

Interactive comment on “Snow density retrieval using SAR data: algorithm validation and applications in part of North Western Himalaya” by P. K. Thakur et al.

r. kelly (Referee)

rejkelly@uwaterloo.ca

Received and published: 15 July 2013

As has been previously communicated to the authors, this TCD paper is in many major respects very similar/identical to work published in the previous paper:

Praveen K. Thakur , S.P. Aggarwal , P.K. Garg , R.D. Garg , Sneh Mani , Ankur Pandit & Sanjeev Kumar (2012): Snow physical parameters estimation using space-based Synthetic Aperture Radar, *Geocarto International*, 27:3, 263-288

While the submitted work to TC/TCD is a little narrower in scope, the results are contained within the above paper. Several of the figures are carbon copies of the Geocarto International paper or have been very slightly adjusted. This includes at least one sub-
C1087

stantive and key results figure in their submitted paper (Fig 6) that is a carbon copy of one in the Geocarto International paper (Fig 21). In addition, large portions of the text including the introduction, the section on backscatter from snow, and the sections detailing the study area, methods, and conclusions have all been copied verbatim from the previous paper. For example:

-Lines 18 on p.1928 to line 9 on p.1929 is a carbon copy of the introduction the Geocarto International paper. -Section 1.1 in TCD is a word for word copy from Section 1.2 in Geocarto International paper.

Unfortunately, therefore, with respect to the TC/TCD evaluation criteria for TC, the paper cannot be viewed favourably with respect to the Originality, Scientific Quality and Significance (since the work has already been published). Unfortunately, I have no further choice, therefore, than to recommend that the paper be rejected from TC/TCD.

Interactive comment on The Cryosphere Discuss., 7, 1927, 2013.