The Cryosphere Discuss., 6, 4897–4938, 2012 www.the-cryosphere-discuss.net/6/4897/2012/ doi:10.5194/tcd-6-4897-2012 © Author(s) 2012. CC Attribution 3.0 License.



This discussion paper is/has been under review for the journal The Cryosphere (TC). Please refer to the corresponding final paper in TC if available.

Influence of ablation-related processes in the built-up of simulated Northern Hemisphere ice sheets during the last glacial cycle

S. Charbit¹, C. Dumas¹, M. Kageyama¹, D. M. Roche¹, and C. Ritz²

¹IPSL/Laboratoire des sciences du climat et de l'environnement, CEA-CNRS-UVSQ UMR8212, CE Saclay, Orme des Merisiers, Bât. 701, 91191 Gif-sur-Yvette cedex, France ²UJF – Grenoble 1/CNRS, Laboratoire de glaciologie et de géophysique de l'environnement, UMR5183, Grenoble, F38041, France

Received: 4 October 2012 - Accepted: 1 November 2012 - Published: 28 November 2012

Correspondence to: S. Charbit (sylvie.charbit@lsce.ipsl.fr)

Published by Copernicus Publications on behalf of the European Geosciences Union.

iscus	TCD		
sion Pa	6, 4897–4938, 2012		
per Discussion	Influence of ablation-related processes S. Charbit et al.		
Pape	Title Page		
Pr	Abstract	Introduction	
	Conclusions	References	
iscussi	Tables	Figures	
on Pa	14	►I.	
aper	•	F	
_	Back	Close	
Discus	Full Screen / Esc		
sion	Printer-friendly Version		
Pap	Interactive	Discussion	
D		•	

Abstract

Since the original formulation of the positive-degree-day (PDD) method, different PDD calibrations have been proposed in the literature in response to the increasing number of observations. Although these formulations provide a satisfactory description of the

- ⁵ present-day Greenland geometry, they have not all been tested for paleo ice sheets. Using the climate-ice sheet model CLIMBER-GRISLI coupled with different PDD models, we evaluate how the parameterization of the ablation may affect the evolution of Northern Hemisphere ice sheets in the transient simulations of the last glacial cycle. Results from fully coupled simulations are compared to time-slice experiments carried
- out at different key periods of the last glacial period. We find large differences in the simulated ice sheets according to the chosen PDD model. These differences occur as soon as the onset of glaciation, therefore affecting the subsequent evolution of the ice system. To further investigate how the PDD method controls this evolution, special attention is given to the role of each PDD parameter. We show that glacial inception is
- critically dependent on the representation of the impact of the temperature variability from the daily to the inter-annual time scale, whose effect is modulated by the refreezing scheme. Finally, an additional set of sensitivity experiments has been carried out to assess the relative importance of melt processes with respect to initial ice sheet configuration in the construction and the evolution of past Northern Hemisphere ice sheets.
- ²⁰ Our analysis reveals that the impacts of the initial ice sheet condition may range from quite negligible to explaining about half of the LGM ice volume depending on the representation of stochastic temperature variations which remain the main driver of the evolution of the ice system.

1 Introduction

²⁵ Simulating the surface mass balance of polar ice sheets correctly is crucial to better understand climate and ice sheet feedbacks at decadal to multi-millennial time scales



and to better predict the evolution of present-day ice sheets in the coming decades. The surface mass balance is defined as the difference between the net accumulation and the melt rate of snow and ice over a year. The ablation of snow and ice is closely linked to the energy balance at the surface of the ice sheets. Several processes strongly in-

- ⁵ fluence the energy exchanges at the surface-atmosphere interface. As an example, in addition to solar radiation and cloud optical properties that directly influence the nearsurface air temperatures (Key et al., 2001; van den Broecke et al., 2008), katabatic winds may have a huge impact on turbulent heat transfer (Oerlemans and Hoogendoorn, 1989; van den Broecke et al., 1994). The energy balance is also a function
- of surface characteristics and snow properties, such as roughness length, snow temperature, snow density, shape and size of grains, water content in the snowpack and snow and ice albedo (Brun et al., 1989, 1992). This underlines the need for having an accurate representation of snow and atmospheric processes to properly compute the energy balance at the surface of the ice sheets (Gallée and Duynkerke, 1997). How-
- ever, such a representation requires a detailed snow model and a climate model having a resolution equivalent to or finer than the spatial scale needed to accurately resolve the ablation zone (i.e. ~ 10 km; van den Broecke et al., 2008). The horizontal resolution of current climate models is far beyond this limit and, owing to their high computational cost, the use of regional atmospheric models (Lefebre et al., 2005; Ettema et al., 2009; Fettweis, 2007, 2011, 2012) is impossible for integrations spanning over centuries or
- millennia.

An alternative approach consists in using the positive-degree-day (PDD) method. This method was first applied to alpine glaciers in the late 19th century (Finsterwalder and Schunk, 1887). Observations recorded by Braithwaite and Olesen (1989) in ice-

²⁵ margin locations in Western Greenland highlighted a strong correlation between ablation and mean surface air temperature. Relying on this work, Reeh (1991) proposed a new formulation of the PDD method that can be used for the whole Greenland ice sheet: the amount of positive-degree-days is converted in melt rates of snow and ice through degree-day factors (DDF) in combination with a meltwater retention/refreezing



scheme and the fluctuations of temperature around the daily mean are accounted for (see Sect. 2). Due to its simplicity, the PDD method has been widely used in mass balance computations and has been favorably compared to observations (Huybrechts et al., 1991; Ritz et al., 1997, 2001). It has also been widely used in paleo-climatic
contexts to study the ice-sheet response to a given climatic evolution (Abe-Ouchi et al., 2007; Charbit et al., 2002, 2007; Graversen et al., 2010; Greve, 2005; Stone et al., 2010; Zweck and Huybrechts, 2005) or to study the climate-ice sheet feedbacks (Bonelli et al., 2009; Charbit et al., 2005; Kageyama et al., 2004; Philippon et al., 2006; Swingedouw et al., 2008; Vizcaino et al., 2008).

- ¹⁰ However, according to a compilation of measurements carried out over several European and Greenland glaciers, it appears that DDF values largely differ from one location to the other (Braithwaite and Zhang, 2000; Hock, 2003) making questionable the use of one single DDF value to compute snow or ice melt rates. As a consequence, numerous attempts to improve the early formulation of Reeh (1991) have then been
- proposed. These attempts include the representation of the refreezing process (Pfeffer et al., 1991; Janssens and Huybrechts, 2000), the calibration of new degree-day factors (Braithwaithe, 1995; Tarasov and Peltier, 2002), and more recently a new parameterization of the standard distribution of surface air temperatures (Fausto et al., 2009). The net consequence is that a growing number of PDD formulations appears in the
- ²⁰ literature. Although these formulations are calibrated against small-scale observations of present-day Greenland based on different sampling data, they have usually been revealed successful for the large-scale representation of the ice sheet geometry despite some regional deficiencies. However, with the exception of Reijmer et al. (2012) who compared different refreezing schemes with outputs from a regional atmospheric
- climate model, no PDD inter-comparison has been undertaken so far. It is therefore difficult to evaluate the performance and the efficiency of each PDD parameterization for present-day ice sheets. Moreover, as recently outlined by van de Berg et al. (2011), the calibration of the PDD models against present-day Greenland is not necessarily valuable in paleoclimatic contexts for which insolation conditions, seasonal and spatial



climatic variability, snow metamorphism and locations and shapes of ice sheets were rather different from those observed for modern days. The problem becomes even more complex for studies carried out with a coupled climate-ice sheet model where the climate-ice sheet feedbacks may amplify or mitigate the effect of temperature forcing.

⁵ There is therefore a crucial need for further refinement of temperature-melt models used in different climatic contexts.

In this study, we test several PDD formulations in the simulation of the last glacial cycle. Here, the PDD approach is used as a tool to evaluate the relative importance of both ice-sheet initial configuration and ablation-related processes in the built-up of Northern Hemisphere ice sheets throughout this period. To achieve this goal, we first

- Northern Hemisphere ice sheets throughout this period. To achieve this goal, we first test the sensitivity of the surface mass balance of Northern Hemisphere ice sheets to different PDD formulations and we evaluate the impact of each PDD parameter in this response. Secondly, through a set of sensitivity experiments, we investigate the relative impact of the ice-sheet feedbacks onto the climate (i.e. through a change of initial ice-
- ¹⁵ sheet geometry) and therefore on the evolution of the ice system, with respect to the way the ablation is computed.

2 PDD formulations

2.1 The early standard PDD formulation

The PDD method has first been proposed by Reeh (1991). In this formulation, the total amount of positive degree-days represents the sum over one year of all probabilities for having positive temperatures. Therefore, this number can be considered as a melt potential and is expressed as a normal distribution given by:

$$PDD = \frac{1}{\sigma\sqrt{2\pi}} \int_{1 \text{ yr}} dt \int_{0}^{T_{d}+2.5\sigma} \exp\left[-\frac{\left(T - T_{d}(t)^{2}\right)}{2\sigma^{2}}\right] dT$$

$$4901$$
(1)

Discussion Paper TCD 6, 4897-4938, 2012 Influence of ablation-related processes **Discussion** Paper S. Charbit et al. **Title Page** Introduction Abstract Conclusions References **Discussion** Paper **Figures** Back **Discussion** Paper Full Screen / Esc Printer-friendly Version Interactive Discussion

where T_d represents the daily temperature, and σ the standard deviation of the temperature distribution. The average annual temperature cycle is assumed to follow a cosine function with an amplitude given by the difference between mean summer (T_{ija}) and mean annual (T_{ann}) air temperatures and a period *A* of 1 yr. Therefore, the mean daily temperature is expressed as:

$$T_{\rm d}(t) = T_{\rm ann}(t) + \left(T_{\rm jja} - T_{\rm ann}\right) \cos\frac{2\pi t}{A} \tag{2}$$

5

It is generally assumed that σ represents the deviations from the mean daily temperature. These random fluctuations are important because they may cause the occurrence of positive temperatures (and hence surface melting) even though the mean daily temperature is below the freezing point. In the standard formulation of Reeh (1991), σ is set to 5 °C. In practice, especially for uses in paleoclimatic contexts, this parameter accounts for the overall stochastic variations of temperatures such as those occurring at the inter-annual time scale.

Observations at West Greenland locations revealed a high correlation between air temperatures and melt rates (Braithwaite and Olesen, 1989). Melting of snow and ice is therefore linearly related to the number of PDD through the degree-day factors C_{snow} and C_{ice} for snow and ice, respectively. To account for albedo difference between snow and ice, C_{snow} and C_{ice} have different values. Following observations of Braithwaite and Olesen (1989) and Braithwaithe (1995) the standard C_{snow} and C_{ice} were fixed to 3 mm w.e °C⁻¹ d⁻¹ and 8 mm w.e. °C⁻¹ d⁻¹, respectively.

Meltwater produced at the surface may refreeze or may percolate in the snowpack and forms superimposed ice. In the early PDD formulation (Reeh, 1991), the maximum amount of superimposed ice (Pmax) cannot exceed 60 % of the amount of water coming from melting of the annual snowfall. Although the Pmax value has been chosen

²⁵ ing from melting of the annual snowfall. Although the Pmax value has been chosen somewhat arbitrarily, this choice leads to estimates of firn warming due to meltwater refreezing in reasonable agreement with observations (Reeh, 1991).

Following this model, the melting of snow and ice follows a three-step process: (1) snow is first melted at the rate C_{snow} . Meltwater percolates into the snowpack and





refreezes at depth. Runoff occurs when the amount of superimposed ice exceeds 60% of the yearly snowfall. (2) Superimposed ice is then melted. (3) Glacier ice is melted. This process can be interrupted at any of the stages 1–3, depending on the available energy, that is on the amount of PDD.

5 2.2 Dependency of degree-day factors on temperature

Since the early PDD formulation proposed by Reeh (1991), new observational data have become available, such as the GIMEX (Oerlemans and Vugts, 1993) and the Camp IV (Ambach, 1988) experimental campaigns launched to improve the understanding of processes governing the ice-sheet mass balance. These experiments revealed a strong dependency of DDF (especially for ice material) with temperature, and values of C_{ice} as high as ~ 18–20 mm w.e °C⁻¹ d⁻¹ were found at high elevations and in northern regions of Greenland. A compilation of positive degree-day factors at various locations can be found in Braithwaite and Zhang (2000) and Hock (2003). This wide range of DDF values has been attributed to temporal and spatial variations

- of energy balance characteristics reviewed in Hock (2003) and has been later confirmed by modeling studies carried out by Lefebre et al. (2002) for the 1991 melt season. These findings led several authors to refine the early PDD formulation. As an example, Greve (2000) introduced a latitudinal dependency of ice melt factors. Tarasov and Peltier (2002) added a dependency of DDF on mean summer temperature (see
 Sect. 3). Following Tarasov and Peltier (2002), Greve (2005) combined both latitudinal
- and temperature dependencies of DDF and derived a similar relation between DDF and the mean July near surface air temperature. This approach has also further been used by Fausto et al. (2009).

2.3 Revised treatment of meltwater retention

²⁵ A critical issue in ice-sheet mass balance studies is the percolation of surface meltwater which is then retained at depth and refreezes as superimposed ice. This process delays



and reduces the runoff and may induce large uncertainties in the estimation of glacier mass balance if not accounted for. A common way to deal with this retention process is to define the "potential retention fraction" (Pr) which represents the maximum of liquid water that can be refrozen before runoff occurs. The importance of this process has broadly been addressed in the literature through a variety of different retention models 5 (Fausto et al., 2009; Huybrechts and de Wolde, 1999; Janssens and Huybrechts, 2000; Pfeffer et al., 1991; Tarasov and Peltier, 2002). The lower bound model sets Pr to zero (i.e. no retention takes place). The approach followed by Reeh (1991) is one of the simplest: the potential retention fraction is given by a constant and spatially uniform fraction of the snowmelt (Pmax = 0.6) and is defined by:

 $Pr = Pmax \times Acc$

10

where Acc represents the annual snow accumulation.

- Huybrechts and de Wolde (1999) used a simple thermodynamic parameterization of the refreezing process in which the maximum amount of refrozen ice is related to the 15 amount of latent heat release needed to remove the cold content of snow of the upper ice sheet layers. When the maximum amount of superimposed ice is reached, any additional production of water coming from snowmelt or rainfall will escape as runoff. Janssens and Huybrechts (2000) went a step further and added to the formulation of
- Huybrechts and de Wolde (1999), a term accounting for refreezing of capillary water 20 filling the pore space in the snowpack. More recently Fausto et al. (2009) considered a retention/refreezing model, based on the formulation of Janssens and Huybrechts (2000) but with snow density varying as a function of time. This allows the densification effects to be accounted for (Zwally and Li, 2002). These effects may affect runoff
- through a reduction of both the thermal active layer thickness and the volume of the 25 pore storage for meltwater within the annual snow layer, decreasing thereby the ability of the snowpack to retain water.



(3)

2.4 PDD formulations adopted in the present study

Our approach aims at comparing the sensitivity of simulated ice sheets to three distinct PDD models dealing with PDD parameters (i.e. DDF factors, retention/refreezing scheme and standard deviation of temperatures) in a different way. The first model is exactly the same as the one proposed by Reeh (1991), referred hereafter as to RH91

exactly the same as the one proposed by Reeh (1991), referred hereafter as to RH91 (see Sect. 2.1 and Table 1). The second one is that used by Tarasov and Peltier (2002), and the third one is inspired by the study of Fausto et al. (2009). In the following, these models are respectively referred to as TP02 and FST09.

2.4.1 TP02 model

¹⁰ The standard deviation of temperature chosen in TP02 is $\sigma = 5.2$ °C, quite similar to that of RH91 ($\sigma = 5.0$ °C). The main characteristics of TP02 are that 1) snow and ice ablation factors (C_{snow} and C_{ice}) depend on mean summer temperature (Tjja) and 2) the refreezing scheme is similar to that proposed by Janssens and Huybrechts (2000).

$$C_{ice} = \begin{cases} 17.22 & \text{if } T_{jja} \le -1 \,^{\circ}\text{C} \\ 0.0067 \times (10 - T_{jja})^3 + 8.3 & \text{if } -1 \,^{\circ}\text{C} < T_{jja} < 10 \,^{\circ}\text{C} \\ 8.3 & \text{if } 10 \,^{\circ}\text{C} \le T_{jja} \end{cases}$$
(4)

$${}_{15} \quad C_{snow} = \begin{cases} 2.65 & \text{if } T_{jja} \le -1 \,^{\circ}\text{C} \\ 0.15 \times T_{jja} + 2.8 & \text{if } -1 \,^{\circ}\text{C} < T_{jja} < 10 \,^{\circ}\text{C} \\ 4.3 & \text{if } 10 \,^{\circ}\text{C} \le T_{jja} \end{cases}$$
(5)

 C_{ice} and C_{snow} are given in mm ice-equivalent $^{\circ}C^{-1} d^{-1}$.



The amount of superimposed ice (refrozen snow melt and frozen rain) for each year is given by:

$$\min \left[P - A + M, (A - M) \times \left(\frac{\rho_{e}}{\rho_{0}} - 1 \right) - d \times \frac{c}{L} \times \min \left(T_{jja}, 0^{\circ} C \right) \right] \quad \text{if } M < A$$
$$\min \left[P - A + M, d \times \frac{c}{L} \times \min \left(T_{jja}, 0^{\circ} C \right) \right] \quad \text{if } M > A$$

⁵ *c* and *L* are, respectively the specific heat capacity and the latent heat of fusion of ice. *P* is the total precipitation, *A* is the annual snow accumulation and *M* is the yearly snow-melt; *d* represents the thickness of the thermal active layer which is raised to the melting point by the latent heat released by the refreezing of meltwater. The quantities $\rho_0 = 300 \text{ kgm}^{-3}$ and $\rho_e = 960 \text{ kgm}^{-3}$ are respectively the densities of surface snow and water-saturated wet snow.

2.4.2 FST09 model

The temperature-dependent values of the C_{ice} parameter in the FST09 model are quite similar to those of the TP02 model:

$$C_{\text{ice}} = \begin{cases} 15.0 & \text{if } T_{\text{jja}} \le -1^{\circ}\text{C} \\ 0.006 \times (10 - T_{\text{jja}})^{3} + 7 & \text{if } -1^{\circ}\text{C} < T_{\text{jja}} < 10^{\circ}\text{C} \\ 7 & \text{if } 10^{\circ}\text{C} \le T_{\text{jja}} \end{cases}$$
(7)

15

In contrast to TP02, the C_{snow} value is constant and is set to the standard value of $3 \text{ mm}^{\circ}\text{C}^{-1} \text{ d}^{-1}$.

Using results based on their refreezing model accounting for densification effects, Fausto et al. (2009) demonstrated that the potential retention fraction is dependent on the elevation (see their Fig. 6), with almost no refreezing at low altitudes and 100% meltwater moved to superimposed ice at high altitudes. We therefore used this result to derive a simple parameterization of the maximum amount of superimposed ice



(6)

expressed as a function of the altitude *S* of the ice sheet:

 $Pmax = \begin{cases} 0 & \text{if } S \le 800 \text{ m} \\ (S - 800) \times 8.33 \times 10^{-4} & \text{if } 800 \text{ m} < S < 2000 \text{ m} \\ 1 & \text{if } S \ge 2000 \text{ m} \end{cases}$

The largest difference between FST09 and other models lies in the value of the standard deviation of temperature distribution. Values around 4.5-5.5 °C are commonly found in literature (Greve, 2005; Reeh, 1991; Ritz et al., 1997; Tarasov and Peltier, 1999, 2002). However, Fausto et al. (2009) argued that this parameter may vary considerably with geographic locations and altitude. Using observational data coming from automatic weather stations, they demonstrated that the altitudinal component dominated the amplitude of the standard deviation. In this study, we neglect the latitudinal and longitudinal dependencies and, following Fausto et al. (2009), we express σ as:

 $\sigma = 1.574 + 1.2224 \times 10^{-3} \times S$

This formulation implies a larger variability of temperatures with increasing altitude. As reported by Fausto et al. (2009), the surface temperature of a melting snow or ice surface is fixed to 0 °C limiting the variability of the near-surface air temperature. When no melt occurs such as in winter or in high elevation areas, surface temperature variations are not limited by the melting point temperature, allowing a larger variability of the near-surface temperature.

20 3 Models

The climate model used in this study, CLIMBER2.4, is a coupled atmosphere-ocean-vegetation model. It is a revised version of CLIMBER2.3 thoroughly described in Petoukhov et al. (2000).



(8)

(9)

The atmospheric and land surface modules have a coarse spatial resolution of ~ 51° in longitude and 10° in latitude. This atmospheric model follows a statistical-dynamical approach: prognostic variables are bi-dimensional (latitude, longitude) and the vertical profiles of temperature and humidity are reconstructed using the assumption of

a universal vertical structure of the atmosphere. This module is designed to only resolve large-scale processes, but the effects of synoptic weather systems on heat and moisture transports are parameterized as diffusive terms. In the standard version of the model, stationary waves are parameterized as a function of the difference between sea-level temperature and its zonal mean. In the present study, we removed this ad
 hoc parameterization which was at the origin of a cold bias over Beringia.

The ocean is described by three latitude-depth (2.5° × 20 uneven vertical layers) basins (Atlantic, Indian, Pacific) including the Arctic and the Austral Oceans. The main difference between CLIMBER2.4 and CLIMBER2.3 relies on a different oceanic advection scheme, which is of second order type in the new version and less diffusive. The ocean module also includes a thermodynamic sea ice model which predicts the sea ice fraction and thickness for each grid cell with a simple treatment of diffusion and advection.

The dynamical terrestrial vegetation model, VECODE, provides the distribution of trees, grasses and deserts in response to climate forcing. Each of these three surface

- types may be or not covered by snow. The atmosphere and vegetation modules are linked through an atmosphere-surface interface scheme describing the land surface processes. This interface module considers six surface types: open ocean, sea ice, trees, grasses, deserts and glaciers, with the possibility for all of these surface types to coexist in one grid cell.
- ²⁵ The main advantage of CLIMBER compared to many other Earth models of intermediate complexity (Claussen et al., 2002) is that it includes a full description the hydrological cycle: evaporation, humidity transport and precipitation are explicitly computed. Therefore it is fully appropriate to be coupled with an ice-sheet model. Bonelli et al. (2009), Calov et al. (2005a,b) and Ganopolski et al. (2010) used the same kind



of approach to account for the impact of dust deposition on snow and ice albedos. Our objective here is, as far as possible, to avoid the use numerous parameterizations that are not well constrained against reliable data. This represents another difference between the model used in the present study and its previous versions.

- ⁵ The large scale ice-sheet model, GRISLI, was first designed to describe the Antarctic ice sheet (Ritz et al., 2001) and adapted later on for the Northern Hemisphere ice sheets (Peyaud et al., 2007). A comprehensive description of the model is provided in these studies. GRISLI is a 3-D thermo-mechanical ice-sheet model which simulates the evolution of the geometry of ice sheets in response to climate forcing. It takes the
- ¹⁰ coupled behavior of temperatures and velocities into account. The model deals with the inland ice flow following the zero-order shallow-ice approximation. It also simulates the dynamics of ice shelves and fast ice flow occurring in ice stream zones. The width of ice streams being not greater than a few kilometers, individual ice streams are not explicitly resolved since the model resolution is 40 km × 40 km. Instead, the large-scale flow characteristics of fast flowing regions are represented with the shallow-shelf approx-
- ¹⁵ characteristics of fast flowing regions are represented with the shallow-shelf approximation (MacAyeal, 1989) using criteria based upon effective pressure (i.e. balance between ice and water pressure) and hydraulic load.

The model relies on basic principles of mass, heat and momentum conservation. Evolution of ice-sheet geometry is a function of surface mass balance, velocity fields and bedrock altitude. The isostatic adjustment of bedrock in response to ice load is governed by the flow of the asthenosphere, with a characteristic time constant of 3000 yr, and by the rigidity of the lithosphere. The temperature field is computed both in the ice

20

- and in the bedrock by solving a time-dependent heat equation. Locations of ice shelves are defined using a floatation criterion that depends on the ice thickness and the depth
- of bedrock below sea level. Ice shelves are also characterized by fast ice flow and low surface slope. Ice velocity is therefore determined with the same set of equations used for ice streams but with a basal drag coefficient set to zero. Calving is not explicitly simulated but the position of the ice-shelf front is reached when ice thickness in ice-shelf areas is below 150 m (Peyaud et al., 2007). Since the floatation criterion is checked



at each time step of the simulation, the position of the grounding line is always determined. The grounding line may advance or retreat as sea level changes, especially during periods of huge ice volume variations such as glacial-interglacial cycles.

- To account for the difference of resolution between CLIMBER and GRISLI, a specific downscaling procedure has been developed. The climatic fields used to compute the surface mass balance onto the GRISLI grid are the mean annual and summer surface air temperatures and the annual snowfall. The surface mass balance is defined as the difference between accumulation and ablation. Ablation is computed using the PDD approach. For each CLIMBER grid box and each surface type, the temper-
- ature is computed on 5 vertical levels (between 0 and 4000 m) by using the surface air temperature and the free atmospheric lapse rate. This procedure is similar to the one used by Bonelli et al. (2009) except that we do not take into account the effect of temperature inversion. The vertical precipitation profile is computed as a function of humidity depletion with temperatures obtained through the above mentioned pro-
- ¹⁵ cedure. For temperature fields, these calculations are performed for each CLIMBER surface types and averaged over the three GRISLI surface types (i.e. land ice, ice-free land, ocean). The mean annual and summer surface air temperatures as well as the annual snowfall are then tri-linearly interpolated on the ISM grid. This procedure has been applied for both forced and coupled runs. In the coupled mode, any change in
- ice sheet geometry impacts the simulated climate: GRISLI computes the fraction of ocean, land ice and ice-free land as well as the altitude of continents which are given back to CLIMBER as new boundary conditions. The freshwater fluxes from ice melting are released to the CLIMBER oceans and are distributed according to a runoff mask based on the present-day topography. In the present version of the coupled model, the
- ²⁵ basal melt rate under the ice shelves is prescribed to fixed values which depend on the oceanic region.

Four series of simulations have been carried out to test the sensitivity of the simulated ice sheets to the PDD model (and thus to the PDD parameters) and to investigate the relative importance of ablation-related processes in the built-up of Northern



Hemisphere ice sheets through the last glacial cycle with respect to initial ice-sheet geometry. The experimental set up of these simulations is described in Sects. 4 and 5 and summarized in Tables 1 to 4.

4 General results

5 4.1 Coupled transient climate-ice sheet simulations

To test the response of the Northern Hemisphere ice sheets to different ablation parameterizations, we first carried out a set of three transient simulations from 126 to 0 ka with the three PDD models described in Sect. 2.4 (see Table 1). These experiments have been run with the fully coupled CLIMBER-GRISLI model in order to account for the main interactions between ice sheets and other components of the climate system operating over millennia. The model is initialized with a 5000 yr equilibrium run performed under 126 ka conditions of insolation and CO₂. We assumed that the initial ice-sheet configuration was identical to the present-day Greenland geometry. During transient simulations, the model is forced by variations of insolation (Laskar et al., 2004), CO₂ (Petit et al., 1999) and sea level (Waelbroeck et al., 2002). In this model configuration, the ice-sheet model is called every 20 yr and is run during 20 yr.

Figure 1 displays the spatial distribution of the Northern Hemisphere ice sheets at 116 and 21 ka simulated with the three PDD models. The most striking result is the small amount of ice built by the RH91 (run 1) and TP02 (run 2) models, especially at

the last glacial maximum (LGM) where the only ice-covered regions are the Ellesmere Island and parts of the Canadian Archipelago and of the Rocky Mountains. Moreover, none of these models succeeds in simulating ice over Fennoscandia. These results are particularly surprising when compared to the reconstructed extents of the LGM ice sheets (e.g. Peltier, 2004). By contrast, reasonable glacial inception is obtained with the FST09 model (run 3). At 116 ka, the ice-equivalent sea-level drop coming from



the only contribution of Northern Hemisphere ice sheets is ~ 18 m in agreement with

sea-level reconstructions (Bintanja et al., 2002; Waelbroeck et al., 2002). At the LGM the simulated ice volume of boreal ice sheets reaches $47.8 \times 10^{15} \text{ m}^3$, a value close to $49.7 \times 10^{15} \text{ m}^3$ provided by the ICE-5G reconstruction (Peltier, 2004). Moreover, despite the insufficient southeastern extent of the North American ice sheet and the absence of

the Barents-Kara ice sheet, simulated spatial distributions of LGM ice sheets favorably compare with available reconstructions (Peltier, 2004; Lambeck et al., 2006). These results clearly show, that in the CLIMBER-GRISLI model, the FST09 PDD parameterization favours glacial inception over the Northern Hemisphere.

Owing to the spatial resolution of CLIMBER, these results are quite satisfactory. How-¹⁰ ever, the simulated glacial-interglacial cycle presents some unrealistic features. As an example, although the first glaciation step over Scandinavia occurs as early as 120 ka, the actual glacial inception of the Fennoscandian ice sheet does not take place before 30 ka, in contradiction with many paleo-indicators and geomorphological reconstructions (see Svendsen et al., 2004, for a detailed review). Moreover, in these standard ¹⁵ simulations, there is no complete deglaciation at 0 kyr BP. Previous studies suggest that an increase of climatic variability (Bonelli et al., 2009) or the impact of dust depo-

- sition on snow albedo (Ganopolski et al., 2010; Bonelli et al., 2009) may have played a critical role in the deglaciation process. Here, for simplicity reasons and to compare more easily the impact of different ablation parameterizations, we have chosen to keep
- σ constant through time and not to include a representation of the impact of dust on snow albedo. Moreover, in the present version of GRISLI, the impact of water-saturated sediments on basal sliding that favour the ice retreat has not been taken into account. These missing mechanisms may explain why the last glacial termination is not simulated satisfactorily in our experiments. Our following analysis is therefore focused on
- the 126–21 ka period. Our aim here is not yet to simulate a perfect picture of the last glacial-interglacial cycle in full agreement with all available paleodata but rather to examine to which extent the evolution of Northern Hemisphere ice sheets throughout this time period is linked to the ablation parameterization (and therefore to the choice of the PDD model) or to the climate-ice sheet feedbacks. These issues are addressed in



Discussion Paper TCD 6, 4897-4938, 2012 Influence of ablation-related processes **Discussion** Paper S. Charbit et al. **Title Page** Introduction Abstract Conclusions References **Discussion** Paper **Figures** Back **Discussion** Paper Full Screen / Esc Printer-friendly Version Interactive Discussion

the following sections through GRISLI equilibrium experiments and CLIMBER-GRISLI sensitivity studies.

4.2 GRISLI equilibrium simulations

In order to investigate the sensitivity of the simulated ice sheets to the choice of the PDD parameterization we carried out GRISLI equilibrium experiments forced during 50 kyr by the CLIMBER climatic outputs (see Table 2). These climatic outputs come from 10 kyr time-slice experiments (i.e. under conditions of insolation and CO₂ constant through time). In these runs, ice-related feedbacks are not taken into account. These simulations have been carried out for different key periods of the last glacial-interglacial
 cycle (i.e. 120 ka, 112 ka and 21 ka) in order to investigate the model sensitivity to different PDD formulations in various combinations of insolation and ice volume. The 120 ka period corresponds roughly to the onset of glaciation while the 65° N summer insolation is still at a relatively high level. The second period (i.e. 112 ka) corresponds to a low insolation level. At that time, reconstructions based on benthic δ¹⁸O suggest

- that sea level had dropped by ~ 40–50 m (Waelbroeck et al., 2002), and thus, that ice volume was at an intermediate level compared to the LGM where sea-level was lowered by ~ 120 m. At 21 ka, ice volume was at or close to its maximum, while insolation was close to present-day setting. The ice-sheet boundary condition of the CLIMBER runs, used also as an initial condition of the 50 kyr GRISLI experiments, are taken from the
- fully coupled standard FST09 experiment (i.e. run 3). This choice is motivated by the ability of the FST09 PDD model to produce a reasonable ice volume evolution through the last glacial period. Each PDD parameterization described in Sect. 2.4 has been used to compute the surface mass balance of the ice sheets.

Figure 2 shows the evolution of the simulated ice volumes and ice-covered areas inferred from the three PDD formulations for 120 (runs 4 to 6), 112 (runs 7 to 9) and 21 ka (runs 10 to 12). To understand the response of the simulated ice sheets to the PDD model, it is necessary to carefully examine the response of the ice sheets when they are not too much influenced by the impact of the evolution of their own geometry on climate but rather by the difference between the PDD models. The period spanning over the first 1000 model years period seems to be a good compromise. The largest differences in both ice volumes and ice covered areas are observed for 120 ka with a glaciation process clearly amplified with the FST09 model (run 6). The ice-covered area simulated with FST09 is 23 and 24 % larger than those simulated with RH91 (run 4) and TP02 (run 5) models, respectively. This actually implies a larger total ablation in the FST09 run (not shown). However, in this run, the relative amount of ablation defined as the number of grid points experiencing ablation over the total number of ice-covered grid points, is smaller than in the other runs. Over North America, the relative

ablation is only 68 % in the FST09 model against 97 % in the RH91 one (not shown). The large FST09 ice volume can neither be explained by the contribution of superimposed ice. In this PDD formulation, refreezing is computed as a function of the altitude and remains therefore at a very low level due to the small average elevation of the ice sheet (i.e. a few hundreds of meters). Therefore, the origin of the large FST09 ice

10

- ¹⁵ volume is linked to the greater ice expansion, which is itself due to the parameterization of the standard deviation of temperature distribution, accounting for daily and inter-annual temperature variability. As an example, when the altitude of the ice sheet is around 500 m, the σ value is 2.2 °C whereas it is 5 and 5.2 °C in RH91 and TP02 models, respectively. In fact the larger the variability, the larger the probability of having
- ²⁰ positive temperatures in a given day is, favouring thereby the ablation process. Therefore, these results suggest that during glacial inception, the surface mass balance of ice sheets is critically dependent on temperature variability. At the end of the simulation, the relative difference of ice-covered areas between each PDD model and the relative amounts of ablation are of the same order of magnitude to those obtained after ²⁵ 1000 model years (not shown).

The comparison of the results obtained with RH91 (run 4) and TP02 (run 5) highlights a second striking result. After 1000 model years, the ice volume and the ice-covered area simulated with RH91 are almost equivalent to those simulated with TP02 (95 and 96%, respectively). However, the values of ablation and refreezing present some large



differences from one model to the other (Fig. 3). With RH91, the amount of total ablation nearly equals the amount of refreezing ($\sim 3.2 \times 10^{11} \text{ m}^3 \text{ yr}^{-1}$). The ablation computed with TP02 is roughly twice smaller than the RH91 one (i.e. $1.5 \times 10^{11} \text{ m}^3 \text{ yr}^{-1}$), but this small value is amply compensated by the amount of refreezing ($\sim 6.4 \times 10^{11} \text{ m}^3 \text{ yr}^{-1}$).

- ⁵ This illustrates that the different PDD formulations used for climates different from the present-day one may produce similar ice volumes or ice-covered areas with rather different combinations of ablation and refreezing components (Fig. 3a). Similar conclusions can be reached out in the 112 ka simulation (Fig. 3b). In this latter experiment, the FST09 and TP02 ice volumes follow almost identical evolutions with ablation/refreezing
- values ranging from 2.9/1.0 × 10¹¹ m³ yr⁻¹ (FST09) to 4.8/5.1 × 10¹¹ m³ yr⁻¹ (TP02). In the TP02 experiment, refreezing counterbalances ablation, while in the FST09 one, ice volume mainly results from the expansion of the ice as shown by the evolution of the ice-covered area (Fig. 2). At 21 ka, RH91 (run 7) and TP02 (run 8) ice volumes are of similar magnitudes due to similar amounts of ablation and refreezing components
 (Fig. 3c). By comparison, the amount of FST09 refreezing remains far smaller as well
- as the total ablation.

Another important key point relies on the similarity between spatial distributions of ice sheets simulated with the three PDD models at 112 and 21 ka (not shown). This suggests that their response is strongly influenced by the initial topography condition given by the full coupled FST09 simulation (run 3). By contrast, at the onset of glaciation (i.e. at 120 ka), the initial amount of ice is too small to exert a noticeable control on the simulated ice sheets. Therefore, during this time period, the response of the ice sheets seems to be mainly governed by the ablation method and more specifically by the amplitude of temperature variations, as previously illustrated.

²⁵ Our results demonstrate the complexity of the ice sheet response to a given climatic forcing. It also illustrates the need to identify how each PDD component comes into play and the relative influence of ablation and feedback processes. These issues are addressed in the following sections through several sets of sensitivity experiments.



5 Sensitivity studies

5.1 Role of PDD parameters

The third series of simulations is designed to investigate the relative influence of PDD parameters on simulated ice sheets over the last glacial-interglacial cycle. These experiments have been carried out following the same experimental setup as the first series except for the PDD parameters that have been exchanged one by one from one PDD formulation to the other. As an example, the FST09 model has been run with DDF parameters, retention scheme and standard deviation coming from RH91. A similar procedure has been followed with the two other formulations with the appropriate

exchange of parameters (see Table 3 for a summary of these simulations).

The fundamental question arising from results discussed in previous sections is why the FST09 model leads to a reasonable evolution of the ice volume through the last glacial cycle compared to the RH91 and TP02 models. The analysis of the GRISLI equilibrium simulations has shown that the simulated ice-covered area is enhanced

- with the FST09 PDD formulation. This suggests that the parameter representing the variability of temperatures plays a significant role in the glacial inception process especially at low altitudes, which, in turn, favours the further development of Northern Hemisphere ice sheets through ice-related feedbacks (see Sect. 5.2). To confirm this assumption, we have replaced the σ -altitude relationship used in FST09 with the fixed
- ²⁰ value of the σ parameter used in RH91 and TP02 (run 15). The net consequence is that the model is no longer able to produce ice over Northern Hemisphere areas (Fig. 4) with the exception of tiny portions in the Rocky Mountains and near Baffin Bay. This clearly demonstrates the huge impact of the representation of stochastic variations of temperature on the construction of Northern Hemisphere ice sheets. Besides, when
- ²⁵ the σ -altitude relationship is used in RH91 and TP02 models (runs 13 and 14), the entire GRISLI domain becomes ice-covered (Fig. 4). Neglecting the dependency of σ on the altitude in these models as in the standard simulations (runs 1 and 2), could be therefore at the origin of the small amount of ice simulated over locations of past



ice sheets. However, the results obtained with these new formulations are now completely unrealistic. Such results can be explained by the large amount of refreezing produced by TP02, and to a lesser extent by RH91. When combined with the σ -altitude relationship, these large amounts of refreezing cause a too massive glaciation.

- ⁵ These overall results also suggest that in the FST09 model, the effect of the dependency of the σ parameter on altitude is counterbalanced either by the refreezing scheme or by DDF factors. Substituting the DDF-temperature relationship used in FST09 by fixed values (as in RH91) does not lead to significant changes in simulated surface mass balances (run 16), although the standard FST09 model tends to slightly enhance the ablation (not shown). The same observations are valid using the
- DDF-temperature dependency (as prescribed in FST09) in the RH91 model (run 17). Therefore, as suggested in previous sections, the method for computing the amount of superimposed ice seems to be a good candidate to counteract the effect of the temperature variability.
- ¹⁵ To confirm this assumption, two additional experiments have been carried out by changing the refreezing scheme in the FST09 model. The use of the TP02 refreezing formulation in FST09 (run 18) leads to a strong increase of the ice thickness of more than 1000 m over the North American and Scandinavian ice sheets at 115 ka and a southward expansion of the ice (Fig 5a). At 21 ka, the ice thickness increases over the
- ²⁰ major part of both Greenland and Canada, except in the western part. More surprising is the growth of ice all over the eastern part of the GRISLI domain (Fig. 5b). This pattern is fully correlated with the spatial distribution of the ice sheets simulated with the TP02 model when the fixed standard deviation of temperature distribution is replaced with the σ -altitude relationship as used in FST09 (run 14, Fig. 4). Using a Pmax value
- fixed to 0.6 (as in RH91) in the FST09 model (run 19) leads to similar results except over Greenland where ice thickness decreases (Figs. 5c, d). This is likely due to the cooling effect induced by the growth of the adjacent Canadian ice sheet which causes a depletion of snow accumulation probably amplified by the coarse spatial resolution of CLIMBER. The depletion of snow accumulation cannot be produced by a displacement



of planetary waves in response to orographic and/or thermal effects since their parameterization has been removed from the present model configuration. Moreover, the decrease of snow accumulation is not totally counteracted by the amount of refreezing which remains smaller than the TP02 one.

- ⁵ These sensitivity experiments help to identify the relative importance of each PDD parameter in the evolution of past Northern Hemisphere ice sheets. The effect of temperature variability appears to be dominant though modulated by the amount of refreezing. The other main processes that likely play a significant role in the development of the ice sheets are linked to ice-related feedbacks (i.e. albedo and/or altitude effect).
- ¹⁰ In the following section, we examine how a change in ice-sheet configuration at different key periods of the last glacial cycle may influence the further evolution of Northern Hemisphere ice sheets.

5.2 Role of the ice-sheet geometry

Since the FST09 model favours ice expansion in the early phase of glacial inception, ice-sheet feedbacks may amplify the glaciation process. As a consequence the direct comparison of the different PDD models may lead to a misinterpretation of their ability to produce a reasonable evolution of Northern Hemisphere ice sheets through the last glacial cycle. To investigate how the construction of simulated Northern Hemisphere ice sheets throughout the last glacial cycle may be impacted by the shape and size of

- ice sheets themselves at given stages of the simulation, an additional series of experiments has been carried out with different initial conditions of ice-sheet topography and different PDD models (Table 4). These experiments start, respectively at 115 ka close to the insolation minimum (runs 20 to 22), 60 ka, corresponding to a full glacial state period (runs 23 to 25) and 30 ka which marks a new glaciation phase (runs 26 to 28).
- ²⁵ All these experiments are run with both RH91 and TP02 models with an initial climatic state and an initial ice-sheet topography given by the full coupled FST09 simulation at these key periods.



The evolution of the simulated ice volumes (Fig. 6) clearly shows that the presence of a larger ice sheet at 115 ka (runs 20 and 21) enables the ice volume to increase and to reach greater values ($\sim 22 \times 10^{15} \text{ m}^3$ at the LGM) than those obtained in the TP02 and RH91 standard simulations ($\sim 2-3 \times 10^{15} \text{ m}^3$). This means that at some key periods of

- the last glacial cycle, such as the onset of glaciation, a rather large ice sheet seems to be a crucial element to ensure a reasonable further built-up of the North American ice sheet. This also underlines the potential impact of ice-sheet feedbacks. However, ice volumes simulated with RH91-115FS (run 20) and TP02-115FS (run 21) experiments are about 45 % smaller than the one provided by the standard FST09 simulation (run 3).
- ¹⁰ This demonstrates that, at the onset of glaciation, a change in ice-sheet configuration may approximately explain half of the LGM ice volume.

Experiments starting at 60 ka (resp. 30 ka) with the FST09 initial conditions and run with the RH91 and TP02 models (runs 22–23 and 26–27) do not show a substantial increase of the ice volume after 60 ka (resp. 30 ka). This suggests that the amplitude

- of the feedback of the initial FST09 ice sheet on the climate is not large enough to produce an evolution of the ice volume similar to that obtained in the standard FST09 simulation (Run 3). Moreover, after the LGM, located at around 17 ka in our simulations, the ice volume tends to decrease. Compared to results provided by the standard FST09 experiment, this confirms that, in our model configuration, the RH91 and TP02 PDD formulations favour the ablation, and suggests that the influence of initial ice-sheet
- ²⁰ formulations favour the ablation, and suggests that the influence of initial ice-sheet conditions is of secondary importance.

To better assess the impact of the initial ice-sheet geometry, we performed additional tests in which the transient simulation of the last glacial cycle was initialized with standard TP02 ice sheets (i.e. simulated in run 2) at 115, 60 and 30 ka. Surprisingly,

²⁵ although the 115 ka starting point is characterized by a small initial amount of ice, the further evolution of the ice volume is similar to that of the standard FST09 experiment (run 3). Similarly, a significant ice growth is observed in the experiments starting with the 60 and 30 ka TP02 ice sheets and run with the FST09 model (Runs 25 and 28). These results confirm the ability of the FST09 model to produce glacial inception at any



stage of the last glacial cycle through rapid expansion of ice in response to insolation and $\rm CO_2$ forcings.

These sensitivity experiments show that the relative impact of both ablation related processes and ice-sheet feedbacks in the evolution of Northern Hemisphere ice sheets

- throughout the last glacial cycle is strongly dependent on the PDD formulation. In experiments run with PDD models that favour ablation, the large initial ice sheet given by the standard FST09 simulation is responsible for about half of the LGM ice volume. On the other hand, when ablation is limited due to low temperature variability, these feedbacks do not appear so crucial. In such a situation, the evolution of the ice system is dominated by the impact of daily or inter appual applitude of temperature variability.
- ¹⁰ is dominated by the impact of daily or inter-annual amplitude of temperature variations.

6 Conclusions

Since the development of coupled climate-ice sheet models, the reliability of the PDD method to compute ablation has been more and more questioned in the literature. This method accounts for the melt-temperature relationship but ignores the effect of insola-

- tion variations and albedo on snow and ice materials. This implies the non-universality of the PDD method both in space and time. With this respect, van de Berg et al. (2011) recently underlined that the use of the PDD approach was not appropriate in a paleoclimatic context. Energy balance models appear more physically-based but suffer from a lack of constraints, despite first attempts made for simulations of past periods
- (Ganopolski et al., 2010; Robinson et al., 2011; Fyke et al., 2011). Regional atmospheric models coupled with physical snow models (e.g. Lefebre et al., 2005; Ettema et al., 2009; Fettweis, 2011, 2012; Reijmer et al., 2012) offer a detailed representation of atmospheric and metamorphic processes of snow and ice. Such models have been validated against observations of present-day Greenland. Unfortunately, due to their
- high computational cost, they cannot be used at the 100 kyr time scale. Therefore, the empirical PDD formulation is still the most common approach to study the climate-ice



sheet system over multi-millennia time periods. Within this context, the uncertainties linked to this approach appear as a key issue.

In the present study we used the coupled CLIMBER-GRISLI model to evaluate the sensitivity of the simulated geometry of ice sheets to the PDD formulation. Our different

- ⁵ series of experiments shows that our model is highly sensitive to the PDD model with very different responses observed from one formulation to the other. In particular, it has been shown that at some key periods, change in any PDD parameter may notably modify the overall glacial cycle. The relation between DDF coefficients C_{ice} and C_{snow} with temperature seems to only have a small impact, at least for the period under study.
- ¹⁰ Conversely the surface mass balance of Northern Hemisphere ice sheets appears to be strongly dependent on the representation of temperature variability, mainly at the onset of glaciation. In turn, this may have a crucial impact for subsequent built-up of ice sheets, depending on the way this variability is accounted for in the PDD model. The parameterization of the standard deviation σ as a function of the elevation, recom-
- ¹⁵ mended by Fausto et al. (2009), decreases the ablation at the edges of ice sheets and favours the glaciation of low altitude areas. This response is nevertheless modulated by the refreezing processes. In our model, the use of the FST09 parameterization of σ in combination with a refreezing scheme leading to a large amount of superimposed ice yields a massive glaciation in total disagreement with sea-level and geological recon-
- structions (Bintanja et al., 2002; Brigham-Grette, 2001; Lambeck and Chappell, 2001; Lambeck et al., 2006; Peltier, 2004; Svendsen et al., 2004; Waelbroeck et al., 2002). Conversely, a large amount of superimposed ice is not a sufficient condition to properly simulate the ice sheet evolution throughout the last glacial cycle. Therefore, our study shows that the use of the PDD approach in climatic conditions fully different from
- the present-day ones requires an appropriate calibration of the PDD parameters. This calibration is likely to be strongly dependent on the climate-ice sheet model. However, we emphasize again that this study has not been designed to define the best PDD model. Its aim is rather to underline the respective roles of each PDD parameter in a paleoclimatic context and to determine the relative impact of processes relying on



the representation of ablation and ice-sheet feedbacks. Here, it clearly appears that the FST09 formulation provides a more realistic geometry of LGM ice sheets with respect to available reconstructions (e.g. Peltier, 2004). However, these latter results are likely to be model-dependent. In fact, a cooler climate model could produce a reasonable glaciation with the RH91 and TP02 approaches, and a too massive glaciation with FST09.

None of the PDD formulation used in this study enables us to simulate the last glacial termination. This major drawback may come from missing mechanisms and/or the unproper representation of some processes, such as those relying on basal sliding and fast ice flow. However, this study highlights the importance of the σ parameter and clearly suggests that the role of stochastic variations of temperature should be carefully considered in any further study. The parameterization suggested by Fausto et al. (2009) has been inferred from observations made for the present-day Greenland ice sheet. Nonetheless, the universality of this relationship is unlikely. Therefore a calibration of

10

the σ parameter as a function of space and time could be considered as a mean to improve the simulation of the last deglaciation, in line with previous findings made by Bonelli et al. (2009).

It should finally be emphasized that detailed snow models coupled to regional atmospheric models could provide a reasonable set of PDD parameters. A pioneering study

- ²⁰ conducted by Reijmer et al. (2012) examined different refreezing schemes forced by climatic fields simulated by the RACMO model. The results were compared to outputs from RACMO in which the refreezing process is explicitly computed. Such approaches should also be applied to melt rate factors (i.e. DDF) for which direct observations are available and temperature variability (i.e. standard deviation of the PDD distribution)
- ²⁵ from the daily to the inter-annual time scale. The development of similar studies conducted with different models could help to provide a better time dependent calibration of the PDD formulations, which are still commonly used in the climate-ice sheet modeling community.



4923

Acknowledgements. This work was supported by CEA, CNRS and UVSQ. The authors wish to thank J.-Y. Peterschmitt and P. Beghin for technical support.



References

15

20

- Abe-Ouchi, A., Segawa, T., and Saito, F.: Climatic Conditions for modelling the Northern Hemisphere ice sheets throughout the ice age cycle, Clim. Past, 3, 423–438, doi:10.5194/cp-3-423-2007, 2007.
- Ambach, W.: Heat Balance Characteristics and Ice Ablation, Western EGIG-Profile. Applied Hydrology in the Development of Northern Basins, Danish Society for Arctic Technology, Copenhagen, 1988.

Bintanja, R., van de Wal, R. S. W., and Oerlemans, J.: Global ice volume variations through the last glacial cycle simulated by a 3-D ice dynamical model, Quaternary Int., 95–96, 11–23, 2002.

Bonelli, S., Charbit, S., Kageyama, M., Woillez, M.-N., Ramstein, G., Dumas, C., and Quiquet, A.: Investigating the evolution of major Northern Hemisphere ice sheets during the last glacial-interglacial cycle, Clim. Past, 5, 329–345, doi:10.5194/cp-5-329-2009, 2009.

Braithwaite, R. J.: Positive degree-day factors for ablation on the Greenland ice sheet studies by energy-balance modelling, J. Glaciol., 41, 153–160, 1995.

Braithwaite, R. J. and Olesen, O. B.: Calculation of Glacier Ablation from air Temperature, West Greenland. Glacier Fluctuations and Climatic Change, Kluwer Academic Publisher, Dordrecht, 1989.

Braithwaite, R. J. and Zhang, Y.: Sensitivity of mass balance of five Swiss glaciers to tempera-

ture changes assessed by tuning a degree-day model, J. Glaciol., 46, 7–14, 2000.





- Brigham-Grette, J.: New perspectives on Berigian Quaternary paleogeography, stratigraphy and glacial history, Quaternary Sci. Rev., 20, 15–24, 2001.
- Brun, E., Martin, E., Simon, V., Gendre, C., and Coléou, C.: An energy and mass model for snow cover suitable for operational avalanche forecasting, J. Glaciol., 35, 333–342, 1989.
- ⁵ Brun, E., David, P., Sudul, M., and Brunot, G.: A numerical snow model to simulate snow cover straigraphy for operational avalanche forecasting, J. Glaciol., 38, 13–22, 1992.
 - Calov, R., Ganopolski, A., Claussen, M., Petoukhov, V. and Greve, R.: Transient simulation of the last glacial inception, Part I : glacial inception as bifurfication in the climate system, Clim. Dynam., 24, 545–561, 2005a.
- ¹⁰ Calov, R., Ganopolski, A., Petoukhov, V., Claussen, M., Brovkin, V., and Kubattzki, C.: Transient simulation of the last glacial inception, Part II : sensitivity and feedback analysis, Clim. Dynam., 24, 563–576, 2005b.
 - Charbit, S., Ritz, C., and Ramstein, G.: Simulations of Northern Hemisphere ice-sheet retreat: sensitivity to physical mechanisms involved during the last deglaciation, Quaternary Sci. Rev. 21, 243–265, 2002
- ¹⁵ Rev., 21, 243–265, 2002.
 - Charbit, S., Kageyama, M., Roche, D., Ritz, C., and Ramstein, G.: Investigating the mechanisms leading to the deglaciation of past Northern Hemisphere ice sheets with the CLIMBER-GREMLINS coupled model, Global Planet. Change, 48, 253–273, 2005.

Charbit, S., Ritz, C., Philippon, G., Peyaud, V., and Kageyama, M.: Numerical reconstructions of the Northern Hemisphere ice sheets through the last glacial-interglacial cycle, Clim. Past,

- 3, 15-37, doi:10.5194/cp-3-15-2007, 2007.
- Claussen, M., Mysak, L. A., Weaver, A. J., Crucifix, M., Fichefet, T., Loutre, M.-F., Weber, S. L., Alcamo, J., Alexeev, V. A., Berger, A., Calov, R., Ganopolski, A., Goosse, H., Lohman, G., Lunkeit, F., Mokhov, I. I, Petoukhov, V., Stone, P., and Wang, Z.: Earth system models of
- intermediate complexity: closing the gap in the spectrum of climate models, Clim. Dynam.,
 18, 579–586, 2002.
 - Ettema, J., van den Broecke, M. R., van Meijgaard, E., van de Berg, W. J., Bamber, J. L., Box, J. E., and Bales, R. C.: Higher surface mass balance of Greenland ice sheet revealed by high-resolution climate modelling, Geophys. Res. Lett., 36, L12501, doi:10.1029/2009GL038110, 2009.
- 30

20

Fausto, R. S., Ahlstrom, A. P., van As, D., Johnsen, S. J., Langen, P. L., and Steffen, K.: Improving surface boundary conditions with focus on coupling snow densification and meltwater retention in large-scale ice-sheet models of Greenland, J. Glaciol., 55, 869–878, 2009.



Fettweis, X.: Reconstruction of the 1979–2006 Greenland ice sheet surface mass balance using the regional climate model MAR, The Cryosphere, 1, 21–40, doi:10.5194/tc-1-21-2007, 2007.

Fettweis, X., Tedesco, M., van den Broeke, M., and Ettema, J.: Melting trends over the Green-

- Iand ice sheet (1958–2009) from spaceborne microwave data and regional climate models, The Cryosphere, 5, 359-375, doi:10.5194/tc-5-359-2011, 2011.
 - Fettweis, X., Franco, B., Tedesco, M., van Angelen, J. H., Lenaerts, J. T. M., van den Broeke, M. R., and Gallée, H.: Estimating Greenland ice sheet surface mass balance contribution to future sea level rise using the regional atmospheric climate model MAR, The Cryosphere Discuss., 6, 3101–3147, doi:10.5194/tcd-6-3101-2012, 2012.
 - Finsterwalder, S. and Schunk, H.: Der Suldenferner, Z. Deutsch. Öster. Alpenver., 18, 72–89, 1887.

10

25

Fyke, J. G., Weaver, A. J., Pollard, D., Eby, M., Carter, L., and Mackintosh, A.: A new coupled ice sheet/climate model: description and sensitivity to model physics under Eemian, Last Glacial

- ¹⁵ Maximum, late Holocene and modern climate conditions, Geosci. Model Dev., 4, 117–136, doi:10.5194/gmd-4-117-2011, 2011.
 - Gallée, H. and Duynkerke, P. G.: Air-snow interactions and the surface energy and mass balance over the melting zone of west Greenland during the Greenland Ice Margin Experiment, J. Geophys. Res., 102, 13813–13824, 1997.
- Ganopolski, A., Calov, R., and Claussen, M.: Simulation of the last glacial cycle with a coupled climate ice-sheet model of intermediate complexity, Clim. Past, 6, 229–244, doi:10.5194/cp-6-229-2010, 2010.
 - Graversen, R. G., Drijfhout, S., Hazeleger, W., van de Wal, R., Bintanja, R., and Helsen, M.: Greenland's contribution to global sea-level rise by the end of the 21st century, Clim. Dynam., 37, 1427–1442, doi:10.1007/s00382-010-0918-8, 2010.
 - Greve, R.: On the response of Greenland ice sheet to greenhouse climate change, Climatic Change, 46, 289–303, 2000.
 - Greve, R.: Relation of measured basal temperatures and the spatial distribution of the geothermal heat flux for the Greenland ice sheet, Ann. Glaciol., 42, 424–432, 2005.
- Hock, R.: Temperature index melt modelling in mountain areas, J. Hydrol., 282, 104–115, 2003.
 Huybrechts, P. and de Wolde, J.: The dynamic response of the Greenland and Antarctic ice sheets to multiple century climatic warming, J. Climate, 12, 2169–2188, 1999.



- Huybrechts, P., Letréguilly, A., and Reeh, N.: The Greenland ice sheet and greenhouse warming, Palaeogeogr. Paleoclimatol. Palaeoecol., 89, 399–412, 1991.
- Janssens, Y. and Huybrechts, P.: The treatment of meltwater retention in mass-balance parametriztaions of the Greenland ice sheet, Ann. Glaciol., 31, 133–140, 2000.
- 5 Kageyama, M., Charbit, S., Ritz, C., Khodri, M., and Ramstein, G.: Quantifying icesheet feedbacks during the last glacial inception, Geophys. Res. Lett., 31, L24203, doi:10.1029/2004GL021339, 2004.
 - Key, J., Wang, X., Stroeve, J., and Fowler, C.: Estimating the cloudy sky albedo of sea ice and snow from space, J. Geophys. Res., 106, 12489–12497, 2001.
- ¹⁰ Lambeck, K. and Chappell, J.: Sea level change through the last glacial cycle, Science, 292, 679–686, 2001.
 - Lambeck, K., Purcell, A., Funder, S., Kjaer, K. H., Larsen, E., and Möller, P.: Constraints on the Late Saalian to early middle Weichselian ice sheet of Eurasia from field data and rebound modelling, Boreas, 35, 539–575, 2006.
- Laskar, J., Robutel, P., Joutel, F., Gastineau, M., Correia, A. C. M., and Levrard, B.: A long term numerical solution for the insolation quantities of the Earth, Astron. Astrophys., 428, 261–285, 2004.
 - Lefebre, F., Gallée, H., van Ypersele, J. P., and Huybrechts, P.: Modelling of large-scale melt parameters with a regional climate model in South Greenland during the 1991 melt season,
- ²⁰ Ann. Gaciol., 35, 391–397, 2002.
 - Lefebre, F., Fettweis, X., Gallée, H., Van Ypersele, J.-P., Marbaix, P., Greuell, W., and Calanca, P.: Evaluation of a high resolution regional climate simulation over Greenland, Clim. Dynam., 25, 99–116, doi:10.1007/s00382-005-0005-8, 2005.
- MacAyeal, D. R.: Large-scale ice flow over a viscous basal sediment: theory and application to ice stream B, Antarctica, J. Geophys. Res., 94, 4071–4087, 1989.
 - Oerlemans, J. and Hoogendoorn, N. C.: Mass-balance gradients and climatic changes, J. Glaciol., 35, 399–405, 1989.
 - Oerlemans, J. and Vugts, H. F.: A meteorological experiment in the melting zone of the Greenland ice sheet, B. Am. Meteorol. Soc., 74, 355–365, 1993.
- ³⁰ Peltier, W. R.: Global glacial isostasy and the surface of the ice-age Earth: the ICE-5G (VM2) model and GRACE, Ann. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci., 32, 111–149, 2004.
 - Petit, J. R., Jouzel, J., Raynaud, D., Barkov, N. I., Barnola, J.-M., Basile, I., Bender, M., Chappelaz, J., Davis, M., Delaygue, G., Delmotte, M., Kotlyakov, V. M., Legrand, M., Lipenkov, V.



Y., Lorius, C., Pépin, L., Ritz, C., Saltzman, E., and Stievenard, M.: Climate and atmospheric history of the past 420,000 years from the Vostok ice core, Antarctica, Nature, 399, 429–436, 1999.

Petoukhov, V., Ganopolski, A., Brovkin, V., Claussen, M., Eliseev, A., Kubatzki, C., and Rahm-

- storf, S.: CLIMBER-2: a climate system model of intermediate complexity, Part I: model description and performance for present climate, Clim. Dynam., 16, 1–17, 2000.
 - Peyaud, V., Ritz, C., and Krinner, G.: Modelling the Early Weichselian Eurasian Ice Sheets: role of ice shelves and influence of ice-dammed lakes, Clim. Past, 3, 375–386, doi:10.5194/cp-3-375-2007, 2007.
- Pfeffer, W. T., Meier, M. F., and Illangasekare, T. H.: Retention of Greenland runoff by refreezing: implications for projected future sea level changes, J. Geophys. Res., 96, 22117–22124, 1991.
 - Philippon, G., Ramstein, G., Charbit, S., Kageyama, M., Ritz, C., and Dumas, C.: Evolution of the Antarctic ice sheet through the last deglaciation: a study with a new coupled climate-north and South Hemisphere ice sheet model, Earth Planet. Sci. Lett., 248, 750–758, 2006.
- and South Hemisphere ice sheet model, Earth Planet. Sci. Lett., 248, 750–758, 2006.
 Reeh, N.: Parameterization of melt rate and surface temperature on the Greenland ice sheet, Polarforschung, 59, 113–128, 1991.
 - Reijmer, C. H., van den Broeke, M. R., Fettweis, X., Ettema, J., and Stap, L. B.: Refreezing on the Greenland ice sheet: a comparison of parameterizations, The Cryosphere, 6, 743–762, doi:10.5194/tc-6-743-2012, 2012.

20

Ritz, C., Fabre, A., and Letréguilly, A.: Sensitivity of a Greenland ice sheet model to ice flow and ablation parameters: consequences for the evolution through the last climatic cycle, Clim. Dynam., 13, 11–24, 1997.

Ritz, C., Rommelaere, V., and Dumas, C.: Modeling the Antarctic ice sheet evolution of the last

- 420 000 years: implication for altitude changes in the Vostok region, J. Geophys. Res., 106, 31943–31964, 2001.
 - Robinson, A., Calov, R., and Ganopolski, A.: Greenland ice sheet model parameters constrained using simulations of the Eemian Interglacial, Clim. Past, 7, 381–396, doi:10.5194/cp-7-381-2011, 2011.
- Stone, E. J., Lunt, D. J., Rutt, I. C., and Hanna, E.: Investigating the sensitivity of numerical model simulations of the modern state of the Greenland ice-sheet and its future response to climate change, The Cryosphere, 4, 397–417, doi:10.5194/tc-4-397-2010, 2010.



- Svendsen, J. I., Alexanderson, H., Astakhov, V. I., Demidov, I., Dowdeswell, J., Funder, S., Gataullin, V., Henriksen, M., Hjort, C., Houmark-Nielsen, M., Hubberten, H. W., Ingolfsson, O., Jakobsson, M., Kjaer, K. H., Larsen, E., Lokrantz, H., Lunkka, J. P., Lysa, A., Mangerud, J., Matiouchkhov, A., Murray, A., Möller, P., Niessen, F., Nikolskaya, O., Polyak, L., Saarnisto,
- M., Siegert, C., Siegert, M. J., Spielhagen, R. F., and Stein, R.: Late Quaternary ice sheet history of Northern Eurasia, Quaternary Sci. Rev., 23, 1229–1271, 2004.
 - Swingedouw, D., Fichefet, T., Huybrechts, P., Goosse, H., Driesschaert, E., and Loutre, M.-F.: Antarctic ice-sheet melting provides negative feedbacks on future climate warming, Geophys. Res. Lett., 35, L17705, doi:10.1029/2008GL034410, 2008.
- ¹⁰ Tarasov, L. and Peltier, W. R.: Impact of thermomechanical ice sheet coupling of the 100 kyr ice age cycle, J. Geophys. Res., 104, 9517–9545, 1999.
 - Tarasov, L. and Peltier, W. R.: Greenland glacial history and local geodynamic consequences, Geophys. J. Int., 150, 198–229, 2002.

van de Berg, W. J., van den Broecke, M. R., Ettema, J., van Meijgaard, E., and Kaspar, F.: Sig-

- nificant contribution of insolation to Eemian melting of the Greenland ice sheet, Nat. Geosci., 4, 679–683, 2011.
 - van den Broecke, M. R., Dyunkerke, P. G., and Oerlemans, J.: The observed katabatic flow at the edge of the Greenland ice sheet during GIMEX-91, Global Planet. Change, 9, 3–15, 1994.
- van den Broecke, M. R., Smeets, P., Ettema, J., and Munneke, P. K.: Surface radiation balance in the ablation zone of the west Greenland ice sheet, J. Geophys. Res., 113, D13105, doi:10.1029/2007JD009283, 2008.
 - Vizcaino, M., Mikolajewicz, U., Gröger, M., Maier-Reimer, E., Schurgers, G., and Winguth, A. M.
 E.: Long-term ice sheet-climate interactions under anthropogenic greenhouse forcing simulated with a complex Earth System Model, Clim. Dynam., 31, 665–690, 2008.
- lated with a complex Earth System Model, Clim. Dynam., 31, 665–690, 2008.
 Waelbroeck, C., Labeyrie, L., Michel, E., Duplessy, J. C., McManus, J. F., Lambeck, K., Balbon, E., and Labracherie, M.: Sea-level and deep water temperature changes derived from benthic foraminifera isotopic records, Quaternary Sci. Rev., 21, 295–305, 2002.
 - Zwally, H. J. and Li, J.: Seasonal and interannual variations of firn densification and ice-sheet surface elevation at Greenland summit, J. Glaciol., 48, 199-207, 2002.

30

Zweck, C. and Huybrechts, P.: Modeling of the Northern Hemisphere ice sheets during the last glacial cycle and glaciological sensitivity, J. Geophys. Res., 110, D07103, doi:10.1029/2004JD005489, 2005.



Table 1. Standard fully coupled CLIMBER-GRISLI simulations.

Forcings	Insolation CO ₂ Sea level	Laskar et al. (2004) Petit et al. (1999) Waelbroeck et al. (2002)	
Initial conditions	PDD models	References	Run ID
126 kyr climate Present-day Greenland topography	RH91 TP02 FST09	Reeh (1991) Tarasov and Peltier (2002) Adapted from Fausto et al. (2009)	1 2 3

T (6, 4897–4	TCD 6, 4897–4938, 2012		
Influence of ablation-related processes			
S. Chai	S. Charbit et al.		
Title	Title Page		
Abstract	Introduction		
Conclusions	References		
Tables	Figures		
14	۶I		
•	•		
Back	Close		
Full Scr	Full Screen / Esc		
Printer-frie	Printer-friendly Version		
Interactive	Interactive Discussion		

Discussion Paper

Discussion Paper

Discussion Paper

Discussion Paper

 Table 2. GRISLI equilibrium simulations.

Climate forcings (from time-slice CLIMBER experiments)	Initial topography conditions (from std FST09 experiments)	PDD models	Run ID
120 ka	120 ka FST09	RH91, TP02, FST09	4, 5, 6
112 ka	112 ka FST09	RH91, TP02, FST09	7, 8, 9
21 ka	21 ka FST09	RH91, TP02, FST09	10, 11, 12

Discussion Pa	TCD 6, 4897–4938, 2012			
per Discussior	Influence of ablation-related processes S. Charbit et al.			
Pap	Title Page			
θr	Abstract	Introduction		
	Conclusions	References		
iscussi	Tables	Figures		
on P	I	۶I		
aper	•			
_	Back	Close		
Discussio	Full Screen / Esc Printer-friendly Version			
n Paper	Interactive Discussion			

Table 3. Sensitivity experiments to PDD parameters.

Forcings	Insolation CO ₂ Sea level	Laskar et al. (2004) Petit et al. (1999) Waelbroeck et al. (2002)	
Initial conditions	126 kyr climate Present-day Greenland topography		
Standard deviation σ	DDF Cice, C_{snow}	Refreezing scheme	Run ID
FST09	RH91	RH91	13
FST09	TP02	TP02	14
Fixed: 5 °C	FST09	FST09	15
FST09	Fixed: RH91 values	FST09	16
RH91	FST09	FST09	17
FST09	FST09	TP02	18
FST09	FST09	RH91	19

TCD 6, 4897-4938, 2012 Influence of ablation-related processes S. Charbit et al. Title Page Introduction Abstract Conclusions References Tables Figures 14 < Back Close Full Screen / Esc Printer-friendly Version Interactive Discussion $(\mathbf{\hat{H}})$ (cc)

Discussion Paper

Discussion Paper

Discussion Paper

Discussion Paper

Table 4. Sensitivity experiments to ice-sheet topography.

Forcings	Insolation CO ₂ Sea level	Laskar et al. (2004) Petit et al. (1999) Waelbroeck et al. (2002)	
Initial conditions	126 kyr climate Present-day Greenland topography		
Climatic and topography initial conditions	PDD models	Run duration (×1000 yr)	Run ID
Given by Run ID 3 at 115 ka (standard FST09)	RH91	115	20 (RH91-115FS)
Given by Run ID 3 at 115 ka (standard FST09)	TP02	115	21 (TP02-115FS)
Given by Run ID 2 at 115 ka (standard TP02)	FST09	115	22 (FST09-115TP)
Given by Run ID 3 at 60 ka (standard FST09)	RH91	60	23 (RH91-60FS)
Given by Run ID 3 at 60 ka (standard FST09)	TP02	60	24 (TP02-60FS)
Given by Run ID 2 at 115 ka (standard TP02)	FST09	60	25 (FST09-60FS)
Given by Run ID 3 at 60 ka (standard FST09)	RH91	30	26 (RH91-30FS)
Given by Run ID 3 at 60 ka (standard FST09)	TP02	30	27 (TP02-30FS)
Given by Run ID 2 at 60 ka (standard TP02)	FST09	30	28 (FST09-30FS)



Discussion Paper

Discussion Paper

Discussion Paper

Discussion Paper



Fig. 1. Simulated ice thickness at 116 ka (left panels) and 21 ka (right panels) produced by the three standard fully coupled experiments with the RH91 (run 1, top panels), TP02 (run 2, middle) and FST09 (run 3, bottom) PDD models. Thick white lines in the right panels represent the contour of the ICE-5G LGM ice sheets (Peltier, 2004).







Fig. 2. Evolution of the simulated ice volumes (thick solid lines) and ice-covered areas (thin solid lines) in the GRISLI equilibrium experiments from 0 to 50 kyr (left panels) and during the first thousand model years (right panels). GRISLI is forced by CLIMBER snapshots for 120, 112 and 21 ka (see Table 2 and text for a comprehensive description of the experiments). Numbers in parenthesis refer to the run identifiers (runs 4 to 12).



Fig. 3. Amounts of net ablation (blue) and refrozen ice (green) given in myr⁻¹ after 1000 model years for 120 (top), 112 (middle) and 21 ka (bottom) simulated in runs 4 to 12.



Interactive Discussion



Fig. 4. Simulated ice thickness at 21 ka obtained when substituting the FST09 σ parameter in RH91 (top, run 13) and TP02 (middle, run 14) models, and when using a fixed (= 5.2 $^{\circ}$ C) σ value in the FST09 model (bottom, run 15).





Fig. 5. Simulated ice thickness difference when substituting the TP02 refreezing scheme in the FST09 model (FST09–FST09 with TP02 refreezing, top panels, run 18), and when allowing in the FST09 model a fixed portion (i.e. Pmax = 60%) of meltwater to produce superimposed ice (FST09–FST09 with RH91 refreezing, bottom panel, run 19). Left panels refer to the 115 ka period and right panels refer to the LGM (i.e. 21 ka). The thin red lines represent the contours of the continents.





Fig. 6. Ice volumes simulated in runs 20 to 28 to test the impact of the ice-sheet feedbacks. Different initial conditions are considered: at 115 ka (left panels) and 60 and 30 ka (right panels). Simulated ice volumes in runs 20 to 28 are compared to the ice volumes simulated in the standard experiments (runs 1 to 3).

