

Interactive comment on “Lessons from the short history of ice sheet model intercomparison” by E. Bueler

Anonymous Referee #4

Received and published: 23 July 2008

General comments

This short communication is a personal reflection of the author on the various model intercomparison initiatives in ice-sheet modeling as they were organised since the early 90s. The text contains a number of useful thoughts for those involved in the intercomparison initiatives that should be well taken by intercomparison organizers and participants. The author also uses the opportunity to air some criticism and frustration on the more recent ISMIP initiatives, especially concerning ISMIP-HOM. Above all, the paper can be understood as a solicitation to more closely involve mathematicians like himself in the setup of future intercomparison descriptions, which sounds fair enough. By itself the text does not express particularly novel concepts or ideas. However, as The Cryosphere is currently publishing several papers on ice-sheet model intercom-

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



parison results, a personal mathematician's view on the process listing up many of its facets should be insightful reading.

Specific comments

I found some strange wording as well as language that should not occur in a scientific text:

p. 400, line 10: not sure what 'cultural purposes' are supposed to mean in the context of intercomparison projects.

p. 403, lines 14 to 16: the meaning of this sentence is unclear to me.

p. 404, line 25: Rephrase the sentence 'Of course there are mathematicians and mathematicians'. That is speaking language that does not convey a business-like message.

p. 408, line 7: Remove 'though so far no blood to my knowledge'. This is about ice-sheet modeling in a friendly science community, not about the Balkan wars.

Technical comments

p. 402, line 8: 'further' should be 'further'.

Interactive comment on The Cryosphere Discuss., 2, 399, 2008.

TCD

2, S216–S217, 2008

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

