr}^{-1}$ ). Low-accumulation sites are representative if their cumulative rates are computed over several years. Moreover seasonal cycles are difficult to observe in sites characterized by accumulation rate below  $70 \text{ kg m}^{-2} \text{ yr}^{-1}$  (Frezzotti et al., 2013).
- The third section is not clear and it should be rewritten. Post depositional processes are not well described and a lot of references representing the state of the art are missing ( e.g. Das et al. 2013; Frezzotti et al. 2013; Lenaert et al.2012a, 2012b, 2012c ). The Authors should provide a quantification of sublimation effects (surface and snowdrift sublimation, e.g. Van den Broeke et al., 2004) and snowdrift transport (see Mann et al. 2000). The authors should better explain how they obtain Temperature

from chemical/isotopic data (why in fig 6 there isn't a plot of temperature measured by AWS ?). All the Results should be discussed in relation to accumulation data, meteorological parameters and modeled snowfall (for example ECMWF or NCEP or other) in order to quantify the snow redistribution component.

- If the Authors believe that the Eagle site is similar to Dome A site in terms of accumulation condition they should demonstrate it for example giving more emphasis to and/or improve the discussion presented in Ding et al. (2011).

### Minor Comments:

At this stage, it is premature to provide an extensive list of minor corrections, most of which should be addressed prior to submission through careful proofreading of the manuscript.

--Figure 6 is a key figure for the paper but it could be greatly improved. Why eco sounder and wind speed data are presented with different sampling? In this form it is not possible for the readers to make a correlation. It could be helpful to plot also other meteorological parameters (e.g. relative humidity, Temperature) and forecasted snowfall from model in order to help the readers to discriminate snowfall and snowdrift effects on eco sounder data.

--All the Acronyms should be defined the first time the authors use them.

-- Define the longitude and latitude of each site described in the text.

--PAG 1420 line 17-18. Delete or rewrite “..”sublimation can still be recorded by an ultrasonic sounder (Scarchilli et al., 2008, 2010). Scarchilli et al. 2008 and 2010 do not say that. The ultrasonic sounder can only measure variation of snow surface height.

--PAG 1421 line 2. Delete “...with a maximum value of 0.1-0.2mm d<sup>-1</sup> around the Talos Dome (Scarchilli et al., 2008)”. Scarchilli et al 2008 deal with Mid Point site (MdPt, 75° 32' S, 145° 51' E, 2510 m a.s.l.), which is a remote site on the Terra Nova Bay - Dome C route, and not Talos Dome (72° 46' S, 159° 2' E, 2384 m a.s.l.). The maximum value of calculated blowing snow sublimation for MdPt site is 0.4-0.6 mm w.e. d<sup>-1</sup> and not 0.1-0.2 mm d<sup>-1</sup> (see fig. 2 Scarchilli et al. 2008)

--PAG 1423 line 10. In a logical flow Fig 7a should be defined and described before Fig. 7b .

--PAG 1423 line 17. Is the correlation Coefficient R between temperature and  $\delta^{18}O$  statistically significant? Otherwise the Authors cannot say that there is a linear correlation.

## References:

Das, I., R. E. Bell, T. A. Scambos, M. Wolovick, T. T. Creyts, M. Studinger, N. Frearson, et al. "Influence of Persistent Wind Scour on the Surface Mass Balance of Antarctica." *Nature Geosci* 6, no. 5 (05//print 2013): 367-71, 2013

Ding, M. H., Xiao, C. D., Li, Y. S., Ren, J. W., Hou, S. G., Jin, B., and Sun, B.: Spatial variability of surface mass balance along a traverse route from Zhongshan station to Dome A, Antarctica, *J. Glaciol.*, 57, 658-666, doi: 10.3189/002214311797409820 , 2011

Frezzotti, M., Scarchilli, C., Becagli, S., Proposito, M., and Urbini, S.: A synthesis of the Antarctic surface mass balance during the last 800 yr, *The Cryosphere*, 7, 303-319, doi:10.5194/tc-7-303-2013, 2013

Frezzotti, M., Urbini, S., Proposito, M., Scarchilli, C., and Gandolfi, S.: Spatial and temporal variability of surface mass balance near Talos Dome, East Antarctica, *J. Geophys. Res.*, 2011, F02032, doi:10.1029/2006JF000638, 2007.

Frezzotti M, Pourchet M, Flora O, Gandolfi S, Gay M, Urbini S, Vincent C, Becagli S, Gragnani R, Proposito M, Severi M, Traversi R, Udisti R, Fily M, Spatial and temporal variability of snow accumulation in East Antarctica from traverse data. *J Glaciol* 51(172):113-124. doi:10.3189/172756505781829502, 2005

Lenaerts, J. T. M., M. R. van den Broeke, W. J. van de Berg, E. van Meijgaard and P. Kuipers Munneke: A new, high-resolution surface mass balance map of Antarctica (1979-2010) based on regional atmospheric climate modeling, *Geophysical Research Letters* 39, L04501, doi:10.1029/2011GL050713, 2012a.

Lenaerts, J. T. M., M. R. van den Broeke, C. Scarchilli and C. Agosta: Impact of model resolution on simulated wind, drifting snow and surface mass balance in Terre Adélie, East Antarctica, *Journal of Glaciology* 58, 821-829, doi:10.3189/2012JoG12J020, 2012b.

Lenaerts, J. T. M., and M. R. van den Broeke: Modeling drifting snow in Antarctica with a regional climate model: 2. Results, *Journal of Geophysical Research* 117, D05109, doi:10.1029/2010JD015419, 2012c.

Mann, G. W., Anderson, P. S., and Mobbs, S. D.: Profile measurements of blowing snow at Halley, Antarctica, *J. Geophys. Res.*, 105, 24491-24508, 2000

Scarchilli, C., Frezzotti, M., Grigioni, P., De Silvestri, L., Agnoletto, L., and Dolci, S.: Extraordinary blowing snow transport events in East Antarctica, *Clim. Dynam.*, 34, 1195-1206, 15 doi: 10.1007/s00382-009-0601-0, 2010

Scarchilli, C., Frezzotti, M., Didonfrancesco, G., Valt, M., Urbini, S., De Silvestri, L., Dolci, S., Iacarina, A., and Grigioni, P.: The impact of precipitation and sublimation processes on snow accumulation: preliminary results, *Terra Antarct. Publ.*, 14, 47-50, 2008.

Van den Broeke, M. R., C. H. Reijmer and R. S. W. van de Wal: A study of the surface mass balance in Dronning Maud Land, Antarctica, using automatic weather stations, *Journal of Glaciology* 50, 565-582, 2004