

Interactive comment on “Brief Communication: Greenland’s shrinking ice cover: “fast times” but not that fast” by J. S. Kargel et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 3 February 2012

I found this a slightly strange paper, given the context in which it was written (explanation of which occupies the first 2 sections of the paper). The only new contribution here is the new outline of Greenland ice cover, but it seems that this is to be presented properly in a separate publication that is not yet submitted. I found some value in the summary of area change measurements presented in sections 4 and 5, because it puts all this information in one place - but I found that the continuing reference to the egregious error of the Times Atlas distracted the authors from creating a clear picture of what patterns of area change are actually occurring. The first 2 sections seem a bit indulgent/preachy to me - they read more like journalism than science (I understand that this is just a gut reaction - but gut reactions play an important part in determining how effectively messages get conveyed). The necessary introduction and rationale for the paper could be provided in 2 or 3 sentences, with a note that the motivation for the

C1895

paper is to provide a response to the incorrect map of ice extent in Greenland included in the latest edition of the Times Atlas and to demonstrate that, although ice loss is occurring throughout Greenland, the rates are much less than the Times Atlas map would imply and that there is still extensive ice in the area of east Greenland mapped as ice-free by the Times Atlas. In some ways, I think this important message gets lost in the mass of detail provided in sections 4 and 5. Overall, I think the paper could be improved significantly if it were reduced in length and made more focused on clearly conveying its core message. I hope these comments are helpful.

Interactive comment on The Cryosphere Discuss., 5, 3207, 2011.