

Interactive comment on “Direct evidence for radar reflector originating from changes in crystal-orientation fabric” by O. Eisen et al.

R. Jacobel (Referee)

jacobel@stolaf.edu

Received and published: 25 July 2007

Just a brief comment after reading Dr. Eisen’s response to both my review and the one from Dr. Matsuoka and the additional figure and text he has submitted, (SC-S76). I am happy with the responses to my comments and leave it to Dr. Eisen to weave the essence of them into his revisions while keeping the manuscript from growing too cumbersome.

Since I have the opportunity to make other remarks in this format, I would add that while I too appreciate the very careful and thorough comments from Dr. Matsuoka, I think the more technical points about polarization and birefringence he raises tend toward pushing the paper beyond what can reasonably be said from the data at hand, and I agree with Dr. Eisen’s comments in his response that he wants to keep the scientific

discussion within the original scope of the paper.

I think it is particularly important in this early stage of the journal's life that the editors accept papers for publication that are exemplary and of the highest scientific quality, but also accessible to a wide audience and not focused unduly on highly technical issues appreciated by only a few.

It has been an interesting and worthwhile experience being a part of this (new to me) review process.

R. Jacobel

Interactive comment on The Cryosphere Discuss., 1, 1, 2007.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper