

Interactive comment on “Two independent methods for mapping the grounding line of an outlet glacier – example from the Astrolabe Glacier, Terre Adélie, Antarctica” by E. Le Meur et al.

J. L. Bamber (Editor)

j.bamber@bristol.ac.uk

Received and published: 13 March 2014

Dear Emmanuel and co-authors,

I have read the referees' comments, their report and your response. They raise some critical issues and concerns about your analysis and the interpretation of the data you have. They both recommend re-review after major revisions and provide you with a lot of helpful and quite detailed feedback. Your response goes some way toward addressing the comments but i) contains many typographical errors which does not instil

C3425

confidence and ii) does not address the complete list of queries and issues raised. Referee 1 makes a number of specific comments (not just changing a word here or there but substantial points) in the section “Scientific comments” which you appear to have entirely ignored in your posted response. For example, P3972, I24-27, P3973, I5-6, P3973, I27-P3974, P3974 I7-13, P3979, I9-11, P3979, I7-18, P3979, I20-21 and so on. Both referees have spent a considerable amount of time and effort providing you with constructive feedback on how to improve this work.

It is normal, and expected, that authors respond to all points that require one: that is any that require more than the change of a word or fixing a typo. Most authors provide a response to all comments, including grammatical queries. You have not done this, which makes it impossible to determine your response to valid concerns and comments. As it stands, you have provided a partial response. If you wish to submit a revised manuscript and you want it to be considered for publication in TC I would ask that you provide a clear and reliable response to all the queries raised. In addition, ensure that, in a supplement to your full response, you also provide a revised manuscript pdf which is highlighted where changes have been made.

Interactive comment on The Cryosphere Discuss., 7, 3969, 2013.

C3426